

MEMORANDUM

TO: Chapel Hill Historic District Commission

FROM: Britany Waddell, Planning Director
Anya Grahn-Federmack, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner II

SUBJECT: 403 McCauley Street: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)
(PIN 9788-24-2526, HDC-23-3)

FILING DATE: February 14, 2023

DATE: March 23, 2023

COA SUMMARY

The applicant, Pearl Arnold, on behalf of George Jenne and Kelly McChesney, requests a COA for the construction of a two-story rear addition, covered patio, and new deck.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The proposed location is zoned Residential-4 (R-4) and is in the Cameron-McCauley Historic District.

BACKGROUND

February 14, 2023	The applicant submits a COA application for the work described above.
-------------------	---

DISCUSSION

The applicant, Pearl Arnold, on behalf of George Jenne and Kelly McChesney, requests a COA for the following:

- Construction of a new two-story rear addition, connected to the house by a breezeway that features a basement-level covered patio
- Design of a deck between the historic house and new addition

If the COA is granted for the exterior changes, the applicant would then be required to obtain any necessary zoning compliance and building permits from the Town.

NOTE

The [Chapel Hill Historic Districts Design Principles and Standards](https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf)¹ are incorporated into the record by reference.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment 1 – Written Decision (approving the COA)

¹https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

2. [Special Character Essay – Cameron-McCauley Historic District \(pages 31-35\)](#)²
3. Application Materials
4. Plans

²https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

WRITTEN DECISION - APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

WRITTEN DECISION APPROVING AN APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 403 MCCAULEY STREET (PIN 9788-24-2526; PROJECT # HDC-23-3)

WHEREAS, having reviewed the applicant's argument and various documents and other evidence submitted at the hearing on this matter, and having heard public comment on the application, the Historic District Commission (HDC) finds as facts those facts summarized by the Chair at the conclusion of the Commission's hearing of this matter and hereby incorporates them by reference as Commission Findings of Fact; and finds that such facts are supported by competent, material, and substantial evidence presented to the Commission; and

BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic District Commission of the Town of Chapel Hill that, having considered the requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) at 403 McCauley Street, requested by applicant, Pearl Arnold, on behalf of George Jenne and Kelly McChesney, for the following:

- Construction of a new two-story rear addition, connected to the house by a breezeway that features a basement-level covered patio
- Design of a deck between the historic house and new addition

In accord with the improvements on the attached site plan, and identified as Orange County Property Identifier Number 9788-24-2526, the Board makes the following finding:

1. The requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is not incongruous with the special character of the Cameron-McCauley Historic District.

The following Design Standards apply to the Application:

4.8 Additions (pages 134-136)

4.8.1. Introduce compatible new additions, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district.

4.8.2. Site additions in locations that are compatible with the character of the building and site and are minimally visible from the street, typically on rear elevations. Additions may be located on side elevations only when rear setbacks do not allow for enough space and if additions have been carefully designed to retain the spacing of buildings in the district and to minimize their impact on the rhythm of the streetscape or character defining open spaces. Additions are never permitted on front facades.

4.8.3. Site additions to be consistent with additions in the immediate surroundings and to retain the orientation of the existing building as well as the spacing between and distance from other buildings in the immediate surroundings when the siting and spacing are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Maintain the original orientation of the structure with primary entrances on the front façade of the building.

4.8.4. Design and site additions so they do not compromise the overall historic character of the site, including its topography, significant site features, and distinctive views. Do not introduce an addition

if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, such as a porch, or if it necessitates the relocation or demolition of historic garages or accessory buildings.

4.8.5. Design and locate additions so that, as much as possible, historic features and details—including windows, doors, chimneys, bays, corner boards, wood shingles, brackets and decorative trim—are not removed or concealed.

4.8.6. Design additions so that their size, scale, and form are compatible with the existing building and do not visually overpower the building on this or adjacent sites.

4.8.7. Design additions to be compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building in their location, size, scale, and building and roof form.

- a. Limit the size and scale of additions to minimize their visual impact and maintain private open spaces on the site.
- b. Match the foundation height, style, and materials of an addition to the existing building.
- c. Differentiate the addition from the wall plane of the existing building and preserve existing corner boards and trim by stepping back the wall plane of the addition and/or utilizing a hyphen or other small-scale transitional element to connect the addition to the existing building.
- d. Where additions compete in size with the original building, include a hyphen or small-scale connecting wing or to separate the historic building from its new addition.
- e. Utilize similar roof forms and pitches for building additions and, when possible, align the height of the eave line of a new addition with the eave line of the existing building.
- f. Maintain the roof pitch and ridgeline of the existing building. Do not alter or raise the roof ridge of existing buildings in order to accommodate additions. Roof ridges for additions should be secondary to (lower than) those of the main structure.

4.8.8. Design additions using contemporary architecture provided they adhere to the characteristics of the historic district including: materials, siting and setbacks, scale, height, form, proportion, and details.

4.8.9. Minimize damage to the historic building by constructing additions to be structurally self-supporting, where feasible, and attach them to the original building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric. Attach additions in such a manner that, if additions were removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic building would be unimpaired.

4.8.10. Design additions and their features with materials that are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building and historic buildings within the immediate surroundings when the features and materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

- a. Select exterior materials and finishes that are compatible with the original building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color.
- b. Use traditional materials in conventional ways so that additions are in harmony with the buildings in the historic district (i.e., wood siding applied horizontally).
- c. Smooth-faced cementitious or composite siding that matches the traditional dimension of wood siding is permitted for additions.

- d. Do not use synthetic (vinyl, aluminum, PVC, plastic, resin) siding and details on additions within the historic districts unless it can be demonstrated that the material and finishes are compatible with the original building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color.

4.8.11. Design additions and their features with architectural details that are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building and historic buildings within the immediate surroundings when the features and materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

- a. Incorporate materials and details derived from the primary structure.
- b. Extend the hierarchy of architectural details to the addition with embellishments and detailing simplified on less visible side and rear elevations.

4.8.12. Design additions so that the location, shape, scale, size, materials, pattern, and proportion of windows and doors are compatible with the windows and doors of the existing building and with historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when these elements of doors and windows are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Doors and windows should follow the standards for New Construction: Doors and Windows.

4.8.13. Design porches so that the location, shape, scale, size, materials, and details are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, porches on the existing building. Porches should follow the standards for New Construction: Porches.

4.8.14. Maintain and protect significant site features from damage during or as a consequence of related site work or construction.

4.10 Decks & Patios (page 143)

4.10.1. Locate decks and patios on rear elevations or in inconspicuous areas that are minimally visible from the public right-of-way.

4.10.2. Locate decks and patios in locations that do not damage or conceal significant building or site features or details. Do not introduce a deck or patio if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, including porches, projecting bays or wings, historic garages, accessory buildings, and retaining walls.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission hereby grants the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accord with the plan listed above and the following conditions:

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire, and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Signed - Historic District Commission Chair, Sean Murphy

This, the 23rd day of March, 2023.