

Chapel Hill Historic District	Project:	St. Anthony Hall
Certificate of Appropriateness Application		
Project Description: Seeking certificate of appropriateness for the replacement of deteriorated and leaky main low pitched asphalt shingle roof and small flat roof over entrance canopy. We are proposing to replace the roof with a metal roof: steel with baked	Permit:	#20-043
enamel finish. We will also be repairing some flashing and painting the trim the same color.		STAFF REVIEW
	Applica	tion complete and accepted
		ition not complete and ith a notation of deficiencies
		nya Grahn, /29/2020
Instructions: Submit one paper copy and a digital copy of all application materials coll	ated in one f	file (pdf preferred)
Deadlines: Applications are due by the close of business 30 calendar days prior to the	scheduled n	neeting date.
<b>Note:</b> Only complete applications may be accepted for Certificate of Appropriateness	review Ann	lications that are not

**Note:** Only complete applications may be accepted for Certificate of Appropriateness review. Applications that are not complete will be returned with a notation of deficiencies.

Property Address:	207 Pittsboro St	Chapel Hill, NC	27514 <b>Parce</b>	I ID Number:	9788354930
Property Owner(s):	St. Anthony As	sociation of NC,	Inc Email	: theecomm	odore@gmail.com
	Vice President	of Physical Plant	: David		
	Joyner				
operty Owner Addr	Joyner ess: 4711 Hope Valle	y Rd Suite 4F-714			

B: Applicant Information		
Applicant: Lucy Davis, LCDA Architecture	Role (owner, Architect architect, other):	



Address (if differe Suite 200	nt from above): 976 M	artin Luther	King Jr. E	Blvd		
City: Chapel Hil		State:	NC	Zip:	27514	
Email: lucydavis@	gmail.com				Phone: 919.360.4068	

# C. Application Type (check all boxes that apply)

Minor Work Exterior works that do not involve any substantial alterations, and do not involve additions or removals that could impair the integrity of the property and/or the district as a whole. See <u>Design Guidelines</u> (p. 69) for a list of minor works.

Historic District Commission Review Includes all exterior changes to structures and features other than minor works

□Site-work only (walkways, fencing, walls, etc.)	After-the-fact application (for unauthorized work already performed).
⊠Restoration or alteration	Demolition or moving of a site feature.
□New construction or additions	□Request for review of new application after previous denial
□Sign	

### D. Basic information about size, scale, and lot placement.

Provide measurements in feet and square feet where applicable. Where possible, please provide accurate measurements from a licensed surveyor, architect, engineer, etc. If exact measurements are not available, please provide estimated information. Current estimated information about lots and buildings can be found on the <u>Orange</u> <u>County Real Estate Data</u> website. Information about lot placement can be found on the <u>Chapel Hill</u> and <u>Orange</u> <u>County Interactive GIS</u> portals.

Zoning District:	М	linimum setbo	acks	Maximum heights			Lot size
	Street	Interior	Solar	Primary	Secondary		
Required by zoning							
Proposed							
	Existing	Change +/-	Total	Total Floor Area Ratio			
Floor Area (main structure)				Existing Proposed		ISA/I	NLA ratio
Floor Area (all other)						Existing	Proposed
Impervious Surface Area (ISA)							
New Land Disturbance							



### E: Applicable Design Guidelines

The Town's <u>Design Guidelines for the Chapel Hill Historic Districts</u> are integral to the application and review process. These guidelines supplement the required review criteria for Certificate of Appropriateness applications (provided in <u>Section 3.6.2(e)(4)</u> of the Land Use Management Ordinance) by providing detailed, practical considerations for how to make changes to properties while preserving the special character of their Historic District context. Please review the Design Guidelines and consider their applicability to your proposed project. (Attach additional sheets, as necessary.)

Section/Page	Торіс	Brief description of the applicable aspect of your proposal
37 Sections 4,5	Roof	Replacing a deteriorating main low pitch, asphalt shingle roof and small flat roof over entrance canopy with a metal roof: steel with baked enamel finish.



Town of Chapel Hill Planning Department 919-969-5040 planning@townofchapelhill.org

F. Checklist of Application Materials					
Attach the required elements in the order indicated.	ATTACHED? TO BE COMPLETED BY APPLICANT			COMPLE OWN STA	
	YES	N/A	YES	N/A	NO
1. Written description of physical changes proposed. Describe clearly and in detail the physical changes you are proposing to make. Identify the materials to be used (siding, windows, trim, roofing, pavements, decking, fencing, light fixtures, etc.), specify their dimensions, and provide names of manufacturers, model numbers, and specifications where applicable.					
2. History, context, and character information. Please include a summary of what information you have relied on to understand the relevant character and history of the district and subject property—and briefly summarize that information. At a minimum, include:	$\boxtimes$				
<ul> <li>Current property information for the lot and all structures, including Building Sketches and Building Details, from <u>Orange County Real Estate</u> <u>Data</u>.</li> </ul>					
The entry of your property on the most recent inventory of historic resources in the relevant National Register for Historic Places filing, available via the NC State Historic Preservation Office website: for McCauley- Cameron see <u>West Chapel Hill</u> , for Franklin-Rosemary see <u>Chapel Hill Historic</u> <u>District</u> , for Gimghoul see <u>Gimghoul</u> . (If yours is one of the few properties in McCauley-Cameron or Franklin-Rosemary that has not yet been inventoried, please indicate that.)					
<b>3. Justification of appropriateness.</b> Attach an annotated statement explaining how the proposed change(s) meets the following standards of appropriateness that the Commission considers in making findings of fact indicating the extent to which the application is or is not congruous with the historic aspects of the historic district. If a standard is not applicable, type "not applicable".					
<ul> <li>A. The height of the building in relation to the average height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings.</li> <li>B. The setback and placement on lot of the building in relation to the average setback and placement of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings.</li> <li>C. Exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern.</li> <li>D. Architectural detailing, such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and foundation materials.</li> <li>E. Roof shapes, forms, and materials.</li> <li>F. Proportion, shape, positioning and location, pattern, and size of any elements of fenestration.</li> <li>G. General form and proportions of buildings and structures.</li> <li>H. Appurtenant fixtures and other features such as lighting.</li> <li>I. Structural conditions and soundness.</li> </ul>					



Town of Chapel Hill Planning Department 919-969-5040 planning@townofchapelhill.org

J. Architectural scale.				
4. <b>Photographs</b> of existing conditions are required. Minimum image size 4" x 6" as printed or the digital equivalent. Maximum 2 images per page.	$\boxtimes$			
5. Site Plan Set showing existing and proposed conditions. (Min. scale: 1 in. = 20 ft.)			 	
Site plans must show the relationships between, and dimensions of, existing and proposed buildings, additions, sidewalks, walls, fences, driveways, and/or other structures on the property, as well as property lines and applicable zoning setbacks.				
<ul> <li>Include both written and drawn scales and show accurate measurements.</li> <li>You may also use a copy of a survey with surveyor's seal deleted. Revise the copy as needed to show existing conditions and your proposed work.</li> </ul>				
Indicate the area of all structural footprints (existing and proposed) in square feet; also, indicate lot size in square feet.				
6. Elevation Drawings showing existing structural facades and proposed changes. Drawings should be submitted as 11" x 17" or 8-1/2" x 11" reductions of full-size drawings. All details should be reasonably legible. Photographs are okay for facades with no changes.				
<ul> <li>Elevation drawings showing all proposed changes above current grade from front, back, and both sides.</li> </ul>				
Include scale bar, written scale, and label major dimensions (including width of structures and heights from finished grade to fascia/eaves and heights to top of roofs).				
□ Label materials to be used (roofing, siding, windows, trim, light fixtures, etc.)				
7. Information about context (required for all construction of new structures, proposed impervious surfaces greater than 1500 SF, additions greater than 150 SF, and/or proposed land disturbance greater than 5000 SF.) Detailed information about lots and structures can be found on the <u>Orange County Real</u> <u>Estate Data</u> website; information about lot placement can be found on the <u>Chapel Hill</u> and <u>Orange County</u> GIS portals.				
For each of the nearest adjacent and opposite properties, provide:				
The height of each building (if an estimate, indicate that).				
<ul> <li>The setbacks and lots placement of each building (an image from the Town GIS database, including scale, is sufficient).</li> </ul>				
$\Box$ The size of each lot (net land area in square feet).				
The size of all buildings on the nearest adjacent and opposite properties, including building footprint areas, Floor Areas (in square feet), and Floor Area Ratios. Provide current figures from <u>Orange County Real Estate Data</u> ; indicate any corrections for accuracy you believe necessary and your basis for doing so.				
8. <b>Demolition/Relocation Information</b> (required only if demolition or relocation of a feature is proposed).		$\boxtimes$		



Provide a written description of architectural features, additions, remodeling, and any alterations to the structure(s). Make note of any outbuildings on the site plan of the property.			
Provide a history of the structure, giving the construction date and architect or carpenter, briefly noting any significant events, persons and/or families associated with the property. Provide current exterior photographs of the property (4" x 6" as printed or the digital equivalent). If information is unknown, please provide a summary of sources consulted.			
If an argument about structural soundness is being made, attach a signed and sealed report from a professional engineer.			
As necessary, attach a statement explaining how a delay in demolition would cause the property owner to suffer extreme hardship or be permanently deprived of all beneficial use or return from such property by virtue of the delay.			
Provide any records about the structure to be demolished.			
<ol> <li>Mailing notification fee per <u>Planning &amp; Sustainability Fee Schedule</u>. For a list of addresses, please refer to the Town's <u>Development Notification Tool</u>.</li> </ol>	$\boxtimes$		
<b>10.</b> Certificate of Appropriateness fee per <u>Planning &amp; Sustainability Fee Schedule</u>	⊠		



### **G:** Applicant signature

I hereby certify that I am authorized to submit this application; that all information is correct to the best of my knowledge, and all work will comply with the State Building Code and all other applicable State and local laws, ordinances, and regulations.

I acknowledge and agree that the Historic District Commission members, Town employees, and Town agents may enter, solely in performance of their official duties and only at reasonable times, upon the applicant's property for examination or survey thereof pursuant to North Carolina General Statute 160A-400.8. However, no member, employee, or agent of the Historic District Commission may enter any private building or structure without the express consent of the owner or occupant thereof.

I understand and agree that an approved Certificate of Appropriateness is valid only for the particular application, plans, specifications and related project details presented to, and approved by, the Historic District Commission. If any of the data contained in this application, any plans or any specifications presented to the Commission are changed or altered for any reason, including, but not limited to, changes or alternations deemed practically necessary during construction, required due to subsequent Town reviews, or otherwise, a new hearing before the Historic District may be required. By signing below, the applicant agrees to notify the Development Services Center of any changes or alternations in the data contained in this application, the approved plans or the approved specifications related to the project that is the subject of this application.

Hearings on Certificate of Appropriateness applications before the Commission are quasi-judicial proceedings. Therefore, Historic District Commission members are not permitted to discuss a pending application with the applicant or other party. By signing below, the applicant agrees to refrain from speaking with or contacting any member of the Historic District Commission about an application outside of the formal evidentiary hearing on the application.

Lucy Davis		6/11/20	
Applicant (printed name)	Signature	Date /	
David Joyner			
	avid Joyner	6-10-2020	
Property Owner	Signature	Date	
(if different from above)			



# **Certificate of Appropriateness Supplemental Requirements**

# \*In addition to <u>Residential</u> Zoning OR <u>Administrative</u> Zoning Compliance Permit Requirements

Certificate of Appropriateness applications are subject to review and approval by the Historic District Commission as well as by Town staff. For assistance with this application, please contact the Chapel Hill Planning Department.

**Please submit** *all* **materials listed** <u>on this sheet</u>. The Historic District Commission meets on the second Tuesday of each month at 6:30 pm. For confirmation of a meeting date and the placement of your request on the agenda, please call the Planning Department. **Applications are due one month in advance of meeting.** 

# **Application Process:**

- 1. Historic District Commission Review of Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Supplemental materials
- 2. Staff review of Residential / Administrative Zoning Compliance Permit (ZCP) materials

\*\*COA (step 1) and ZCP (step 2) materials may be submitted simultaneously or separately.

# **Required Application Materials**

(In addition to <u>Residential</u> Zoning Compliance Permit or <u>Administrative</u> Zoning Compliance Permit Requirements)

An Electronic copy of each document is required in addition to paper copies.

Provide a single set of the following materials:

4
~
2

- 1. Application Form. Either <u>Residential</u> Zoning Compliance or <u>Administrative</u> Zoning Compliance.
- 2. Recorded plat or deed verifying property's current ownership
- 3. Recorded plat of easements, right-of-way, and dedications, if applicable
- 4. <u>Mailing List of Property Owners</u>, applicable within 100 feet of property boundaries The Town will prepare a formal notice to be mailed to surrounding property owners about the application. You may find it helpful to discuss the proposed changes with your neighbors in person so you can address their concerns both in your planning and presentation.
- 5. Mailing notification fee. The fee per address can be found on the **Planning Department's Fee Schedule**.
- 6. Certificate of Appropriateness fee per <u>Planning Department's Fee Schedule</u>
- 7. Reduced Site Plan Set (reduced to 8.5" x 11")
- 8. Building Elevations (label building height from top of roof to finished grade line)
- 9. Floor Plan, only if accessory apartment, duplex, or commercial application.

# (Continued)



### 10. Written Description

Describe all proposed changes to the property, list all materials to be used, and address the criteria (listed below) that the Commission uses to determine appropriateness. Presenting your proposal with these criteria in mind will provide a clear basis for the Commission's deliberations.

- a) The height of the building in relation to the average height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings;
- b) The setback and placement of the building on the lot in relation to the average setback and placement of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings;
- c) The exterior construction materials, including textures and patterns;
- d) The architectural detailing such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and foundation materials;
- e) The roof shape, form, and materials;
- f) The proportion, shape, location, pattern, and size of any elements of fenestration (windows, doors);
- g) The general form and proportion of the buildings;
- h) The accessory fixture and other features (including lighting fixtures, hardware, awnings, etc.);
- i) The architectural scale in relation to existing structures and surrounding buildings; and
- j) Structural conditions and soundness.

Provide photographs of existing property and elevation drawings of the proposed changes. Depict changes in as much detail as possible, paying special attention to those features which the Commission uses to determine appropriateness. This section of the application allows the Commission to see the current state of the property, to visualize the proposed changes, and to assess the impact. The visual description must include dimensions. For new buildings and major additions, the visual description must include the interior floor plan.

### 11. Information Regarding Surrounding Properties

For new construction or large projects, the applicant is required to provide information on:

- The height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings;
- The setback and placement of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings;
- The scale of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings, including percentage of lot coverage.

### 12. Demolition Information (if applicable)

Provide a description of architectural features, additions, remodeling, and any alterations to the structure(s). Make note of any outbuildings on the site plan of the property. Provide a history of the structure, giving the construction date and architect or carpenter, briefly noting any significant events, persons, and/or families associate with the property.

# **Historic Context:**

# 207 Pittsboro Street – Delta Psi Fraternity House/St. Anthony Hall – c. 1967 Contributing Building

A rare example of Modern architecture in the northeast part of the district, the Delta Psi Fraternity House, also known as St. Anthony Hall, stands in stark contrast to the Colonial Revival-style fraternity houses to its north. The two-story, side-gabled building is five bays wide with replacement casement windows at the first and second floors, installed after 1992. Windows are typically paired, separated by a flush wood spandrel and the second-floor windows have fixed transoms. The center bay features a group of eight fixed windows, stacked four on four, at the second-floor level. The first-floor level of the center bay has a solid wood door on the right end, and three fixed panels with fixed transoms above to its left. A flat-roofed metal awning separates the first- and second-floor levels of the center bay. There are two entrances on the northwest elevation and one on the southeast elevation with exterior metal stairs leading to the upper-level doors. The rear of the building features paired one-light doors on the first- and second-floor levels. The second-floor doors have fixed one-light transoms and open to a shallow wood deck with wood railings. Delta Psi occupied a building on at 207 Pittsboro Street as early as 1944, though the current building dates to a1957.

# **Description & Justification of Appropriateness:**

The work to be done at 207 Pittsboro Street is to be considered as minor work, routine maintenance and repair. We are requesting the approval by the Town Manager for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Per LUMO 3.6.2. Historic District (b)4: "Minor works are defined as those exterior changes that do not involved any substantial alterations, and do not involve additions or removals that could impair the integrity of the property and/or the district as a whole". We are only proposing a change in roofing material. Currently the two story, side gable roof is roofed with asphalt shingles. The gable has a low enough slope where one cannot see the roofing material from the street. We are proposing to replace the shingle roof with a more durable steel metal roof in "Brite White" with a baked enamel finish to minimize maintenance. Please refer to image for selected roof color.

The pictures provided show that existing painted exterior surfaces are in need of repainting. Soffits, fascias, and trim will be painted to match the existing. The flat-roofed metal awning at the front of the building is to be repaired. The current membrane roof is to be replaced as part of routine maintenance. We intend to maintain the current copper metal coping. No major changes are being proposed and changes that are being proposed are only for routine maintenance of building. Response in regards to Criteria:

- a) The height of the building in relation to the average height of the nearest adjacent and opposite building:
  - No changes are being proposed to the current building that would affect the overall building height.



- b) The setback and placement of the building on the lot in relation to the average setback and placement of the nearest adjacent and opposite building:
  - No changes are being proposed to the current placement and configuration of the building.
- c) The exterior construction materials, including textures or patterns:
  - No new construction is being proposed. Existing brick is to remain.

- d) The architectural detailing such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and foundation materials:
  - Existing architectural details are to remain. No changes are being proposed. As part of routine maintenance soffits, fascias, and trim will be repaired and painted to match the existing





SIDE ELEVATION: REPAIR AND REPAINT FASCIA AND SOFFIT.

- e) The roof shape, form, and materials:
  - The roof shape will remain unchanged. The low slope side gable is currently roofed with asphalt shingles. We are proposing to reroof it with a more durable steel metal roof in "Brite White" with a baked enamel finish to minimize maintenance.



FRONT ELEVATION



• The flat-roofed metal awning at the front of the building is to be repaired. The current membrane roof is to be replaced as part of routine maintenance. We intend to maintain the current copper metal coping.



- f) The proportion, shape, location, pattern, and size of any elements of fenestrations (windows, doors):
  - No changes are being proposed to current configuration.
- g) The general form and proportion of the building:
  - No changes are being made to the current form of the building.
- h) The accessory fixture and other features (including lighting fixtures, hardware, awnings, etc.):
  - No changes are being proposed to any fixtures.
- i) The architectural scale in relation to existing structures and surrounding buildings:
  - No changes are being proposed that would affect such relationship.
- j) Structural conditions and soundness:
  - The building appears to be structurally sound and no changes are being proposed that would affect the structural integrity.

SIG EP HOUSING OF NORTH CAROLINA DELTA LL... 310 S ARTHUR ASHE BLVD RICHMOND VA 23220 UNIVERSITY OF N C **UNKNOWN ADDRESS** CHAPEL HILL NC 27514 ST ANTHONY ASSOC OF NC INC 4711 HOPE VALLEY RD DURHAM NC 27707 NORTH CAROLINA STATE OF 116 W JONES ST RALEIGH NC 27611 **BURBIDGE MICHAEL F BISHOP** 7200 STONEHENGE DR RALEIGH NC 27613 SIG EP HOUSING OF NORTH CAROLINA DELTA LL ... 310 S ARTHUR ASHE BLVD RICHMOND VA 23220 UNIVERSITY OF N C **UNKNOWN ADDRESS** CHAPEL HILL NC 27514 MADISON PARTNERS LLC PO BOX 1113 CHAPEL HILL NC 27514 STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA **1321 MAIL SERVICE CENTER** RALEIGH NC 276991321

West Chapel Hill Historic District (Boundary Increase) Name of Property

### Orange County, North Carolina County and State

weatherboards, vertical board-and-batten in the gables, exposed rafter tails, vinyl windows throughout, and an interior brick chimney. A nine-light-over-two-panel door centered on the façade is sheltered by a small front-gabled porch supported by square posts. The earliest known occupant is Benjamin Schreiber in 1946.

### 419 W. Patterson Place – House – c. 1945 Contributing Building

Set back from the street southeast of the duplex at 413 West Patterson Place and just east of the house at 415 West Patterson Place, this one-story, front-gabled, Minimal Traditional-style house is oriented to face northeast. The house is two bays wide and triple-pile with board-and-batten sheathing, German-profile weatherboards in the gables with scalloping on the bottom board, and a louvered vent in the peak of the gable. The house has vinyl windows, exposed rafter tails, and an interior brick chimney. A replacement nine-light-over-two-panel door on the northeast elevation is sheltered by a shed-roofed porch on paired wood posts with lattice between the posts and is accessed by a brick stair. A shallow gabled wing projects from the left (southeast) side of the house, flush with the façade. County tax records date the house to 1940 though the address does not appear on city directories until after 2000, likely because of changing addresses on this end of the street. The building was mostly likely built in the early- to mid-1940s along with the other three houses on this end of the street.

# <u>Pittsboro Street</u> 207 Pittsboro Street – Delta Psi Fraternity House/St. Anthony Hall – c. 1960 Contributing Building

A rare example of Modern architecture in the northeast part of the district, the Delta Psi Fraternity House, also known as St. Anthony Hall, stands in stark contrast to the Colonial Revival-style fraternity houses to its north. The two-story, side-gabled building is five bays wide with replacement casement windows at the first and second floors, installed after 1992. Windows are typically paired, separated by a flush wood spandrel and the second-floor windows have fixed transoms. The center bay features a group of eight fixed windows, stacked four on four, at the second-floor level. The first-floor level of the center bay has a solid wood door on the right end, and three fixed panels with fixed transoms above to its left. A flat-roofed metal awning separates the first- and second-floor levels of the center bay. There are two entrances on the northwest elevation and one on the southeast elevation with exterior metal stairs leading to the upper-level doors. The rear of the building features paired one-light doors on the first- and second-floor levels. The second-floor doors have fixed one-light transoms and open to a shallow wood deck with wood railings. Delta Psi occupied a building on this site as early as 1944, though the current building dates to about 1960.

# <u>Ransom Street</u> West of 208 and 210 Ransom Street VACANT LOT