



Historic District Commission

New Business – After-the-Fact Certificate of Appropriateness 500 North Street (Project #19-096)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Anya Grahn, Senior Planner

Becky McDonnell, Planner II

Judy Johnson, Interim Planning Director

Applicant	Filing Date	Meeting Date(s)	Historic District
500 North Street LLC	9/1/2020	11/13/2018, 4/9/2019, 9/10/2019, 10/24/2019, 11/12/2019, 9/23/2020	Franklin-Rosemary

Project Description

After-the-fact amendment to an existing Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a stone swale to address stormwater drainage on site.

Proposed Findings of Fact

1. On November 13, 2018, the Historic District Commission (HDC) approved a COA for construction of an approximately 130 sq. ft. addition to the rear of the house, replacing two shed dormers with one larger rear shed dormer, and adding a patio wall on the existing rear brick patio.
2. On April 9, 2019, the HDC approved a modification to the COA for the removal of asbestos siding and replacement with new 12 inch by 24 inch fiber cement wavy shingle siding.
3. On November 12, 2019, the HDC denied a modification to the COA for fiber cement board shingle siding that differed in dimension and profile from the siding material approved in April 2019.
4. The applicant has constructed a stone swale to address stormwater on the site. The existing topography led to water accumulating at the rear patio and house foundation. The swale is intended to reduce the ponding and address the damage of water infiltrating the foundation.
5. The swale is constructed of rounded stones varying in size from two inches (2") to eight inches (8") in diameter. The swale varies is roughly 6.5 feet in width and extends from the rear property line, along the west property line, and toward a catch basin in the street.
6. No trees were removed in the construction of the swale.

Applicable Design Guidelines

Setting (page 9):

1. Retain and preserve the visual and associative characteristics of the landscape and buildings that are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.
2. Protect and maintain the visual and associative characteristics of the district setting that are established by the relationship of buildings to the streetscape, including significant vistas, site topography, accessory structures, streets, alleys, walkways, walls, fences, and plantings.
3. Introduce new site features, building additions, new buildings, and other structures in ways that are compatible with the visual and associative characteristics of the historic district.
4. It is not appropriate to introduce or remove a site feature if it will significantly diminish or radically alter the visual or associative characteristics of the district setting.

Site Features & Plantings (page 11):

7. Maintain and protect site features and plantings from damage during or as a consequence of site work or new construction.
8. Introduce compatible, new site features or plantings with care so that the overall historic character of the site and district is not diminished or compromised. It is not appropriate to introduce incompatible site features or equipment—including raised planting beds, landscape timbers and other contemporary edging materials, swimming pools, satellite dishes, solar collectors, mechanical equipment, transformers, or "hot boxes"—in locations that compromise the overall historic character of the building, site, or surrounding streetscape.

Congruity Findings

Based on the Findings of Facts and the relevant Design Guidelines referenced above, the HDC proposes congruity findings for the following Criteria as specified per LUMO Section 3.6.2(e):

Criterion C: Proposed exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic building and those found on historic sites within the historic district.

Condition of Approval

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission ***approves/denies*** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it ***would/would not be incongruous*** with the special character of the district.

Exhibits

- Exhibit A – [November 13, 2018 HDC Meeting Materials](#)¹
Exhibit B – [April 9, 2019 HDC Meeting Materials](#)²
Exhibit C – [November 12, 2019 HDC Meeting Materials](#)³

¹ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3718285&GUID=DA468D7F-A2A2-43C1-B00E-1952EE54C924>

² <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3899011&GUID=EF24FC3F-FFD3-4C8D-A70F-8B3CA90FFD13>

³ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4207957&GUID=E4345303-2662-469A-94AC-19F07DAEC0FC>