



## Historic District Commission

### Consent Item<sup>1</sup> – After-the-Fact Certificate of Appropriateness 716 Gimghoul Road (Project #19-095)

#### Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT  
Anya Grahn, Senior Planner  
Becky McDonnell, Planner II  
Judy Johnson, Operations Manager

<b>Applicant</b>	<b>Meeting Date(s)</b>	<b>Historic District</b>
Benjamin Brodey	9/10/2019	Gimghoul
<b>Project Description</b> After-the-fact Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for reconstruction of a pergola's floor structure, posts, and modification of the roof pitch. The applicant is also requesting approval to screen in the pergola.		
<b>Proposed Findings of Fact</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. The applicant reconstructed an existing pergola, replacing the existing floor decking, replacing the posts, and rebuilding the roof structure with an approximately 2:12 pitch to improve drainage.</li><li>2. As part of these improvements, the floor structure and roof overhangs of the pergola were expanded 16-inches further into the side yard setbacks, violating the Land Use Management Ordinance (LUMO). The applicant proposes to remove the 16-inches of the extended roof and floor decking to comply with the LUMO.</li><li>3. A 36-inch paneled knee wall constructed of 6-inch by 1.25-inch boards is proposed to wrap the north, south, and east sides of the pergola. Screened frames will be added above the knee wall between the posts.</li><li>4. The west-facing elevation will consist of framed, screened opening between the timber posts. Two 36-inch by 82-inch screen doors will be added to the pergola's façade.</li><li>5. The applicant proposes to install two (2) ceiling fans with solid wood blades on the ceiling of the pergola.</li></ol>		
<b>Applicable Design Guidelines</b> <i>Garages &amp; Accessory Structures</i> (page 20): <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>7. Introduce compatible new garages and accessory structures, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district. Site new garages or accessory structures in traditional locations that are compatible with the character of the building and site. Design them to be compatible with the main house in material, form, scale, and detail. Maintain the traditional height, proportion, and orientation of garages and accessory structures in the district.</li></ol> <i>Exterior Lighting</i> (page 23): <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>5. Introduce new exterior lighting fixtures with care so that the overall historic character of the building, site, and district is not compromised or diminished. Select and site new lighting fixtures so their location, orientation, height, brightness, scale, and human design are compatible with the historic district and its human scale.</li></ol>		

<sup>1</sup> NOTE: This is a consent agenda item. Items submitted as evidence in applications and below statements of potential findings of fact and conclusions of law are sufficient for action by the commission regarding an application. The following report includes a statement of application, pertinent LUMO Sections, findings of fact, justification, and a proposed motion. Land Use Management Ordinance section 3.6.2 (d)(3) Public Hearing states that "in cases where the commission deems it necessary, it may hold a public hearing."

### **Congruity Findings**

Based on the Findings of Facts and the relevant Design Guidelines referenced above, the HDC proposes congruity findings for the following Criteria as specified per LUMO Section 3.6.2(e):

Criterion A: The height of the new pergola will be **congruous** to the average height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings. As an accessory structure, its low height has allowed it to be subordinate to the historic house.

Criterion B: The setback and placement on the lot of the pergola will be **congruous** to the average setback and placement of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings. The location of the pergola at the back of the property is appropriate for an accessory building such as this.

Criterion C: The exterior construction materials, including the wood timbers, decking, and fiberglass screening will be **congruous** with materials traditionally seen in the historic district. It is simple in design so as not to detract from the simple, Colonial Revival style of the associated house.

Criterion E: The overall roof shape, form, and materials used on the pergola are **congruous** with the material used to construct accessory, garden structures in the historic district.

Criterion G: The general form and proportions of the pergola are **congruous** with those found in the Historic District. Its simple design allows it to remain subordinate to the house.

Criterion H: Appurtenant fixtures and other features such as lighting are **congruous** with those seen in the historic district. The wood and bronze material of the proposed ceiling fans will largely fade from visibility due to the fiberglass screening.

Criterion J: The architectural scale of the pergola is **congruous** with accessory structures in the historic district. It is an accessory garden building, intended to be small in scale and not be visible from the street. The pergola will remain subordinate to the historic house.

### **Decision**

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission **approves** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it **would not be incongruous** with the special character of the district.