

MEMORANDUM

TO: Chapel Hill Historic District Commission

FROM: Colleen Willger, Planning Director
Anya Grahn, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner II

SUBJECT: 234 McCauley Street: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)
(PIN 9788-25-8163, HDC-22-5)

FILING DATE: September 20, 2022

DATE: October 11, 2022

COA SUMMARY

The applicant, Ashlee Hicks, requests a COA to replace the existing failing shingles with non-straited standing-seam metal shingles on low pitch areas of the roof including the front porch, back dormer, and rear porch.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The subject lot is zoned Residential-4 (R-4) and is in the Cameron-McCauley Historic District.

BACKGROUND

September 20, 2022	The applicant submits a COA application for the work described above.
--------------------	---

DISCUSSION

The applicant is requesting a COA to **allow** the replacement of existing failing shingles with corrugated metal panels on low pitch areas of the roof including the front porch, back dormer, and rear porch as shown in the application materials (Attachment 4).

If the COA is granted for the exterior changes, the applicant would then be required to obtain any necessary zoning compliance and building permits from the Town.

NOTE

The [*Chapel Hill Historic Districts Design Principles and Standards*](#)¹ are incorporated into the record by reference.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment 1 – Written Decision (approving the COA)
2. History

¹https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

3. [Special Character Essay – Cameron-McCauley Historic District \(pages 31-35\)](#)²
4. Application Materials

²https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

WRITTEN DECISION - APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

WRITTEN DECISION APPROVING AN APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 234 MCCAULEY STREET (PIN 9788-25-8163, PROJECT # HDC-22-5)

WHEREAS, having reviewed the applicant's argument and various documents and other evidence submitted at the hearing on this matter, and having heard public comment on the application, the Historic District Commission (HDC) finds as facts those facts summarized by the Chair at the conclusion of the Commission's hearing of this matter and hereby incorporates them by reference as Commission Findings of Fact; and finds that such facts are supported by competent, material, and substantial evidence presented to the Commission; and

BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic District Commission of the Town of Chapel Hill that, having considered the requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) at 234 McCauley Street, requested by Ashlee Hicks, to allow:

- Replacing existing failing shingles with corrugated metal panels on low pitch areas of the roof including the front porch, back dormer, and rear porch.

In accord with the improvements on the attached site plan, and identified as Orange County Property Identifier Number 9788-25-8163, the Board makes the following finding:

1. The requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is not incongruous with the special character of the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

The following Design Standards apply to the Application:

3.1 Roofs, Gutters, & Chimneys: Standards) page 81)

3.1.1. Retain and preserve roof shapes, materials, and decorative and functional features that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts. These include, but are not limited to, roof height, form, shape, pitch, and overhang; roof materials and functional features including shingles, flashing, vents, and gutters; and decorative features including dormers, chimneys, turrets, spires, cupolas, and balustrades.

3.1.5. If deterioration necessitates the replacement of an entire roof surface, replacement surfaces should match the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material (including composite shingle, synthetic slate, and wide-pan matte-finish metal roofing) only if the replacement material is compatible with the design, size, and scale of the building.

- a. Do not replace historic standing-seam, pressed metal, or asphalt-shingled roofs with multi-rib metal roofing.
- b. Do not install built-up or rubber roofing in locations that are visible from the street.

3.1.9. Do not remove or conceal character-defining roof features such as chimneys or chimney pots, dormers, built-in gutters, and vents, especially on a primary or other highly visible elevation.

3.1.10. Do not introduce roof features or details to a building or site that would create a false historical appearance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission hereby grants the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accord with the plan listed above and the following conditions:

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire, and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Signed - Historic District Commission Chair, Sean Murphy

This, the 11th day of October, 2022.