



Historic District Commission

Old Business –Certificate of Appropriateness 707 Gimghoul Road (Project #19-123)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT
Anya Grahn, Senior Planner
Becky McDonnell, Planner II
Judy Johnson, Operations Manager

Applicant	Filing Date	Meeting Date(s)	Historic District
Will Johnson Building Company	10/24/2019	11/12/2019, 12/10/2019	Gimghoul
Project Description <p>The historic character of the original 1920s house been significantly altered in the past due to addition and modifications made in the 1940s, 1970s, and 1980s. The applicant proposes to renovate the house, demolish a two-car one-story garage, and build a new three-car garage.</p>			
Proposed Findings of Fact <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Applicant proposes to renovate the existing house, removing two dormers and a second level balcony from the north (rear) elevation in order to expand the second level at the back of the house. The new addition will feature wood or composite siding to match that of the existing house and a new metal standing seam roof.2. The front porch will be repaired. A new gable pediment will be constructed above the entry to the porch. Existing porch's turned posts, brackets, and railing will be removed. The applicant proposes to replace the posts with new fiberglass columns.3. Beneath the front porch, an existing door on the southwest corner of the first floor will be removed and replaced with a new double-hung window.4. A wrought iron railing and new brick steps will be introduced on the first level porch, between the two projecting bays on the north (rear) elevation.5. Existing windows that have deteriorated and no longer function per the floor plans will be replaced with new clad windows.6. The gingerbread detailing on the house's front porch and gables, as well as the garage gable will be removed. The applicant believes these architectural details were added in the 1970s and 1980s as the house was remodeled.7. A new entablature and cornice detail will be introduced on the gables and front porch of the house.8. Existing spindled railings on the second floor balconies will be replaced with painted wood guard railings.9. The existing roofing material will be replaced with asphalt shingle on the main house and standing seam on the projecting bays, second floor addition, and porch roofs.10. The applicant proposes to demolish an existing two-car garage in order to construct a new 1.5-story three-car garage.11. The new garage will be a front-facing T-shaped structure clad in brick and horizontal lap siding matching those of the house. The garage will feature two dormers on the east and west elevations, modeled after the dormers found on the third story of the house. A decorative cupola will sit atop the garage roof; the cupola will match the existing garage's cupola.12. Directly in front of (to the south of) the garage, the existing driveway area will be expanded to create a driveway pad and turn around area. This area will feature brick pavers, while the driveway will remain Chapel Hill gravel.13. A new covered brick walkway consisting of brick retaining walls and columns supporting a new entablature and flat roof will connect the existing house to the garage.14. A new stone patio area surrounded by Chapel Hill fieldstone walls measuring 18 inches in height is proposed between the house and the garage.			

15. New brick paver walkways will be constructed between the house, garage, and stone patio area.
16. The existing generator will be moved from the east side of the property to the northeast corner of the new garage and existing HVAC compressors will be relocated to the northeast corner of the house. These utilities will be screened by the house and garage so they are not visible from the public right-of-way.
17. Gutters will be replaced throughout the house and new garage with new K-style gutters or half-round gutters.

Applicable Design Guidelines

Walkways, Driveways, & Offstreet Parking (page 19):

2. Retain and preserve the features, materials, patterns, dimensions, details, and configuration of historic walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas.
7. Introduce compatible new walls and fences, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district. Site new walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas in locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district and locate them so the general topography of the site and mature trees and other significant site features are not altered, damaged, or lost.
9. Construct new walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas in traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.

Garages & Accessory Structures (page 21):

7. Introduce compatible new garages and accessory structures, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district. Site new garages or accessory structures in traditional locations that are compatible with the character of the building and site. Design them to be compatible with the main house in material, form, scale, and detail. Maintain the traditional height, proportion, and orientation of garages and accessory structures in the district.

Exterior Lighting (page 23):

5. Introduce new exterior lighting fixtures with care so that the overall historic character of the building, site, and district is not compromised or diminished. Select and site new lighting fixtures so their location, orientation, height, brightness, scale, and design are compatible with the historic district and its human scale.

Roofs (page 37):

5. Replace in kind roof features and surfaces that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.
7. Introduce new gutters and downspouts, as needed, with care so that no architectural features are damaged or lost. Select gutters and downspouts that are painted or coated with a factory finish in a color that is appropriate to the building (unless they are copper). Replace half-round and cylindrical downspouts in kind.

Exterior Walls (page 39):

1. Retain and preserve exterior walls that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts.
8. It is not appropriate to introduce new exterior wall features—such as windows, doors, chimneys, bays, and communication or mechanical equipment—on exterior walls that are visible from the street or in locations that compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

Windows & Doors (page 41):

5. Replace in kind exterior windows and doors that are too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.

Porches, Entrances, and Balconies (page 43):

1. Retain and preserve porches, entrances, and balconies that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts.
5. Replace in kind any feature or portion of a porch, entrance, or balcony that is too deteriorated to repair, matching the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.
6. If a porch, entrance, or balcony is missing either replace it to match the original feature, based upon physical and documentary evidence, or replace it with a new feature that is compatible in material, design, size, and scale with the building.

Utilities & Energy Retrofit (page 49):

8. Install mechanical equipment in areas and spaces that require the least amount of alteration to the appearance and historic fabric of the building.
9. Minimize the visual impact of new mechanical and communication equipment and utilities by installing them in inconspicuous locations that are not visible from the street and by screening them from view. It is not appropriate to install condensers, skylights, ventilators, solar collectors, and mechanical or communication equipment on roof slopes or building elevations that are visible from the street or in locations that visually compromise the architectural character of the historic building.

Additions (page 55):

1. Introduce additions in locations that are not visible from the street—usually on rear elevations, inset from either rear building corner. Locate additions carefully so they do not damage or conceal significant building features or details. It is not appropriate to introduce an addition if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, such as a porch or mature tree.
3. Limit the size and scale of an addition to minimize its visual impact. It's not appropriate to introduce an addition if it will visually overpower the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.
4. Design an addition so it is compatible with the historic building in roof form, massing, and overall proportion.
5. Design an addition and its features so they are compatible in scale, materials, proportions, and details with the historic building. Select exterior surface materials that are compatible with those of the historic building in terms of module, composition, texture, pattern, color, and detail.
6. Design an addition so it is compatible with yet discernible from the historic building.
7. Maintain and protect significant site features from damage during or as a consequence of related site work or construction.

Congruity Findings

Based on the Findings of Facts and the relevant Design Guidelines referenced above, the HDC proposes congruity findings for the following Criteria as specified per LUMO Section 3.6.2(e):

Criterion A: The height of the building(s) is ***congruous/incongruous*** in relation to the average height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings.

Criterion B: The setback and placement on the lot of the new addition and garage is ***congruous/incongruous*** in relation to the average setback and placement of houses and accessory buildings on the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings.

Criterion C: Proposed exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion D: The architectural detailing, such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and foundation materials, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic houses within the historic district.

Criterion E: Roof shapes, forms, and materials proposed on the new addition and garage are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on similar buildings within the historic district.

Criterion F: The proportion, shape, positioning and location, pattern and size of any elements of fenestration are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Criterion G: The general form and proportions of the new addition and garage are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Criterion H: Appurtenant fixtures and other features such as lighting are ***congruous/incongruous*** with the historic house and historic sites in the district.

Criterion J: The architectural scale of the new addition, garage, and their architectural detailing are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found on the historic house and those found on historic buildings within the historic district.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission ***approves/denies*** the modification to the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it ***would/would not be incongruous*** with the special character of the district.

Exhibits

1. [November 12, 2019 Historic District Commission Meeting Materials](#)¹

¹ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4208491&GUID=DD726C1A-D80B-4528-913B-2DABCDD0CD31&Options=&Search=>