



Historic District Commission

Regular Agenda – Certificate of Appropriateness 104 N Boundary Street (Project #21-043)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT
Anya Grahm, Senior Planner
Judy Johnson, Assistant Planning Director
Colleen Willger, Planning Director

Applicant	Filing Date	Meeting Date(s)	Historic District
Derek and Louise Winstanly	6/14/2021	7/13/2021, 7/20/2021	Franklin-Rosemary

Project Description

The applicant proposes to construct a second-floor addition on the east (rear) elevation of the house; replace two windows on the north (side) elevation, two doors on the east (rear) elevation, and one door on the facade; and construct a new ADA ramp accessing the basement level door.

Proposed Findings of Fact

1. The two-story side-gable brick Colonial Revival house was constructed c.1927 and is part of the Franklin-Rosemary National Register Historic District.
2. The applicant proposes to construct a second level addition on the east (rear) elevation of the house. The new addition will be built atop an existing one-story portion of the house. The addition will feature painted wood lap siding matching that of the garage. New windows and doors on the addition will match the design, material, and size of those found on the existing house.
3. On the southeast corner of the house, a new two-story covered porch addition will be constructed.
4. On the north (side) elevation, the applicant proposes to replace two windows. The new windows will be taller than the existing windows and the new windows, shutters, and sill will match the materials and design of existing windows.
5. On the east (rear) elevation, the applicant will replace existing openings with new doors to access a new covered porch. The new doors will match the design and material of existing features.
6. The rear stairs will also be extended to the east and reconstructed with new railings and a painted lattice skirt.
7. A new brick retaining wall and planter will be constructed on the east (rear) elevation.
8. The applicant finds that the door, transom, and sidelights on the façade (west) on the sunroom are not original to the building. The applicant proposes to replace this door unit with a new one.
9. A new ADA ramp will be constructed on the northeast corner of the house to access the basement entrance on the east (rear) elevation. The ramp will be located behind a low brick retaining wall to minimize its visibility.
10. As part of the renovation, the applicant will assess all exterior railings and replace damaged materials in-kind.

Applicable Design Standards

3.3 Exterior Walls, Trim, & Ornamentation (pages 87-88):

3.3.7. Locate new exterior wall features, such as windows, doors, chimneys, bays, and communication or mechanical equipment, on exterior walls that are not visible from the street or in locations that do not compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.4 Windows & Shutters (pages 90-91):

3.4.6. If new window openings are necessary, when possible, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage

character-defining features or materials, or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.5 Exterior Doors (pages 94-95):

3.5.4. Replace in kind exterior doors and entrance features that are too deteriorated to repair, taking care to replace only the deteriorated portion rather than the entire door or feature. Replacement doors and features should match the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, and texture.

3.5.5. If deterioration necessitates the replacement of an entire door or entrance feature, the replacement door or feature should match the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material (including aluminum-clad wood or fiberglass) only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.

3.5.7. If new doors are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials, or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.6 Porches, Entrances, & Balconies (pages 98-99):

3.6.3. Repair deteriorated or damaged porches, entrances, and balconies through accepted preservation methods of patching, splicing, consolidating, and reinforcing. Repairs may include selective in-kind replacement of missing or deteriorated portions of a feature, such as column base or capital

3.6.4. Replace in kind any feature or surface, or portion thereof, of a porch, entrance, or balcony that is too deteriorated to repair, taking care to replace only the deteriorated portion rather than the entire feature. Replacement features and surfaces should match the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, pattern, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material for wood (including fiber cement board, cellular PVC, or plastic composite trim or siding) only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible or there is an ongoing water infiltration problem, and the wood to be replaced is a painted wood to which the substitute material can be matched. Vinyl is not an appropriate substitute material.

3.6.6. If new porches or entrances are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.6.8. Do not remove, screen, or enclose a porch, entrance, or balcony on a primary, street-facing elevation.

- a. Consider screening a porch or balcony on a side or rear elevation only if the design will preserve the historic character of the porch or balcony.
- b. Consider enclosing a porch or balcony on rear elevation only if the design will preserve the historic character of the porch or balcony.

3.8 Accessibility & Life Safety Considerations (page 104):

3.8.1. In reviewing proposed changes to a historic property, carefully consider related accessibility and life safety code implications to determine if the proposed change is compatible with the historic district, building, and site.

3.8.2. Meet accessibility and life safety code requirements in ways that do not compromise the historic character or significant features of the historic district or building site.

3.8.3. Meet accessibility and life safety code requirements in ways that do not compromise the historic character or significant architectural features of the building.

3.8.4. Introduce new or alternate means of access and new life safety features, as needed, in ways that are reversible and do not compromise the historic materials, features, or character of the building.

3.8.5. Locate new or alternative means of access-such as ramps, handrails, and mechanical lifts-on side or rear elevations where they are minimally visible from the street. Design accessibility features so they are compatible with the historic building in design, scale, materials, and finish. Consider using vegetation to screen the features and minimize their visual impact.

3.8.6. Locate life safety features—including but not limited to fire doors, elevator additions, and fire stairs—on side or rear elevations where they are minimally visible from the street. Design life safety features to be compatible with the historic building in scale, proportion, materials, and finish. Consider using vegetation to screen the features and minimize their visual impact.

4.8 Additions (page 134-136):

4.8.1. Introduce compatible new additions, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district.

4.8.2. Site additions in locations that are compatible with the character of the building and site and are minimally visible from the street, typically on rear elevations. Additions may be located on side elevations only when rear setbacks do not allow for enough space and if additions have been carefully designed to retain the spacing of buildings in the district and to minimize their impact on the rhythm of the streetscape or character defining open spaces. Additions are never permitted on front facades.

4.8.3. Site additions to be consistent with additions in the immediate surroundings and to retain the orientation of the existing building as well as the spacing between and distance from other buildings in the immediate surroundings when the siting and spacing are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Maintain the original orientation of the structure with primary entrances on the front façade of the building.

4.8.4. Design and site additions so they do not compromise the overall historic character of the site, including its topography, significant site features, and distinctive views. Do not introduce an addition if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, such as a porch, or if it necessitates the relocation or demolition of historic garages or accessory buildings.

4.8.5. Design and locate additions so that, as much as possible, historic features and details—including windows, doors, chimneys, bays, corner boards, wood shingles, brackets and decorative trim—are not removed or concealed.

4.8.6. Design additions so that their size, scale, and form are compatible with the existing building and do not visually overpower the building on this or adjacent sites.

4.8.7. Design additions to be compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building in their location, size, scale, and building and roof form.

- a. Limit the size and scale of additions to minimize their visual impact and maintain private open spaces on the site.
- b. Match the foundation height, style, and materials of an addition to the existing building.
- c. Differentiate the addition from the wall plane of the existing building and preserve existing cornerboards and trim by stepping back the wall plane of the addition and/or utilizing a hyphen or other small-scale transitional element to connect the addition to the existing building.
- d. Where additions compete in size with the original building, include a hyphen or small-scale connecting wing or to separate the historic building from its new addition.
- e. Utilize similar roof forms and pitches for building additions and, when possible, align the height of the eave line of a new addition with the eave line of the existing building.
- f. Maintain the roof pitch and ridgeline of the existing building. Do not alter or raise the roof ridge of existing buildings in order to accommodate additions. Roof ridges for additions should be secondary to (lower than) those of the main structure.

4.8.8. Design additions using contemporary architecture provided they adhere to the characteristics of the historic district including: materials, siting and setbacks, scale, height, form, proportion, and details.

4.8.9. Minimize damage to the historic building by constructing additions to be structurally self-supporting, where feasible, and attach them to the original building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric. Attach additions in such a manner that, if additions were removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic building would be unimpaired.

4.8.10. Design additions and their features with materials that are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building and historic buildings within the immediate

surroundings when the features and materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

- a. Select exterior materials and finishes that are compatible with the original building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color.
- b. Use traditional materials in conventional ways so that additions are in harmony with the buildings in the historic district (i.e. wood siding applied horizontally).
- c. Smooth-faced cementitious or composite siding that matches the traditional dimension of wood siding is permitted for additions.
- d. Do not use synthetic (vinyl, aluminum, PVC, plastic, resin) siding and details on additions within the historic districts unless it can be demonstrated that the material and finishes are compatible with the original building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color.

4.8.11. Design additions and their features with architectural details that are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building and historic buildings within the immediate surroundings when the features and materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district .

- a. Incorporate materials and details derived from the primary structure.
- b. Extend the hierarchy of architectural details to the addition with embellishments and detailing simplified on less visible side and rear elevations.

4.8.12. Design additions so that the location, shape, scale, size, materials, pattern, and proportion of windows and doors are compatible with the windows and doors of the existing building and with historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when these elements of doors and windows are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Doors and windows should follow the standards for New Construction: Doors and Windows.

4.8.13. Design porches so that the location, shape, scale, size, materials, and details are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, porches on the existing building. Porches should follow the standards for New Construction: Porches.

4.8.14. Maintain and protect significant site features from damage during or as a consequence of related site work or construction.

Condition of Approval

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire, and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission **approves/denies** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it **would/would not be incongruous** with the special character of the district.