



TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL

Historic District Commission

Meeting Minutes

Town Hall
405 Martin Luther King Jr.
Boulevard
Chapel Hill, NC 27514

Chair Sean Murphy
Vice-Chair Duncan Lascelles
Deputy Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde
Brian Daniels

Josh Gurlitz
Nancy McCormick
Anne Perl De Pal
David Schwartz

Tuesday, October 11, 2022

6:30 PM

RM 110 | Council Chamber

Language Access Statement

For interpretation or translation services, call 919-969-5105.

ဘာသာပြန်ဆိုခြင်းနှင့် စကားပြန်ခြင်းအတွက်၊ (၉၁၉) ၉၆၉-၅၁၀၅ ကိုဖုန်းခေါ်ပါ။

Para servicios de interpretación o traducción, llame al 919-969-5105.

လၢတၢ်ကတိကျိးထံ မ့တမၢ် လၢတၢ်ကွဲးကျိးထံအတၢ်မၤစၢ်အဂီၢ် ၂ ကိးဘၣ် (၉၁၉)-၉၆၉-၅၁၀၅

如需口头或
书面翻译服
务，请拨打
919-969-5105.

Opening

Anya Grahn, Liaison to Commission, Charnika Harrell, Liaison to Commission,
Kevin Hornik, Counsel to Commission

Roll Call

Present	5 - Chair Sean Murphy, Deputy Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Josh Gurlitz, Nancy McCormick, and Anne Perl De Pal
Excused	3 - Vice-Chair Duncan Lascelles, Brian Daniels , and David Schwartz

Secretary reads procedures into the record

Commission Chair reads public charge

Approval of Agenda

A motion was made by Commissioner Van de Velde, seconded by Gurlitz, to approve the agenda. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 5 - Chair Sean Murphy, Deputy Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Josh Gurlitz, Nancy McCormick, and Anne Perl De Pal

Excused: 3 - Vice-Chair Duncan Lascelles, Brian Daniels , and David Schwartz

Announcements

Grahn reminded commissioners to notify staff if they will be absent, and that she will be absent from the November meeting. Chair Murphy also announced that he would be absent.

There was discussion about whether or not the Commission would meet on November 8 as it is Election Day; staff committed to looking into whether or not the Town has a policy precluding the Commission from meeting.

Petitions

Approval of Minutes

1. September 13, 2022 Action Minutes

[\[22-0705\]](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Gurlitz, seconded by Van de Velde, to approve the September 13, 2022 meeting minutes. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 5 - Chair Sean Murphy, Deputy Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Josh Gurlitz, Nancy McCormick, and Anne Perl De Pal

Excused: 3 - Vice-Chair Duncan Lascelles, Brian Daniels , and David Schwartz

Information

2. Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness
Approvals and Maintenance Memos

[\[22-0706\]](#)

Commissioner Perl de Pal expressed concern about staff-level approvals and scope creep. She was also concerned about applicants presenting materials during the meeting that were not included in their packets.

Grahn explained that applicant presentations from the meeting are uploaded to the Town's website after the meeting and are publicly available. Hornik added that administrative Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) are public records, and anyone can request a copy.

Chair Murphy was concerned about multiple staff-approved modifications for projects with a COA. He asked if there was a limit to the number of staff-level approvals a project can obtain before it would need a subsequent review by

the Commission. Hornik explained that there was no limit on staff-level approvals, and that they would be held to the congruity standard.

The Commission decided staff-level approvals will be reviewed at a later meeting.

Consent

3. 234 McCauley Street

[\[22-0707\]](#)

The commission removed this item from the consent agenda.

Hornik explained to those present at the meeting that a unanimous vote was needed to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness due to commissioner attendance. He offered the applicants a chance to request to defer their application to the next meeting. The applicants chose to move forward.

New Business

234 McCauley Street

[\[22-0707\]](#)

Grahn explained that the application was to replace the existing asphalt shingles on the low-slope areas of the roof with standing seam metal roofing.

Ashlee Hicks, the applicant, explained that water leaks through the low-sloped roof areas during storms, causing damage to the exterior and interior of the home. She said the leaks have not improved despite their efforts to repair the low-sloped areas.

She presented photos of the existing roof. She explained the color of the metal roof was chosen to match the existing asphalt shingles. She also presented photos of nearby houses with metal roofs on low-sloped areas.

Commissioner Perl de Pal asked why she was not replacing the entire roof. Hicks explained that it would be expensive to do the entire roof with metal, and that what she proposed matched other houses on her street.

Perl de Pal thought there was a significant difference in the style of roof on the Hick's house compared to the photos of neighboring houses included in the presentation. Perl de Pal thought the use of a single material contributed to the continuous flow of the roof, consistent with the Craftsman Cottage look of the house. Hicks said she was open to replacing the whole roof, if needed.

Commissioner McCormick asked if the other houses with metal roofs on

low-sloped areas in the district shown in the photographs were approved by the Commission. Hicks did not know. Staff could not confirm without further investigation.

Perl de Pal asked if the roof would be insulated as depicted in the application materials. Hicks said she was not aware of any plans to insulate unless it was standard for roof replacement. Perl de Pal asked if the rear roofs were over uninhabited space. Hicks confirmed the rear roofs covered habitable spaces.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Gurlitz said the Commission had approved roofs with multiple materials and referred to roof improvements at 203 Battle Lane. He explained that asphalt shingles rise with the wind and allow water infiltration in low-sloped areas. He acknowledged Perl de Pal's concern about a continuous roof with like materials on Craftsman-style houses but understood the need for a metal roof in this instance.

Commissioner Van de Velde concurred with Gurlitz. She said that Hicks was experiencing a persistent problem that affected the entire house. She conceded that the low-sloped areas of the roof could be metal, if it preserved the integrity of the building.

Commissioner Perl de Pal agreed with the need for a metal roof but thought the roof on the front façade of the house should be of the same materials.

Chair Murphy said the roof wraps from the front of the house to the rear. He mentioned the Commission previously denied a Certificate of Appropriateness for a metal roof that was installed on the entire roof of the house. He said it was rare for the entire roof to be metal, but metal roofing on low-sloped areas was more typical in the district. He thought the proposal was consistent with previous approvals and the Design Standards.

A motion was made by Commissioner Van de Velde, seconded by Gurlitz, that the application was not incongruous with the special character of the district and to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA).

Commissioner Perl de Pal asked if all the commissioners had to vote yes to grant the COA. Hornik confirmed. Perl de Pal said commissioners needed to be present so she could have the option to vote no on principal but be

overruled by other commissioners. Hornik reminded commissioners that their votes need to be based on the materials presented during the hearing.

The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 5 - Chair Sean Murphy, Deputy Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Josh Gurlitz, Nancy McCormick, and Anne Perl De Pal

Excused: 3 - Vice-Chair Duncan Lascelles, Brian Daniels, and David Schwartz

4. 222 Vance Street

[\[22-0708\]](#)

Maxine Eichner, the applicant, described the proposed exterior improvements. She presented a photo of the existing screened porch and explained that a door and steps will be added for access to and from the patio. She said an outdoor kitchen counter would be installed along the back of the stairs and presented a rendering of the design. She said a 6-foot-tall wood fence would be installed along the rear property line. She explained that the fence would be in front of an existing fence to screen the yard from view by the adjacent apartment building and its parking lot. She presented photos of the existing fence and a site plan that identified the location of the proposed fence. She said an arbor would be installed along the path to the backyard and provided renderings.

Commissioner Perl de Pal asked for the height of the proposed fence. Eichner restated that it would be 6-feet-tall.

Commissioner McCormick asked if Eichner considered planting a hedge to screen the yard. Eichner explained that she tried growing various shrubs, but the yard is shielded by a large tree which made it difficult for the plants to grow.

Perl de Pal asked if the rear windows and doors were vinyl. Eichner explained that the other door was vinyl, and she would use a material other than vinyl.

Chair Murphy asked if the existing fence was on her property. Eichner confirmed it was not. Eichner said the existing fence was over 5-feet-tall. She said the yard slopes in the back, and the fence measure 4-feet-tall at the property line.

Perl de Pal asked how many neighbors had fences in the rear yard, and

Eichner was unsure. Perl de Pal asked if there were photos of the house from the street. Eicher said the fence would not be visible from the street.

Commissioner Van de Velde asked if the outdoor kitchen would be visible from the street. Eichner confirmed it would not be.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Perl de Pal remarked that it was interesting the house was listed as a non-contributing structure in the Cameron-McCauley Historic District.

A motion was made by Commissioner Perl de Pal, seconded by Van de Velde, that the application was not incongruous with the special character of the district and to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) with the condition that the proposed fence be 6-feet in height and the proposed screened porch door be a conforming material to the house that is congruous with the special character of the district. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 5 - Chair Sean Murphy, Deputy Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Josh Gurlitz, Nancy McCormick, and Anne Perl De Pal

Excused: 3 - Vice-Chair Duncan Lascelles, Brian Daniels , and David Schwartz

Election of Commission Officers

Election of Chair

Election of Vice Chair

Election of Deputy Vice Chair

A motion was made by Commissioner Gurlitz, seconded by McCormick, to reelect Sean Murphy as Chair, Duncan Lascelles as Vice-Chair, and Polly Van de Velde as Deputy Vice-Chair. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 5 - Chair Sean Murphy, Deputy Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Josh Gurlitz, Nancy McCormick, and Anne Perl De Pal

Excused: 3 - Vice-Chair Duncan Lascelles, Brian Daniels , and David Schwartz

Adjournment

Next Meeting - November 8, 2022*Order of Consideration of Agenda Items:*

- 1. Staff Presentation*
- 2. Applicant's Presentation*
- 3. Public Comment*
- 4. Board Discussion*
- 5. Motion*
- 6. Restatement of Motion by Chair*
- 7. Vote*
- 8. Announcement of Vote by Chair*

Public Charge: The Advisory Body pledges its respect to the public. The Body asks the public to conduct themselves in a respectful, courteous manner, both with the Body and with fellow members of the public. Should any member of the Body or any member of the public fail to observe this charge at any time, the Chair will ask the offending person to leave the meeting until that individual regains personal control. Should decorum fail to be restored, the Chair will recess the meeting until a genuine commitment to this public charge is observed.

Unless otherwise noted, please contact the Planning Department at 919-968-2728; planning@townofchapelhill.org for more information on the above referenced applications.

See the Advisory Boards page <http://www.townofchapelhill.org/boards> for background information on this Board.