



Historic District Commission

New Business –Certificate of Appropriateness 403 W. Cameron Avenue (Project #20-006)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT
Anya Grahn, Senior Planner
Becky McDonnell, Planner II
Judy Johnson, Interim Planning Director

Applicant	Filing Date	Meeting Date(s)	Historic District
Frederick Stewart	1/16/2020	2/11/2020	Cameron-McCauley
Project Description <p>The applicant proposes to remove an existing one-story addition on the west elevation of the house in order to expand the existing front porch around the northwest corner of the house.</p>			
Proposed Findings of Fact <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The applicant proposes to remove an existing one-story structure attached to the west elevation. The addition to the house appears on the c.1915 Sanborn Fire Insurance map.2. The applicant proposes to expand the porch around the northwest corner of the house. The expansion will incorporate a curved corner to match that found on the northeast corner of the house and the porch will project as a semicircle. New porch columns, handrails and balusters, brackets, and other architectural details will match those found on the existing porch.3. The existing window on the west elevation of the first floor will be replaced with a pair of double French doors. The interior doorway that currently accesses the pre-1915 structure on the west elevation will be covered with siding to match that of the existing house.			
Applicable Design Guidelines <p><i>Exterior Walls (page 39):</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">7. It is not appropriate to remove historic features and details—such as windows, doors, chimneys, bays, band boards, corner boards, wood shingles, brackets and decorative trim work—on character-defining exterior walls.8. It is not appropriate to introduce new exterior wall features—such as windows, doors, chimneys, bays, and communication or mechanical equipment—on exterior walls that are visible from the street or in locations that compromise the architectural integrity of the building. <p><i>Porches, Entrances & Balconies (page 43):</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">7. It is not appropriate to eliminate or introduce porches, entrances, and balconies on character-defining exterior walls.10. It is not appropriate to introduce exterior porch, entrance, or balcony features or details, to a historic property in an attempt to create a false historical appearance. <p><i>Additions (page 55):</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">3. Limit the size and scale of an addition to minimize its visual impact. It is not appropriate to introduce an addition if it will visually overpower the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.4. Design an addition so it is compatible with the historic building in roof form, massing, and overall proportion.5. Design an addition and its features so they are compatible in scale, materials, proportions, and details with the historic building. Select exterior surface materials that are compatible with those found on the historic building in terms of module, composition, texture, pattern, color, and detail.6. Design an addition so it is compatible with yet discernible from the historic building.			

Congruity Findings

Based on the Findings of Facts and the relevant Design Guidelines referenced above, the HDC proposes congruity findings for the following Criteria as specified per LUMO Section 3.6.2(e):

Criterion C: Proposed exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic building and those found on historic sites within the historic district.

Criterion D: The architectural detailing, such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and foundation materials are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic building and those found on historic sites within the historic district.

Criterion F: The proportion, shape, positioning and location, pattern, and size of any elements of fenestration are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic building and those found on historic sites within the historic district.

Criterion G: The general form and proportions of the buildings and structures ***congruous/incongruous*** with the porch found on the historic building and porches found on historic sites within the historic district.

Criterion J: The architectural scale of the expanded porch is ***congruous/incongruous*** with the architectural scale of the historic building and historic buildings within the historic district.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission ***approves/denies*** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it ***would/would not be incongruous*** with the special character of the district.