

Chapel Hill Historic District	Project:	21-038
Certificate of Appropriateness Application		
Project Description: Custom steel fence in front yard, to contain a new dog while maintaining the "visually-open feel characteristic of the district streetscapes" per the Guidelines. The fence is modeled after one in the Cameron-McCauley Historic District (438)	Permit:	
W Cameron St).		STAFF REVIEW
	X Applica	tion complete and accepted
		tion not complete and ith a notation of deficiencies
	BY:	nya Grahn, 5/25/2021
	DATE:	
Instructions: Submit one paper copy and a digital copy of all application materials coll	ated in one f	ile (ndf nreferred)
Deadlines: Applications are due by the close of business 30 calendar days prior to the		_
Note: Only complete applications may be accepted for Certificate of Appropriateness complete will be returned with a notation of deficiencies.	review. Appl	ications that are not

A: Property Informat	ion					
Property Address:	6 Cobb Terra	ce		P	Parcel ID	Number: 9788388616
Property Owner(s):	Melissa Mo	Cullough		E	mail:	melissamccnc@gmail.com
Property Owner Addres	s: 6 Cobb Terra	ce				
City: Chapel Hill	State:	NC	Zip:	27514	Phon	e: 919-357-0333
Historic District : □Can	neron-McCaule	/ 🗵 Frank	lin-Rosemar	y 🗌 Gimgho	ul	Zoning District: R-3

B: Applicant Information				
Applicant: same			Role (owner, architect, other):	owner
Address (if different from above):			_	
City:	State:	Zip:		



Town of Chapel Hill Planning Department

919-969-5040 planning@townofchapelhill.org

Email:	Phone:

C. Application Type (check all boxes that apply)	
could impair the integrity of the property and/or the	y substantial alterations, and do not involve additions or removals that district as a whole. See <u>Design Guidelines</u> (p. 69) for a list of minor works.
Site-work only (walkways, fencing, walls, etc.)	\square After-the-fact application (for unauthorized work already performed).
☐ Restoration or alteration	☐Demolition or moving of a site feature.
☐ New construction or additions	☐ Request for review of new application after previous denial
□Sign	

D. Basic information about size, scale, and lot placement.

Provide measurements in feet and square feet where applicable. Where possible, please provide accurate measurements from a licensed surveyor, architect, engineer, etc. If exact measurements are not available, please provide estimated information. Current estimated information about lots and buildings can be found on the Ocupy Real Estate Data website. Information about lot placement can be found on the Chapel Hill and Ocunty Interactive GIS portals.

Zoning District:	Minimum setbacks		Maximum heights			Lot size	
	Street	Interior	Solar	Primary	Secondary		
Required by zoning							
Proposed							
	Existing	Change +/-	Total	Total Flo	or Area Ratio		
Floor Area (main structure)				Existing	Proposed	ISA/I	NLA ratio
Floor Area (all other)						Existing	Proposed
Impervious Surface Area (ISA)							
New Land Disturbance							



Town of Chapel Hill Planning Department

919-969-5040

planning@townofchapelhill.org

E: Applicable Design Guidelines

The Town's <u>Design Guidelines for the Chapel Hill Historic Districts</u> are integral to the application and review process. These guidelines supplement the required review criteria for Certificate of Appropriateness applications (provided in <u>Section 3.6.2(e)(4)</u> of the Land Use Management Ordinance) by providing detailed, practical considerations for how to make changes to properties while preserving the special character of their Historic District context. Please review the Design Guidelines and consider their applicability to your proposed project. (Attach additional sheets, as necessary.)

Section/Page	Topic	Brief description of the applicable aspect of your proposal
1.3/46. and. 2.3	Walls and Fences and Architectural Metals	Because my house is located inside the loop of Cobb Terrace, I don't have a "back yard" per se, so I need to put the fencing for my puppy in the front. My goal is to minimize the visual impact/intrusion (maximize the transparency) of fencing, per 1.3. I scoured the historic neighborhoods, and the example from Cameron St fits my needs the best and. will have been approved by the Historic Commission. The fence in the front will be mounted into the stone wall, which also echos other metal fences in the District. The black metal will also echo the black metal of my front stairs railing.



F. Checklist of Application Materials					
Attach the required elements in the order indicated.	ATTACHED? TO BE COMPLETED BY APPLICANT		TO BE COMPLETED BY TOWN STAFF		
	YES	N/A	YES	N/A	NO
1. Written description of physical changes proposed. Describe clearly and in detail the physical changes you are proposing to make. Identify the materials to be used (siding, windows, trim, roofing, pavements, decking, fencing, light fixtures, etc.), specify their dimensions, and provide names of manufacturers, model numbers, and specifications where applicable.					
2. History, context, and character information. Please include a summary of what information you have relied on to understand the relevant character and history of the district and subject property—and briefly summarize that information. At a minimum, include:	\boxtimes				
 Current property information for the lot and all structures, including Building Sketches and Building Details, from <u>Orange County Real Estate</u> <u>Data</u>. 					
The entry of your property on the most recent inventory of historic resources in the relevant National Register for Historic Places filing, available via the NC State Historic Preservation Office website: for McCauley-Cameron see West Chapel Hill , for Franklin-Rosemary see Chapel Hill , for Gimghoul see Gimghoul . (If yours is one of the few properties in McCauley-Cameron or Franklin-Rosemary that has not yet been inventoried, please indicate that.)					
 3. Justification of appropriateness. Attach an annotated statement explaining how the proposed change(s) meets the following standards of appropriateness that the Commission considers in making findings of fact indicating the extent to which the application is or is not congruous with the historic aspects of the historic district. If a standard is not applicable, type "not applicable". A. The height of the building in relation to the average height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings. B. The setback and placement on lot of the building in relation to the average setback and placement of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings. C. Exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern. D. Architectural detailing, such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and foundation materials. E. Roof shapes, forms, and materials. F. Proportion, shape, positioning and location, pattern, and size of any elements of fenestration. G. General form and proportions of buildings and structures. H. Appurtenant fixtures and other features such as lighting. I. Structural conditions and soundness. 					



J. Architectural scale.			
4. Photographs of existing conditions are required. Minimum image size 4" x 6" as printed or the digital equivalent. Maximum 2 images per page.	\boxtimes		
5. Site Plan Set showing existing and proposed conditions. (Min. scale: 1 in. = 20 ft.)			
☐ Site plans must show the relationships between, and dimensions of, existing and proposed buildings, additions, sidewalks, walls, fences, driveways, and/or other structures on the property, as well as property lines and applicable zoning setbacks.			
 Include both written and drawn scales and show accurate measurements. You may also use a copy of a survey with surveyor's seal deleted. Revise the copy as needed to show existing conditions and your proposed work. 			
 Indicate the area of all structural footprints (existing and proposed) in square feet; also, indicate lot size in square feet. 			
6. Elevation Drawings showing existing structural facades and proposed changes. Drawings should be submitted as 11" x 17" or 8-1/2" x 11" reductions of full-size drawings. All details should be reasonably legible. Photographs are okay for facades with no changes.	\boxtimes		
☐ Elevation drawings showing all proposed changes above current grade from front, back, and both sides.			
☐ Include scale bar, written scale, and label major dimensions (including width of structures and heights from finished grade to fascia/eaves and heights to top of roofs).			
\square Label materials to be used (roofing, siding, windows, trim, light fixtures, etc.)			
7. Information about context (required for all construction of new structures, proposed impervious surfaces greater than 1500 SF, additions greater than 150 SF, and/or proposed land disturbance greater than 5000 SF.) Detailed information about lots and structures can be found on the Orange County Real Estate Data website; information about lot placement can be found on the Chapel Hill and Orange County GIS portals.			
For each of the nearest adjacent and opposite properties, provide:			
$\ \square$ The height of each building (if an estimate, indicate that).			
 The setbacks and lots placement of each building (an image from the Town GIS database, including scale, is sufficient). 			
\square The size of each lot (net land area in square feet).			
☐ The size of all buildings on the nearest adjacent and opposite properties, including building footprint areas, Floor Areas (in square feet), and Floor Area Ratios. Provide current figures from Orange County Real Estate Data; indicate any corrections for accuracy you believe necessary and your basis for doing so.			
 Demolition/Relocation Information (required only if demolition or relocation of a feature is proposed). 	\boxtimes		



 Provide a written description of architectural features, additions, remodeling, and any alterations to the structure(s). Make note of any outbuildings on the site plan of the property. 			
Provide a history of the structure, giving the construction date and architect or carpenter, briefly noting any significant events, persons and/or families associated with the property. Provide current exterior photographs of the property (4" x 6" as printed or the digital equivalent). If information is unknown, please provide a summary of sources consulted.			
☐ If an argument about structural soundness is being made, attach a signed and sealed report from a professional engineer.			
 As necessary, attach a statement explaining how a delay in demolition would cause the property owner to suffer extreme hardship or be permanently deprived of all beneficial use or return from such property by virtue of the delay. 			
☐ Provide any records about the structure to be demolished.			
9. Mailing notification fee per <u>Planning & Sustainability Fee Schedule</u> . For a list of addresses, please refer to the Town's <u>Development Notification Tool</u> .			
10. Certificate of Appropriateness fee per <u>Planning & Sustainability Fee Schedule</u>			



Town of Chapel Hill Planning Department 919-969-5040

planning@townofchapelhill.org

G: Applicant signature

I hereby certify that I am authorized to submit this application; that all information is correct to the best of my knowledge, and all work will comply with the State Building Code and all other applicable State and local laws, ordinances, and regulations.

I acknowledge and agree that the Historic District Commission members, Town employees, and Town agents may enter, solely in performance of their official duties and only at reasonable times, upon the applicant's property for examination or survey thereof pursuant to North Carolina General Statute 160A-400.8. However, no member, employee, or agent of the Historic District Commission may enter any private building or structure without the express consent of the owner or occupant thereof.

I understand and agree that an approved Certificate of Appropriateness is valid only for the particular application, plans, specifications and related project details presented to, and approved by, the Historic District Commission. If any of the data contained in this application, any plans or any specifications presented to the Commission are changed or altered for any reason, including, but not limited to, changes or alternations deemed practically necessary during construction, required due to subsequent Town reviews, or otherwise, a new hearing before the Historic District may be required. By signing below, the applicant agrees to notify the Development Services Center of any changes or alternations in the data contained in this application, the approved plans or the approved specifications related to the project that is the subject of this application.

Hearings on Certificate of Appropriateness applications before the Commission are quasi-judicial proceedings. Therefore, Historic District Commission members are not permitted to discuss a pending application with the applicant or other party. By signing below, the applicant agrees to refrain from speaking with or contacting any member of the Historic District Commission about an application outside of the formal evidentiary hearing on the application.

Applicant (printed name)	Signature	Date	
Property Owner	Signature	Date	
(if different from above)			

Town of Chapel Hill Planning Department 919-969-5040

planning@townofchapelhill.org

Certificate of Appropriateness Supplemental Requirements

*In addition to Residential Zoning OR Administrative Zoning Compliance Permit Requirements

Certificate of Appropriateness applications are subject to review and approval by the Historic District Commission as well as by Town staff. For assistance with this application, please contact the Chapel Hill Planning Department.

Please submit *all* **materials listed** <u>on this sheet</u>. The Historic District Commission meets on the second Tuesday of each month at 6:30 pm. For confirmation of a meeting date and the placement of your request on the agenda, please call the Planning Department. **Applications are due one month in advance of meeting.**

Application Process:

- 1. Historic District Commission Review of Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Supplemental materials
- 2. Staff review of Residential / Administrative Zoning Compliance Permit (ZCP) materials

**COA (step 1) and ZCP (step 2) materials may be submitted simultaneously or separately.

Required Application Materials

(In addition to Residential Zoning Compliance Permit or Administrative Zoning Compliance Permit Requirements)

An Electronic copy of each document is required in addition to paper copies.

Provide a single set of the following materials:

1. Application Form. Either <u>Residential</u> Zoning Compliance or <u>Administrative</u> Zoning Compliance.
2. Recorded plat or deed verifying property's current ownership
3. Recorded plat of easements, right-of-way, and dedications, if applicable
4. Mailing List of Property Owners, applicable within 100 feet of property boundaries
The Town will prepare a formal notice to be mailed to surrounding property owners about the
application. You may find it helpful to discuss the proposed changes with your neighbors in person so
you can address their concerns both in your planning and presentation.
5. Mailing notification fee. The fee per address can be found on the <u>Planning Department's Fee Schedule</u> .
6. Certificate of Appropriateness fee per <u>Planning Department's Fee Schedule</u>
7. Reduced Site Plan Set (reduced to 8.5" x 11")
8. Building Elevations (label building height from top of roof to finished grade line)
9. Floor Plan, only if accessory apartment, duplex, or commercial application.

(Continued)



Town of Chapel Hill Planning Department

919-969-5040

planning@townofchapelhill.org

10. Written Description

Describe all proposed changes to the property, list all materials to be used, and address the criteria (listed below) that the Commission uses to determine appropriateness. Presenting your proposal with these criteria in mind will provide a clear basis for the Commission's deliberations.

- The height of the building in relation to the average height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings;
- b) The setback and placement of the building on the lot in relation to the average setback and placement of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings;
- c) The exterior construction materials, including textures and patterns;
- d) The architectural detailing such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and foundation materials;
- e) The roof shape, form, and materials;
- f) The proportion, shape, location, pattern, and size of any elements of fenestration (windows, doors);
- g) The general form and proportion of the buildings;
- h) The accessory fixture and other features (including lighting fixtures, hardware, awnings, etc.);
- i) The architectural scale in relation to existing structures and surrounding buildings; and
- j) Structural conditions and soundness.

Provide photographs of existing property and elevation drawings of the proposed changes. Depict changes in as much detail as possible, paying special attention to those features which the Commission uses to determine appropriateness. This section of the application allows the Commission to see the current state of the property, to visualize the proposed changes, and to assess the impact. The visual description must include dimensions. For new buildings and major additions, the visual description must include the interior floor plan.

11. Information Regarding Surrounding Properties

For new construction or large projects, the applicant is required to provide information on:

- The height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings;
- The setback and placement of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings;
- The scale of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings, including percentage of lot coverage.

12. **Demolition Information (if applicable)**

Provide a description of architectural features, additions, remodeling, and any alterations to the structure(s). Make note of any outbuildings on the site plan of the property. Provide a history of the structure, giving the construction date and architect or carpenter, briefly noting any significant events, persons, and/or families associate with the property.

1. Description of Physical changes proposed: I plan to fence in my front yard to contain my new dog. This fence will be made of architectural metal, by a local artist, to duplicate the design he used for a house on Cameron Ave, in the Cameron-McCauley Historic District. It will be black, to match my porch railings. The posts will be topped by decorative finials in an arts-and-crafts style. (see photograph below of the fence on Cameron). The front section will be installed into my stone wall, as many wrought iron fences are in my historic district. Here is a photo of a section of the fence on Cameron. Much of it has plants growing into it now, which is part of the appeal.



- 2. I live in the Bahansen-Herzenberg house.
 - a. Here is my home's historic designation information:
 https://www.preservationchapelhill.org/plaque-program?pgid=kjblz2q0-61b2c659-032a-41e0-88bf-2993fc78076a
 I have also studied fencing around my neighborhood and the three historic districts, drawing on aspects I have seen around these districts and emphasizing the arts-and-crafts element of the house style with a custom architectural metal fence.
 - b. (I was unable to reach the Orange County Real Estate Data page, but it is likely NA.)
- 3. Appropriateness:

a. Height of building: NA

b. Setback on lot: NA

c. Exterior construction materials: NA

d. Architectural detailing: The architectural metal posts will be topped with artsand-crafts style finials and black metal fencing is seen throughout the Historic Districts. In addition, this fence is copied after one in the Cameron-McCauley District.

e. Roof: NA

f. Fenestration: NAg. Form of buildings: NAh. Appurtenant fixtures: NA

- i. Structural conditions: This fence will be set into cement-like foundation and be sound for containing a dog and serving a trellis-like function for plantings.
- j. Architectural scale: the fence will be no higher than needed to contain a 35 lb dog, the post finials are almost to eye levels and the sections swoop down. From there. I picked this fence design, specifically because it will not "interrupt the visual continuity of the streetscape" as the guidance prioritizes.

4. My House now:



5. Site plan:

- a. The marked up aerial photo below shows the site plan. I do not include measurements; because this isn't a building, I have no surveys and site plans, per se, as a building project would require.
- b. Yellow line shows where fence will go; dotted yellow line shows my neighbor's fence, which I will use as a 4th side. More sensitive plantings on the east side of

the house, and the historic pathway that is along the eastern side of my lot (the orange line) will be protected from the dog.

Cobb Terrace

Cobb Terrace

Gobb Terrace

Chapel Hill, NC 27514

6. Elevation drawings: NA

7. Context: NA

8. Demo/Relocation: NA

9.

10. COA fee: \$400

NPS FORM 10-900-A OMB Approval No. 1024-0018

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number	7	Page —	85	Chapel Hill Historic District Boundary Increase and Additional Documentation
				Orange County, North Carolina

level of that wing. A shed-roofed screened porch is located at the left rear (northeast). County tax records date the building to 1927, though the building appears on the 1925 Sanborn map.

6 Cobb – Bahnsen-Herzenberg House – 1915, c. 2014

C - Building

Built concurrent with the neighboring house at 8 Cobb Terrace and initially identical in form, this two-story, hip-roofed house has been recently renovated. The Craftsman-style house is three bays wide and triple pile with a projecting, second-floor, hip-roofed wing centered on the façade. The building has plain weatherboards, replacement three-over-one Craftsman-style wood-sash windows, and an exterior brick chimney on the right (south) elevation. The one-light-over-one-panel door centered on the façade is sheltered by a full-width, hip-roofed porch that wraps around the left (north) elevation as a one-story space, enclosed after 1992, with a one-story hip-roofed addition at its rear that extends the full depth of the left elevation. The porch is supported by tapered wood columns and has a replacement wood railing. A two-story, hip-roofed ell extends from the left rear (northeast) with a second-story, projecting, hip-roofed bay on the left elevation. A one-story, hip-roofed porch at the right rear (southeast) is supported by a post matching those on the front porch. Its earliest occupants were likely the Daggett family⁵ though a plaque on the house names it the Bahnsen-Herzenberg House. County tax records and the 1915 Sanborn map confirm its 1915 construction date.

7 Cobb – House – c. 1925

C – Building

Originally oriented to the east, the house was reoriented when Cobb Terrace was paved at the rear of the house. This one-story, side-gabled house is three bays wide and double-pile with wood shingles, replacement fixed one-light windows on the west elevation, replacement one-over-one wood-sash windows on the north and south elevations, and an interior brick chimney. Located on the right (south) end of the west elevation, the one-light-over-two-panel door is sheltered by a shed roof on brackets. A one-light-over-two-panel door on the left (north) elevation is sheltered by a gabled roof on brackets. A full-width, inset porch across the east elevation has been enclosed with screens. There is a shed-roofed dormer on the east elevation and the site slopes to the rear to reveal a basement level. The building appears on the 1925 Sanborn map.

8 Cobb – Strudwick House – c. 1915

NC - Building

Built concurrent with the neighboring house as 6 Cobb Terrace, Sanborn maps indicate that the house originally had the same plan. The two-story, hip-roofed Craftsman-style house is three bays wide and triple pile with a projecting, second-floor, hip-roofed wing centered on the façade. The building has plain weatherboards, one-over-one wood-sash windows, and an exterior brick chimney on the right (south) elevation. A replacement six-panel door is sheltered by a hip-roofed porch on square columns. The house has been significantly altered with the addition of a hip-roofed two-story wing on the north elevation and the enclosure of the left (north) end of the porch as it wraps around the two-story wing. Additionally, a one-story-with-basement, hip-roofed wing at the left rear (northeast) has a projecting

⁵ Watkins.

Anya Grahn

From: Melissa McCullough <melissamccnc@gmail.com>

Sent: Tuesday, May 25, 2021 8:59 AM

To: Anya Grahn

Subject: Ps

External email: Don't click links or attachments from unknown senders. To check or report forward to reportspam@townofchapelhill.org

On the front yard fencing thing, the issue is that I don't really have a backyard. Believe me I wish I did right now. It would be far cheaper and more convenient. But I'm in the middle of the terrace loop and the configuration of things that would allow me to just open my door and let her out means it needs to be where I've targeted it. Plus her favorite spot to lay in the sun is in the front yard on the monkey grass.

:-)

On Tue, May 25, 2021 at 8:55 AM Melissa McCullough < melissamccnc@gmail.com> wrote: Hi Anya.

Here is a diagram of what it will look like at the site. In the front it will be a total of 5 feet high, not 5 feet on top of the 18 inches or so of the stone wall.

There is a wrinkle here now though. I looked up when the historic district meeting is, and it's on the 10th when I will be in a class in New Mexico. If the meetings at five it'll be 3 o'clock there which means I'll be out in the field sketching. I'm not sure what to do about that or whether it means we will need to delay it. Josh Gurlitz is a friend of mine, I wonder if I can talk it over with him and he could answer questions? Or if that would be considered some sort of Ex parte communication?

Μ

