



Historic District Commission

Regular Agenda – Certificate of Appropriateness 306 Ransom Street (Project #20-053)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Anya Grahn, Senior Planner

Becky McDonnell, Planner II

Judy Johnson, Interim Planning Director

Applicant	Filing Date	Meeting Date(s)	Historic District
Douglas Janes, Architect KMS Holdings, Owner	6/17/2020	7/14/2020, 8/11/2020, 9/23/2020	Cameron-McCauley

Project Description

The applicant proposes to renovate the existing house, adding a rear addition as well as modifying the roof form and constructing dormers to create living space on the second level.

Proposed Findings of Fact

1. The Colonial Revival style house is listed as contributing on the National Register of Historic Places and was constructed in 1925-1932.
2. The applicant proposes to modify the original roof form by altering the pitch from 5.5/12 to 7/12 to allow for a higher ceiling height on the second level. This will increase the height of the roof by 2.11 feet. The applicant proposes to recreate the Greek return soffits clad featuring a treatment of tongue and groove. The new gable sides will be horizontal siding to match the house.
3. Two new 1.75/12 pitch shed dormer with standing seam metal roof and six divided light windows will be constructed on the façade. The dormers will be clad in wood lap siding and standing seam metal roofing to match the new roof.
4. The existing back dormer will be removed and a full length 1.25/12 pitch shed dormer will be constructed across the rear (east) elevation. This dormer will also have a metal standing seam roof and wood siding to match the existing house. It will feature pairs of double-hung divided light windows on either side of a picture window.
5. The existing brick chimney will be heightened by 2 ft. 8 inches to accommodate the increased roof height.
6. The existing back screen porch will be removed to construct an addition, clad in horizontal siding above a brick foundation to match the house. On the north elevation of the addition, a new deck and stairs will be constructed of wood with horizontal railings.
7. A new deck with steps will be constructed on the rear (west) elevation. The deck will be constructed of pressure treated framing and Trex decking. New multi-light French doors will be installed to access the deck.
8. All new Marvin aluminum clad windows and doors will be introduced, matching in the same style, muntins, and casings.

Applicable Design Guidelines

Roofs (page 37):

1. Retain and preserve roofs that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts.
2. Retain and preserve the details, features, and material surfaces of historic roofs.
3. Protect and maintain the details, features, and surfaces of historic roofs through appropriate methods.
4. Repair deteriorated or damaged roof features and surfaces through recognized preservation methods for the specific feature or material.
5. Replace in-kind roof features and surfaces that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.

8. It is not appropriate to remove character-defining roof features such as chimneys, dormers, built-in gutters, and vents.
9. It is not appropriate to introduce new roof features, such as chimneys, solar collectors, skylights, ventilators, and communication or mechanical equipment of roof slopes that are visible from the street or in locations that compromise the architectural integrity of the building.
10. It is not appropriate to introduce roof features or details to a historic property in an attempt to create a false historical appearance.

Exterior Walls (page 39):

1. Retain and preserve exterior walls that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts.
2. Retain and preserve the details, features, and material surfaces of historic exterior walls.
3. Protect and maintain the details, features, and surfaces of historic exterior walls through appropriate methods.
5. Replace in kind exterior wall features and surfaces that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.
7. It is not appropriate to remove historic features and details—such as windows, doors, chimneys, bays, band boards, corner boards, wood shingles, brackets, and decorative trim work—on character-defining exterior walls.
8. It is not appropriate to introduce new exterior wall features—such as windows, doors, chimneys, bays, and communication or mechanical equipment—on exterior walls that are visible from the street or in locations that compromise the architectural integrity of the building.
10. It is not appropriate to introduce exterior wall features or details to a historic property in an attempt to create a false historical appearance.

Windows & Doors (page 41):

1. Retain and preserve windows and doors that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts.
2. Retain and preserve the details, features, and material surfaces of historic windows and doors.
3. Protect and maintain the details, features, and surfaces of historic exterior windows and doors through appropriate methods.
4. Repair deteriorated or damaged exterior windows and doors through recognized preservation methods.
5. Replace in kind exterior windows and doors that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement is not technically feasible.
7. It is not appropriate to eliminate or introduce window and door openings on character-defining exterior walls.

Porches, Entrances & Balconies (page 37):

1. Retain and preserve porches, entrances, and balconies that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts.
9. It is not appropriate to enclose a front porch, entrance, or balcony on a character-defining elevation. Consider enclosing a porch or balcony on a side or rear elevation only if the design will preserve the historic character of the porch or balcony.

Additions (page 55):

1. Introduce additions in locations that are not visible from the street—usually on rear elevations, inset from either rear building corner. Locate additions carefully so they do not damage or conceal significant building features or details. It is not appropriate to introduce

an addition if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, such as a porch or mature tree.

2. Minimize damage to the historic building by constructing additions to be structurally self-supporting, where feasible, and attach them to the original building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric.
3. Limit the size and scale of an addition to minimize its visual impact. It is not appropriate to introduce an addition if it will visually overpower the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.
4. Design an addition so it is compatible with the historic building in roof form, massing a, and overall proportion.
5. Design an addition and its features so they are compatible in scale, materials, proportions, and details with the historic building. Select exterior surface materials that are compatible with those of the historic building in terms of module, composition, texture, pattern, color, and detail.
6. Design an addition so it is compatible with yet discernable from the historic building.

Decks (page 57):

1. Introduce decks in inconspicuous areas that are not visible from the street—usually on rear elevations, inset from either building corner. Locate the deck carefully so it does not damage or conceal significant building features or details. It is not appropriate to introduce a deck if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, such as a porch or mature tree.
2. Minimize damage to the historic building by constructing decks to be structurally self-supporting and attach them to the building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric.
3. Limit the size and scale of a deck to minimize its visual impact. It is not appropriate to introduce a deck if it will visually over-power the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.
4. Align decks generally with the building's first floor and screen the deck's structural framing with foundation plantings, lattice, or other compatible screening materials.
5. Design and detail decks and any related steps and railings so they are compatible with the historic building in scale, material, configuration, and proportion.

Congruity Findings

Based on the Findings of Facts and the relevant Design Guidelines referenced above, the HDC proposes congruity findings for the following Criteria as specified per LUMO Section 3.6.2(e):

Criterion A: The proposed increased roof height is ***congruous/incongruous*** with the design of the existing historic house as well as the roof heights of historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion B: The proposed setback and placement on the lot of the new addition and decks in relation to the average setback and placement of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings, is ***congruous/incongruous*** with the existing house as well as those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion C: Proposed exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the existing house as well as those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion D: The architectural detailing, such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and foundation materials are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the existing house as well as those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion E: The proposed roof shapes, forms, and materials will be ***congruous/incongruous*** with the roof shapes, forms, and materials as those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion F: The proposed proportion, shape, positioning and location, pattern, and size of any elements of fenestration will be ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the existing house as well as those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion G: The general form and proportions of the building and structure is ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the existing house as well as those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion J: Proposed architectural scale is ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the existing house as well as those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Condition of Approval

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission ***approves/denies*** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it ***would/would not be incongruous*** with the special character of the district.

Exhibits

Exhibit A – [July 14, 2020 HDC Meeting Materials](#)¹

Exhibit B – [August 11, 2020 HDC Meeting Materials](#)²

¹ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4581418&GUID=B6038375-3BEB-4735-B139-C8E513F12226>

² <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4601450&GUID=FD1DA976-CAA5-4E16-BA92-B10D737531E9>