



Historic District Commission

Regular Agenda – Certificate of Appropriateness 723 Gimghoul Road (Project #19-009)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Anya Grahn, Senior Planner

Becky McDonnell, Planner II

Judy Johnson, Interim Planning Director

Applicant	Filing Date	Meeting Date(s)	Historic District
Margurete Britt, Property Owner	7/16/2020	8/11/2020	Franklin-Rosemary
Project Description			
The applicant proposes to restore the front porch to a simple portico and replace the front walkway material.			
Proposed Findings of Fact			
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The Historic District Commission approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for this site on April 9, 2019 for the renovation of the existing house and construction of a new addition.2. The Commission approved an amendment to this Certificate of Appropriateness on June 11, 2019, for changes to the fenestration pattern.3. Drainage issues on the site required the removal of the sidewalk and the front terrace of the house.4. The applicant proposes to restore the porch closer to its original dimensions, based on physical evidence, historic photographs of the house from the 1920s and 1940s, as well as house plans from the c.1921 Sears catalog ad. The new porch floor will follow the footprint of the porch roof above, measuring approximately 7 feet by 10 feet.5. The applicant proposes to replace the existing porch floor with a new concrete slab. This is consistent with the physical evidence they uncovered while removing the brick floor of the porch.6. The applicant proposes to modify the front walkway to a random-laid, soft-colored flagstone that is similar in color to the house's existing masonry chimneys. The flagstone walkway will also be similar in color and material to the low fieldstone walls on the site.7. The applicant also proposes to construct new back porch stairs to follow the curved retaining wall on the site. The new stairs will terminate at a flagstone pathway that will join an existing flagstone path on the site. This change in design will maintain the existing curved retaining wall and existing vegetation in the backyard.			
Applicable Design Guidelines			
<i>Walkways, Driveways, & Offstreet Parking (page 17):</i>			
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Retain and preserve walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas that are important in defining the overall historic character of sites within the historic districts.2. Retain and preserve the features, materials, patterns, dimensions, details, and configurations of historic walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas.4. Repair deteriorated or damaged historic walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas through recognized preservation methods.5. Replace in kind historic walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, texture, and pattern. Consider a compatible substitute material only if it is not feasible to replace in kind.6. If a historic walkway, driveway, or offstreet parking area is missing, either replace it to match the original, based upon physical and documentary evidence, or replace it with a new feature that is compatible in material, design, scale, and detail with the overall historic character of the site and district.7. Introduce compatible new walls and fences, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district. Site new walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking			

areas in locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district and locate them so the general topography of the site and mature trees and other significant site features are not altered, damaged, or lost.

9. Construct new walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas in traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site and district.

Porches, Entrances, & Balconies (page 43):

5. Replace in kind any feature or portion of a porch, entrance, or balcony that is too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.
6. If a porch, entrance, or balcony is missing either replace it to match the original feature, based upon physical and documentary evidence, or replace it with a new feature that is compatible in material, design, size, and scale with the building.

Congruity Findings

Based on the Findings of Facts and the relevant Design Guidelines referenced above, the HDC proposes congruity findings for the following Criteria as specified per LUMO Section 3.6.2(e):

Criterion C: Exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the existing house as well as historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion H: Appurtenant fixtures and other features such as lighting are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the existing house as well as those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion J: Architectural scale of proposed new features are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the existing house as well as those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Condition of Approval

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission ***approves/denies*** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it ***would/would not be incongruous*** with the special character of the district.

Exhibits

Exhibit A – April 9, 2019 [HDC Meeting Materials](https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3871045&GUID=F226944B-728D-4F02-BA6B-71824E9347EE)¹

Exhibit B – June 11, 2019 [HDC Meeting Materials](https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3958253&GUID=710D9C50-19C9-4A1B-A608-D55CB45C9BE3)²

¹ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3871045&GUID=F226944B-728D-4F02-BA6B-71824E9347EE>

² <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3958253&GUID=710D9C50-19C9-4A1B-A608-D55CB45C9BE3>