

## **MEMORANDUM**

TO: Chapel Hill Historic District Commission

FROM: Colleen Willger, Planning Director  
Anya Grahn, Principal Planner  
Charnika Harrell, Planner I

SUBJECT: 379 Tenney Circle: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)  
(PIN 9788698624, COA-22-21)

FILING DATE: May 16, 2022; Amendment filed June 21, 2022

DATE: July 12, 2022

### **COA SUMMARY**

On June 13, 2022, the Historic District Commission (HDC) approved a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to replace the asphalt shingle roof with architectural grade asphalt shingles; add two new gabled dormers on the façade; demolish the existing garage and replace it with a gravel parking area; and relocate an electrical panel. The applicants, Beril and Michael Ulku-Steiner request an amendment to the COA for:

- Modifying the height and width of the HDC-approved dormers on the front façade to allow for emergency egress windows.
- Extending the roofline of the rear dormer so that the exterior dormer wall aligns with the south wall of the house. The new dormer will have fiberglass-clad casement windows.
- Replacing the existing first floor windows with 8-foot-tall fiberglass-clad sliding patio doors on the south (rear) elevation.
- Extending the existing deck on the west elevation to the south wall of the house to create a screen porch with a 7-foot 4-inch-tall wood screen door.
- Constructing a new wood deck with railings across the south (rear) elevation of the house.
- Relocating the existing basement door and HVAC unit from the south (rear) elevation to the west (side) elevation. New below grade stairs will be constructed to access the basement.
- Replacing an existing door with two small windows on the first floor of the west (side) elevation and relocating the door to an existing window opening.
- Adding a window to the east (side) elevation.
- Adding a kitchen vent to the west (side) elevation.

### **EXISTING CONDITIONS**

The subject lot is zoned Residential-1 (R-1) and is located in the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

## BACKGROUND

May 16, 2022	The applicant submits a COA application to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Replace the 22-year-old asphalt shingle roof with a new architectural grade asphalt shingle roof</li><li>• Add two new gabled dormers on the façade</li><li>• Demolish the existing garage and replace with gravel parking area</li><li>• Relocate an electrical panel</li></ul>
June 13, 2022	HDC reviews the proposed scope of work and grants a COA for the proposed scope of work. [See <a href="#">Meeting Materials</a> + <a href="#">Video</a> <sup>1</sup> .]
June 21, 2022	The applicant submits a request for an amendment to the approved COA.

## DISCUSSION

The applicant is requesting to amend an approved COA to **allow**:

- Modifying the height and width of the HDC-approved dormers on the front façade to allow for emergency egress windows.
- Extending the roofline of the rear dormer so that the exterior dormer wall aligns with the south wall of the house. The new dormer will have fiberglass-clad casement windows.
- Replacing the existing first floor windows with 8-foot-tall fiberglass-clad sliding patio doors on the south (rear) elevation.
- Extending the existing deck on the west elevation to the south wall of the house to create a screen porch with a 7-foot 4-inch-tall wood screen door.
- Constructing a new wood deck with railings across the south (rear) elevation of the house.
- Relocating the existing basement door and HVAC unit from the south (rear) elevation to the west (side) elevation. New below grade stairs will be constructed to access the basement.
- Replacing an existing door with two small windows on the first floor of the west (side) elevation and relocating the door to an existing window opening.
- Adding a window to the east (side) elevation.
- Adding a kitchen vent to the west (side) elevation.

The site design is shown in the application materials (Attachment 3).

If the COA is granted for the exterior changes, the applicants would then be required to obtain any necessary zoning compliance and building permits from the Town.

## NOTE

The [Chapel Hill Historic Districts Design Principles and Standards](#)<sup>2</sup> are incorporated into the record by reference.

---

<sup>1</sup> [https://chapelhill.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view\\_id=7&clip\\_id=5806](https://chapelhill.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view_id=7&clip_id=5806)

<sup>2</sup> [https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large\\_docs/historic\\_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf](https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf)

## ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment 1 – Written Decision (approving the COA)
2. [Special Character Essay – Franklin-Rosemary Historic District \(pages 25-29\)](#)<sup>3</sup>
3. Application Materials
4. [HDC COA Application Materials, 6.13.2022](#)<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup>[https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large\\_docs/historic\\_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf](https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=5662571&GUID=0C7E4CED-3ADA-4C07-A806-13ECF2F1415F>

**WRITTEN DECISION - APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

**WRITTEN DECISION APPROVING AN APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 379 TENNEY CIRCLE (PIN 9788-69-8624, PROJECT #22-21)**

WHEREAS, having reviewed the applicant's argument and various documents and other evidence submitted at the hearing on this matter, and having heard public comment on the application, the Historic District Commission (HDC) finds as facts those facts summarized by the Chair at the conclusion of the Commission's hearing of this matter and hereby incorporates them by reference as Commission Findings of Fact; and finds that such facts are supported by competent, material, and substantial evidence presented to the Commission; and

BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic District Commission of the Town of Chapel Hill that, having considered the requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) at 379 Tenney Circle, requested by Beril and Michael Ulku-Steiner on behalf of Grubb Properties, to allow:

- Modifying the height and width of the HDC-approved dormers on the front façade to allow for emergency egress windows.
- Extending the roofline of the rear dormer so that the exterior dormer wall aligns with the south wall of the house. The new dormer will have fiberglass-clad casement windows.
- Replacing the existing first floor windows with 8-foot-tall fiberglass-clad sliding patio doors on the south (rear) elevation.
- Extending the existing deck on the west elevation to the south wall of the house to create a screen porch with a 7-foot 4-inch-tall wood screen door.
- Constructing a new wood deck with railings across the south (rear) elevation of the house.
- Relocating the existing basement door and HVAC unit from the south (rear) elevation to the west (side) elevation. New below grade stairs will be constructed to access the basement.
- Replacing an existing door with two small windows on the first floor of the west (side) elevation and relocating the door to an existing window opening.
- Adding a window to the east (side) elevation.
- Adding a kitchen vent to the west (side) elevation.

In accord with the improvements on the attached site plan, and identified as Orange County Property Identifier Number 9788-69-8624, the Board makes the following finding:

1. The requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is not incongruous with the special character of the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

The following Design Standards apply to the Application:

### *3.3 Exterior Walls, Trim, & Ornamentation (page 87):*

3.3.7. Locate new exterior wall features, such as windows, doors, chimneys, bays, and communication or mechanical equipment, on exterior walls that are not visible from the street or in locations that do not compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

### *3.4 Windows & Shutters (pages 90-91):*

3.4.6. If new window openings are necessary, when possible, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials, or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.4.10. Do not install windows with two-dimensional simulations of pane subdivisions, such as snap-in muntins. If not true divided light, glazing should have three-dimensional grills affixed to both the interior and exterior of the window with shadow bars between insulated glass panes.

3.4.11. Do not install vinyl and vinyl-clad windows in the historic district.

3.4.12. Do not replace clear glazing with tinted glazing.

3.4.13. Install shutters, whether operable or fixed, where there is physical or documentary evidence of shutters having existed, matching the original shutters in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Shutters should be proportional to the opening and all shutters, whether operable or fixed in place, should have operable hardware including hinges and holdbacks.

3.4.15. Do not introduce window features or details, including shutters, to a building that would create a false historical appearance.

### *3.5 Exterior Doors (Pages 94-95):*

3.5.7. If new doors are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials, or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.5.11. Do not install new sidelights or transoms with two-dimensional simulations of pane subdivisions, such as snap -in muntins. If not true divided light, glazing should have three-dimensional grills affixed to both the interior and exterior of the window with shadow bars between insulated glass panes.

3.5.12. Do not install vinyl and vinyl-clad sidelights or transoms in the historic district. 3.5.13. Do not introduce exterior doors or entrance features to a building that would create a false historical appearance.

### *3.6 Porches, Entrances, & Balconies (pages 98-99):*

3.6.6. If new porches or entrances are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.6.8. Do not remove, screen, or enclose a porch, entrance, or balcony on a primary, street-facing elevation. a. Consider screening a porch or balcony on a side or rear elevation only if the design will preserve the historic character of the porch or balcony. b. Consider enclosing a porch or balcony on rear elevation only if the design will preserve the historic character of the porch or balcony.

3.6.10. Do not introduce porch, entrance, or balcony features or details to a building that would create a false historical appearance.

#### *4.3 Roof Form, Materials & Details (page 120):*

4.3.1. Design new roofs to be compatible in form, slope, and orientation with historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when the form, slope, and orientation are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

4.3.5. Design dormers to be compatible with the architectural style of the house in their size, scale, and roof form so that they do not visually overpower the building on this or adjacent sites.

- a. The number and size of dormers shall be limited on a roof, such that the primary roof form retains its prominence.
- b. Utilize similar roof forms and pitches for dormers. Gabled, hipped, or shed dormers are appropriate for most structures.
- c. Roof ridges for dormers must be secondary to (lower than) those of the main structure and set in from the eave of the building.

4.3.8. Install condensers, skylights, ventilators, antennas, satellite dishes, and mechanical or communication equipment on roof slopes or building elevations that are not visible from the street or in locations that do not visually compromise the architectural character of the building.

#### *4.9 Dormers (page 139-140):*

4.9.4. Design dormers to be compatible with the existing building in their size, scale, and roof form so that they do not visually overpower the building on this or adjacent sites.

- a. The number and size of dormers shall be limited on a roof, such that the primary roof form remains prominent.
- b. Utilize similar roof forms and pitches for dormers. Gabled, hipped, or shed dormers are appropriate for most structures.
- c. Roof ridges for dormers must be secondary to (lower than) those of the main structure and set in from the eave of the building.
- d. Maintain the roof pitch and ridgeline of the existing building. Do not alter or raise the roof ridge of existing buildings in order to accommodate dormers.

4.9.5. Design dormers with materials that are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building and historic buildings within the immediate surroundings when the materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

- a. Select exterior materials and finishes that are compatible with the original building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color.
- b. Use traditional materials in conventional ways so that additions are in harmony with the buildings in the historic district (i.e. wood siding applied horizontally).
- c. Smooth-faced cementitious or composite siding that matches the traditional dimension of wood siding is permitted for new dormers.
- d. It is generally inappropriate to use synthetic (vinyl, aluminum, PVC, plastic, resin, fiberboard) siding and details on new dormers within the historic districts unless it can be

demonstrated that the material and finishes are compatible with the original building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color.

- e. Whenever possible, match new roof materials to those on the existing house.

4.9.6. Design dormers with architectural details that are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building.

- a. The style of the dormer should relate to the style of the house.
- b. Incorporate materials and details derived from the primary structure.
- c. Utilize eave designs and materials that complement the architecture of the existing house.
- d. Extend the architectural hierarchy of architectural details to the addition with architectural embellishments and detailing simplified on less visible side and rear elevations.

4.9.7. Design dormers so that the location, shape, scale, size, materials, pattern, and proportion of windows are compatible with the windows of the existing building and with historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when these elements of windows are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Windows should follow the standards for New Construction: Doors and Windows.

4.9.8. Do not obscure, cover, or remove historic features when adding a dormer.

#### *4.10 Decks & Patios (Page 143):*

4.10.1. Locate decks and patios on rear elevations or in inconspicuous areas that are minimally visible from the public right-of-way.

4.10.2. Locate decks and patios in locations that do not damage or conceal significant building or site features or details. Do not introduce a deck or patio if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, including porches, projecting bays or wings, historic garages, accessory buildings, and retaining walls.

4.10.3. Retain and preserve historic building materials and trim and minimize the visual impact of a deck or patio by designing them to be inset from the building's corners.

4.10.4. Limit the size and scale of decks and patios to minimize their visual impact. Do not introduce a deck or patio if it will visually overpower the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.

4.10.5. Align decks with the building's first floor. For sites with steep topography or high foundations, consider multilevel decks that step down to follow the topography of the site.

4.10.6. Design and detail decks and any related steps and railings to be compatible with the historic building in scale, material, configuration, and proportion. Consider designing deck piers and foundation infill to relate to the house in the same way that a porch would. However, avoid replicating historic porch posts and railings for contemporary, uncovered decks.

4.10.7. Construct decks of wood or substitute materials that visually replicate wood. When visible from the street, construct patios in traditional materials—including red brick, flagstone, and Chapel Hill grit.

4.10.8. Minimize damage to the historic building by designing decks and patios to be structurally self-supporting. Attach decks to the building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric and

to allow for their removal in the future. Retain a planting strip between patios and building foundations to allow for proper drainage.

4.10.9. Screen the structural framing of decks with foundation plantings, lattice, or other compatible screening materials.

4.10.10. Maintain and protect significant site features from damage during or as a consequence of deck-or patio related site work or construction.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission hereby grants the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accord with the plan listed above and the following conditions:

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

---

Signed - Historic District Commission Chair, Sean Murphy

This, the 12<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2022.