



## Historic District Commission

### New Business –Certificate of Appropriateness 203 Battle Lane (Project #19-055)

#### Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT  
Anya Grahn, Senior Planner  
Becky McDonnell, Planner II  
Judy Johnson, Interim Planning Director

<b>Applicant</b>	<b>Filing Date</b>	<b>Meeting Date(s)</b>	<b>Historic District</b>
Bret Horton	2/10/2020	3/10/2020	Franklin-Rosemary
<b>Project Description</b> <p>Modification to an existing Certificate of Appropriateness in order to construct a new landscaped gathering area on the north side of the property; a new exterior doorway on the north elevation; modifications to the brick walkway on the north side of the house; relocation of HVAC units and screening; a new exterior doorway on the south side of the house connecting to the terrace; new bicycle parking; replacement of windows and doors from fiberglass/wood to aluminum; change to roofing materials from standing seam metal to asphalt shingles.</p>			
<b>Proposed Findings of Fact</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. On July 12, 2019, the Historic District Commission (HDC) approved a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to make repairs to the historic house, renovate a non-historic addition, construct a new terrace, repair an existing shed, and construct improved accessibility upgrades.</li><li>2. On September 9, 2019, the HDC approved modifications to the COA to construct a new code-required accessibility ramp.</li><li>3. The applicant proposes to construct a new landscaped gathering space measuring approximately 25 feet by 55 feet. Materials to be used include Chapel Hill grit or Delaware Valley pea gravel contained by a stone edging, 4 to 5 boulders to define the space, a stone bench, and up lighting and path lighting. The gathering space will be screened from view from Senlac Road by new plantings.</li><li>4. A new entry door and landing will be constructed on the north elevation. The new door will be a simulated divided-light glass and wood door. Two sidelights will flank the door matching the divided-light design. The landing will be brick with two brick treads.</li><li>5. The design of the previously approved brick walkway will be modified to create a curve to accommodate the new landing.</li><li>6. Six HVAC units will be moved to the northwest corner of the house. A 4 foot tall enclosure made of horizontal wood slats and painted to match the house will screen the HVAC units.</li><li>7. The brick walkway adjacent to the ADA parking pad will be extended to the northwest corner of the parking pad.</li><li>8. On the south side of the house, an existing double-hung window will be replaced by a single divided-light doorway and transom.</li><li>9. The terrace, steps, and ADA ramp have been expanded 7'6" closer to the west. The additional terrace space will be bluestone with a brick border and the additional ramp length will be brick with wrought-iron handrails. The additional length of bench will be brick with a bluestone seat and the length of the bench has been broken up by a 5 foot wide opening.</li><li>10. A new 3'4" wide raised brick planter has been added to the southwest corner of the house.</li><li>11. To the southwest of the terrace and ADA ramp, a new planting bed has been introduced. The proposed walkway has been shifted around it.</li><li>12. The brick bicycle parking pad has been expanded to 7 feet by 18 feet and has been shifted to the south side of the house to accommodate the proposed gathering space along Senlac Road.</li></ol>			

13. The applicant has found that the size of some of the windows and doors to be replaced prevented the applicant from utilizing fiberglass windows as approved. Instead, the applicant will be using aluminum windows with a simulated divided light.
14. Over the one-story wings of the house, the applicant will use asphalt architectural shingles rather than standing-seam metal.
15. The applicant proposes to modify the existing garden shed by constructing a shed-roof addition to the east elevation.

### **Applicable Design Guidelines**

#### *Setting (page 9):*

3. Introduce new site features, building additions, new buildings, and other structures in ways that are compatible with the visual and associative characteristics of the historic district.

#### *Site Features & Plantings (page 11):*

8. Introduce compatible, new site features or plantings with care so that the overall historic character of the site and districts is not diminished or compromised. It is not appropriate to introduce incompatible site features or equipment—including raised planting beds, landscape timbers and other contemporary edging materials, swimming pools, satellite dishes, solar collectors, mechanical equipment, transformers, or “hot boxes”—in locations that compromise the historic character of the building, site, or surrounding landscape.

#### *Walkways, Driveways, and Off-street Parking (page 19):*

16. Construct new walkways, driveways, and off-street parking areas in traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.

#### *Garages & Accessory Structures (page 21):*

7. Introduce compatible new garages and accessory structures, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district. Site new garages or accessory structures in traditional locations that are compatible with the character of the building and site. Design them to be compatible with the main house in material, form, scale, and detail. Maintain the traditional height, proportion, and orientation of garages and accessory structures in the district.

#### *Roofs (page 37):*

5. Replace in kind roof features and surfaces that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.

#### *Windows & Doors (page 41):*

5. Replace in kind exterior windows and doors that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.
6. If an exterior window or door is missing either replace it to match the original feature, based upon physical and documentary evidence, or replace it with a new feature that is compatible in material, design, size, and scale with the building.
7. It is not appropriate to eliminate or introduce window and door openings on character-defining exterior walls.

#### *Accessibility & Life Safety Considerations (page 47):*

2. Meet accessibility and life safety code requirements in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the building site and its significant features.
3. Meet accessibility and life safety code requirements in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the building and its significant architectural features.
6. Minimize the visual impact of life safety features—such as fire doors, elevator additions, and fire stairs—through compatible design and discreet siting. Locate new life safety features in locations that do not compromise the architectural integrity of the building and that are not

visible from the street. Design life safety features to be compatible with the historic building in scale, proportion, materials, and finish.

*Utilities & Energy Retrofit* (page 49):

7. Minimize the visual impact of new mechanical and communication equipment and utilities by installing them in inconspicuous locations that are not visible from the street and by screening them from view. It is not appropriate to install condensers, skylights, ventilators, solar collectors, and mechanical or communication equipment on roof slopes or building elevations that are visible from the street or in locations that visually compromise the architectural character of the building.
8. It is not appropriate to replace operable windows with fixed glazing, to replace clear glazing with tinted glazing, or to replace multi-paned windows or doors with single-pane thermal sash with flat, applied mullions.

### **Congruity Findings**

Based on the Findings of Facts and the relevant Design Guidelines referenced above, the HDC proposes congruity findings for the following Criteria as specified per LUMO Section 3.6.2(e):

Criterion A: The height of the building is ***congruous/incongruous*** in relation to the average height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings.

Criterion B: The setback and placement on the lot of the new building is ***congruous/incongruous*** in relation to the average setback and placement of houses and accessory buildings on the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings.

Criterion C: Proposed exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion D: The architectural detailing, such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and foundation materials, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion E: Roof shapes, forms, and materials proposed on the new building are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on similar buildings within the historic district.

Criterion F: The proportion, shape, positioning and location, pattern and size of any elements of fenestration are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Criterion G: The general form and proportions of the new building are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Criterion H: Appurtenant fixtures and other features such as lighting are ***congruous/incongruous*** with the historic house and historic sites in the district.

### **Decision**

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission ***approves/denies*** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it ***would/would not be incongruous*** with the special character of the district.

### **Exhibits**

1. [July 9, 2019 Meeting Materials](https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3963545&GUID=77A1051F-D986-4BA6-8BD9-1C7AE46BBAA6)<sup>1</sup>
2. [September 10, 2019 Meeting Materials](https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4117775&GUID=59F9E367-76FB-43B9-B5F2-65572C8BE40B)<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3963545&GUID=77A1051F-D986-4BA6-8BD9-1C7AE46BBAA6>

<sup>2</sup> <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4117775&GUID=59F9E367-76FB-43B9-B5F2-65572C8BE40B>