



Historic District Commission

Regular Agenda –Certificate of Appropriateness 408 Hillsborough Street(Project #19-144)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT
Anya Grahn, Senior Planner
Becky McDonnell, Planner II
Judy Johnson, Interim Planning Director

Applicant	Filing Date	Meeting Date(s)	Historic District
Maxwell Hodge, Designer	12/13/2019	1/14/2019	Franklin-Rosemary
Project Description <p>The applicant proposes to renovate the existing Mid Century Modern apartment complex by replacing windows and siding materials on the east and west facades of the buildings, improve the structural stability of interior decks, repair and/or replace the roof, and making site improvements.</p>			
Proposed Findings of Fact <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The existing buildings were constructed in 1965. The applicant believes Edward Walter "Terry" Waugh designed these buildings in the mid-century modern style. Waugh, a South African architect, had been recruited as one of the original professors of modernism at the NC State School of Design. He is also the architect of several houses, schools, and master plans in throughout Chapel Hill and the state.2. Though included in the local Franklin-Rosemary Historic District in 1976, the site is not listed on the National Register of Historic Places.3. On September 10, 2019, the Historic District Commission reviewed a concept plan for this project.4. The applicant proposes to replace the windows on the east and west facades with simple contemporary picture windows. Larger windows will also be installed in the bedrooms to meet egress code requirements.5. The applicant will make modifications to the location of the wood siding on the east and west facades. Where the wood siding has been replaced with vinyl siding on the courtyard facades, the applicant will replace it with new wood siding.6. The applicant will install new stucco panels on the spandrels between the first and second floors of the façade where there will not be wood siding. It will also be used along the ribbon windows.7. The applicant proposes to paint the existing brick.8. The applicant proposes to reconstruct existing masonry walls are made up of either brick or concrete masonry units that are beyond repair.9. The applicant will renovate the existing decks that serve as entryways located in the interior courtyards. Structural repairs will be made, as possible, to maintain the decks as existing. Where the stairways are beyond repair, the applicant will reconstruct the decks. A concrete topping slab will be poured over the wood decking.10. All railings on the decks will be replaced to meet current building codes. The applicant proposes to use horizontal rods that will reflect the horizontality of the existing building. The existing stairs will be repaired and remain, or reconstructed as necessary. The stair railings will match those of the decks.11. The application will construct new building partition walls on the decks and patios along the interior facing facades of the west buildings. They will be constructed of the same wood and stucco materials that are used on the street-facing facades.12. The roof will be repaired or replaced with similar roofing materials as necessary.13. The applicant proposes to repair or remove two existing chimneys on the eastern buildings.			

14. The applicant will install four (4) new skylights, with two (2) more added on the two decks. These are proposed to have a low profile.
15. The applicant will replace the existing street number sign with a similar metal material. The font will be less bold and minimal.
16. The applicant will retain the existing parking area and significant vegetation on the site. No land disturbance is proposed.

Applicable Design Guidelines

Site Features & Plantings (page 11):

1. Retain and preserve site features and plantings that are important in defining the overall historic character of sites and streetscapes within the historic district.
2. Retain and preserve historic relationship between district buildings, structures, or streetscapes and their site features and plantings. It is not appropriate to significantly alter the topography of the district by excavating, grading, or filing.

Walls & Fences (page 17):

7. Introduce compatible new walls and fences, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district. Site new fences and walls in configurations and locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district.
8. Construct new walls and fences in traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, height, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.
9. Introduce contemporary utilitarian walls and fences, if necessary, in rear and side yard locations only and where they do not compromise the historic character of the building, site, or district. It is not appropriate to introduce contemporary vinyl or metal chain link fences in locations that are visible from the street.

Walkways, Driveways, and Offstreet Parking (page 19):

1. Retain and preserve walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas that are important in defining the overall historic character of sites within the historic districts.
2. Retain and preserve the features, materials, patterns, dimensions, details, and configurations of historic walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas.

Signage (page 25):

5. Introduce new signage with care so that the overall historic character of the building, site, and district is not compromised or diminished. Select and site new signs so their location, orientation, height, scale, design, and finish are compatible with the historic district and its human scale.
6. Construct new signage out of traditional materials, such as wood, stone, or metal. It is not appropriate to introduce new signage in contemporary materials, such as plastic, or internally lighted signs that are incompatible with the overall character of the historic district.
7. In the residential areas of the district, install freestanding signs on low posts or bases that are compatible with the pedestrian scale of the historic districts. Mount small identification signs on building facades in locations that do not damage or conceal significant architectural features or details.

Masonry (page 29):

2. Retain and preserve the details and finishes of historic masonry features and surfaces.
3. Protect and maintain masonry features and surfaces through appropriate methods.
7. Replace in kind masonry features and surfaces that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, detail, and finish. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically or economically feasible.
10. It is not appropriate to apply paint or stucco to masonry surfaces that were historically unpainted or uncoated.

Wood (page 31):

1. Retain and preserve wood features that are important in defining the overall historic character of the buildings or site features within the historic districts.
2. Retain and preserve the details and finishes of historic wood features and surfaces.
3. Protect and maintain wood features and surfaces through appropriate methods.
4. Repair deteriorated or damaged wood features and surfaces through recognized preservation methods, such as patching, splicing, consolidating, and reinforcing.
5. Replace in kind wood features and surfaces that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, detail, and finish. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.

Paint & Exterior Color (page 35):

5. Reapply paints or stains to previous painted or stained exterior surfaces in colors that are appropriate to the building and site. It is not appropriate to paint or coat masonry surfaces that were not coated or painted historically.
6. Enhance and reinforce architectural materials and features of a district building and site through the appropriate selection and placement of paint color.

Roofs (page 37):

1. Retain and preserve roofs that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts.
2. Retain and preserve the details, features, and material surfaces of historic roofs.
4. Repair deteriorated or damaged roof features and surfaces through recognized preservation methods for the specific feature or material.
5. Replace in kind roof features and surfaces that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.
8. It is not appropriate to remove character-defining roof features such as chimneys, dormers, built-in gutters, and vents.
9. It is not appropriate to introduce new roof features, such as chimneys, solar collectors, skylights, ventilators, and communication or mechanical equipment on roof slopes that are visible from the street or in locations that compromise the architectural integrity of the building.
10. It is not appropriate to introduce roof features or details to a historic property in an attempt to create a false historical appearance.

Exterior Walls (page 39):

1. Retain and preserve exterior walls that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts.
2. Retain and preserve the details, features, and material surfaces of historic exterior walls.
3. Protect and maintain the details, features, and surfaces of historic exterior walls through appropriate methods.
4. Repair deteriorated or damage exterior wall features and surfaces through recognized preservation methods for the specific feature or material.
5. Replace in kind exterior wall features and surfaces that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.
6. If an exterior wall feature is missing either replace it to match the original feature, based upon physical and documentary evidence, or replace it with a new feature that is compatible in material, design, size, and scale with the building.

7. It is not appropriate to remove historic features and details—such as windows, doors, chimneys, bays, band boards, corner boards, wood shingles, brackets and decorative trimwork—on character-defining walls.
8. It is not appropriate to introduce new exterior wall features—such as windows, doors, chimneys, bays, and communication or mechanical equipment—on exterior walls that are visible from the street or in locations that compromise the architectural integrity of the building.
9. It is not appropriate to cover over or replace historic exterior wall materials—such as clapboards, shingles, bricks, or stucco—with contemporary synthetic coatings or substitute sidings including aluminum, vinyl, and fiber-reinforced cement siding.
10. It is not appropriate to introduce exterior wall features or details to a historic property in an attempt to create a false historical appearance.

Windows & Doors (page 41):

1. Retain and preserve windows and doors that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts.
2. Retain and preserve the details, features, and material surfaces of historic windows and doors.
3. Protect and maintain the details, features, and surfaces of exterior windows and doors through appropriate methods.
4. Repair deteriorated or damaged exterior windows and doors through recognized preservation methods.
5. Replace in kind exterior windows and doors that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.

Utilities & Energy Retrofit (page 49):

2. Improve the energy efficiency of historic buildings through appropriate methods.

Decks (page 57):

3. Limit the size and scale of a deck to minimize its visual impact. It is not appropriate to introduce a deck if it will visually overpower the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.
5. Design and detail decks and any related steps and railings so they are compatible with the historic building in scale, material, configuration, and proportion.

Congruity Findings

Based on the Findings of Facts and the relevant Design Guidelines referenced above, the HDC proposes congruity findings for the following Criteria as specified per LUMO Section 3.6.2(e):

Criterion C: Proposed exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic building and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Criterion D: The architectural detailing, such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and foundation materials, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic building and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Criterion E: Roof shapes, forms, and materials proposed on the building are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on similar buildings within the historic district.

Criterion F: The proportion, shape, positioning and location, pattern and size of any elements of fenestration are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic building and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Criterion H: Appurtenant fixtures and other features such as lighting are ***congruous/incongruous*** with the historic building and historic buildings in the district.

Criterion J: The architectural scale of the new improvements and their architectural detailing are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic building and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission ***approves/denies*** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it ***would/would not be incongruous*** with the special character of the district.

Exhibits

1. [September 10, 2019 Historic District Commission Meeting Materials](#)¹

¹ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4117780&GUID=B2F4861F-E55A-47BE-86DD-0F2A12A5F220>