



Historic District Commission

New Business –Modification to a Certificate of Appropriateness 410-412 North Street (Project #19-008)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT
Anya Grahn, Senior Planner
Becky McDonnell, Planner II
Judy Johnson, Interim Planning Director

| Applicant | Filing Date | Meeting Date(s) | Historic District |
|---|--------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|
| Ricky May | 1/24/2019 | 1/14/2020 | Franklin-Rosemary |
| Project Description <p>The applicant proposes a modification to an approved Certificate of Appropriateness by modifying the fenestration pattern on the façade, the building form of the rear portion of the house, as well as installation of mechanical equipment. He also proposes to modify the height and fenestration pattern of the garage.</p> | | | |
| Proposed Findings of Fact <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The applicant proposes to modify the approved north façade elevation. The approved double-door entry will be replaced with a single paneled door surrounded by sidelights and transom. This will be flanked on either side by two-over-two divided light windows and shutters.2. The vent-less fire place will be moved to the east elevation of the house. No changes to the exterior of the east elevation are proposed.3. Two (2) HVAC units and a dryer vent will be installed on the west elevation of the house.4. The rear addition of the house will be modified by removing the proposed wraparound porch on the north and west sides. New two-over-two divided light windows will be installed beneath the shed roofs on these elevation. Beneath the full-width porch on the east elevation, two smaller rectangular windows will be installed, a single French door, and a two-over-two divided light window.5. The overall height of the garage will be reduced from twenty-eight feet (28') to twenty-seven feet (27'). The approved fenestration pattern of two single garage doors will be replaced with a paneled two-car garage door. On the south elevation, there will be only a single paneled door. The dormers will have a single four-over-four divided light window. The east (rear) elevation will have two side-by-side four-over-four divided light windows above a vent. | | | |
| Applicable Design Guidelines <p><i>New Construction (page 53):</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">3. Design new buildings so that their size and scale do not visually overpower neighboring historic buildings.4. Design new buildings to be compatible in roof form, massing, and overall proportion with neighboring historic buildings.6. Design new buildings and their features to be compatible in scale, materials, proportions, and details with neighboring historic buildings. Select exterior surface materials that are compatible with those of neighboring historic buildings in terms of module, composition, texture, pattern, color, and detail.7. Design a new building so that the placement, shape, scale, size, materials, pattern, and proportion of the window and door openings are compatible with the windows and doors of neighboring historic buildings. <p><i>Utilities & Energy Retrofit (page 49):</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">8. Install mechanical equipment in areas and spaces that require the least amount of alteration to the appearance and historic fabric of the building.9. Minimize the visual impact of the new mechanical and communication equipment and utilities by installing them in inconspicuous locations that are not visible from the street and by screening them from view. It is not appropriate to install condensers, skylights, ventilators, | | | |

solar collectors, and mechanical or communication equipment on roof slopes or building elevations that are visible from the street or in locations that visually compromise the architectural character of the historic building.

Congruity Findings

Based on the Findings of Facts and the relevant Design Guidelines referenced above, the HDC proposes congruity findings for the following Criteria as specified per LUMO Section 3.6.2(e):

Criterion A: The height of the building(s) is ***congruous/incongruous*** in relation to the average height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings.

Criterion F: The proportion, shape, positioning and location, pattern and size of any elements of fenestration are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Criterion G: The general form and proportions of the new house and garage are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Criterion H: Appurtenant fixtures and other features such as the HVAC units are ***congruous/incongruous*** with the historic house and historic sites in the district.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission ***approves/denies*** the modification to the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it ***would/would not be incongruous*** with the special character of the district.

Exhibits

1. [July 9, 2019 Historic District Commission Meeting Materials¹](#)

¹ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3995705&GUID=053B1A97-9CE7-4B1D-994C-C89C1AC3AB90>