



## Historic District Commission

### Regular Agenda – Certificate of Appropriateness 211 Glenburnie Street (Project #COA-22-16)

#### Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT  
Anya Grahn, Principal Planner  
Charnika Harrell, Planner I  
Judy Johnson, Assistant Planning Director  
Colleen Willger, Planning Director

<b>Applicant</b>	<b>Filing Date</b>	<b>Meeting Date(s)</b>	<b>Historic District</b>
Fred Belledin on behalf of Scott and Sharon Fields	4/12/2022	5/10/2022	Franklin-Rosemary
<b>Project Description</b> <p>The applicant proposes to renovate the existing house, including replacing the existing wood windows and modifications to the fenestration patterns, extending the front porch, building a new rear deck, and other site improvements. The applicant also proposes to reconstruct the existing garage and relocate it outside of the setback.</p>			
<b>Proposed Findings of Fact</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. The c.1920 house and garage are listed as contributing on the National Register of Historic Places.</li><li>2. The applicant proposes to do maintenance work on the house, including restoring the wood siding trim, and balustrades, repointing the brick foundation wall, restoring the brick chimney, wood doors, wood porch elements, repairing the fieldstone site wall around both Lots 1 and 2.</li><li>3. The existing asphalt shingle roofing is not original. The applicant intends to replace it with new architectural grade asphalt shingles with copper or zinc flashing and drip edges. New K-style gutters and downspouts will be installed, matching the color of the house trim.</li><li>4. The applicant proposes to replace the existing wood windows in-kind, matching the sizes, muntin patterns, and painted wood material. The windows will have new simulated divided light profiles.</li><li>5. The existing tongue and groove wood decking of the porch will be replaced with new, painted tongue and groove PVC matching its appearance.</li><li>6. The applicant proposes to remove an existing second floor balcony door on the west (side) elevation, relocating it to the north (front) elevation where it will replace an existing window opening.</li><li>7. On the south (rear) elevation, the applicant proposes to modify two existing window openings, introduce two new window openings, and one skylight.</li><li>8. On the west (side) elevation, the applicant will remove a non-original exterior door on the first floor and reinstall it in an existing window opening. An existing window will be replaced with a new double-door with transom and a new double window will be incorporated.</li><li>9. The applicant has found that the existing porches are not original to the house. They propose to lower the existing brick knee walls to floor level and replace them with new painted wood balustrades, matching those found on the second-floor balconies. A new uncovered porch will wrap the northwest side of the house, connecting the front and side porches.</li><li>10. A new deck is proposed on the south (rear) elevation. It will have a wood structure and IPE or equivalent deck boards.</li><li>11. The applicant has found that the existing garage is not structurally sound and is unlikely to survive lifting and relocation. Instead, the applicant proposes to deconstruct the garage, salvage reusable materials, and reconstruct the garage in its existing dimensions. Once reconstructed, the new garage will include a snap lock standing seam metal roof, new wood doors and windows at existing openings, and new overhead garage doors.</li><li>12. The applicant proposes to replace the existing gravel parking pad with new brick paving in a herringbone pattern. Fieldstone edging will be incorporated along the existing gravel drive.</li></ol>			

13. New walkways of brick pavers, blue stone, and fieldstone-edged gravel walks will be constructed. Gardens will be organized around brick patios and gravel gathering spaces. A pergola, fountain, and garden benches are proposed.
14. The applicant also proposes to construct two pierced brick walls in the rear and side yards to create an enclosed garden. The walls will measure no more than 6 feet in height.

### **Applicable Design Standards**

#### **1.1 Site Features (page 42):**

- 1.1.7. Introduce new site features to be compatible in scale, design, and materials with the overall historic character of the site and district. Utilize traditional materials in the construction of benches, terraces, gazebos, trellises, fences, and walls.
- 1.1.8. Introduce contemporary site features—including playground equipment and swimming pools—in locations that do not diminish or compromise the overall character of the site and district, typically in rear yards or other locations not visible from the street.

#### **1.3 Walls & Fences (pages 48-49):**

- 1.3.6. Site new walls and fences in configurations and locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district and consistent with the location and height of other walls and fences in the district.
- 1.3.7. Construct new walls using traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, height, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.
  - a. Walls in front and side yards should generally not exceed 30" and should be constructed of red brick or fieldstone.
  - b. Walls constructed of cut stone, bare concrete block, or with thin stone veneers applied to concrete or other structural block are not appropriate in locations visible from the street.
- 1.3.9. Introduce contemporary utilitarian walls and fences in rear yards only where they do not compromise the historic character of the building, site, or district.
  - a. Wood, composite, or chain link fences exceeding 30" in height should be relegated to rear yards, beginning beyond the rear corner of the main block of the building and should be screened with landscaping materials as much as possible.
  - b. Sites with significant variations in topography should consider segmented walls and fences that step up and down to follow the topography.

#### **1.4 Walkways, Driveways, & Off-Street Parking (pages 51-52):**

- 1.4.5. Design new walkways, driveways, and off-street parking to conform with the spacing, width, configuration, and materials of character-defining walkways, driveways, and off-street parking areas in the district.
- 1.4.9. Construct new walkways in traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.
  - a. These include red brick, flagstone, concrete, and Chapel Hill grit.
  - b. Do not use asphalt or contemporary materials that mimic other materials for sidewalks within the historic districts.
- 1.4.10. Construct new driveways and off-street parking areas in traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.
  - a. These include red brick, concrete, asphalt, and Chapel Hill grit. Consider permeable materials—including brick—or install paving strips or concrete runners, to minimize the impervious surface area and thus, reduce runoff from the site.
  - b. Do not use gravel in sizes larger than one-half inch.
- 1.4.11. Utilize perimeter plantings, trees, shrubbery, hedges, and other landscape features—including low stone walls—to screen new driveways and off-street parking areas visually from the street, to buffer adjacent residential properties from their visual impact, and to reduce the solar heat gain of

paved surfaces. Further reduce the visual impact of large parking areas by subdividing them with interior planting medians.

### *3.1 Roofs, Gutters, & Chimneys (pages 81-82):*

3.1.5. If deterioration necessitates the replacement of an entire roof surface, replacement surfaces should match the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material (including composite shingle, synthetic slate, and wide-pan matte-finish metal roofing) only if the replacement material is compatible with the design, size, and scale of the building.

- a. Do not replace historic standing-seam, pressed metal, or asphalt-shingled roofs with multi-rib metal roofing.
- b. Do not install built-up or rubber roofing in locations that are visible from the street.

3.1.7. When possible, locate new roof features and mechanical equipment—including, but not limited to dormers, chimneys, skylights, vents, plumbing stacks, solar collectors, and satellite dishes—on roof slopes where they are not visible from the street or in locations where they will not compromise this historic roof design, damage character-defining features or materials, or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.1.8. Introduce new gutters and downspouts, as needed, with care so that no architectural features are damaged or lost. Select gutters and downspouts that are painted or coated with a factory finish (unless they are copper) to match the building's trim. Replace half-round gutters and cylindrical downspouts in kind.

### *3.4 Windows & Shutters (pages 89-91):*

3.4.1. Retain and preserve the materials and the decorative and functional features of windows and shutters that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts. These include, but are not limited to, frames and hardware; sashes, glass, and muntins; lintels, sills, and surrounds.

3.4.2. Protect and maintain the details, features, and finishes of wood and metal windows and shutters through a program of regular maintenance and repair using accepted preservation methods.

3.4.3. Repair deteriorated or damaged windows and shutters through accepted preservation methods of patching, splicing, consolidating, and reinforcing. Repairs may include selective in-kind replacement of missing or deteriorated portions of historic windows and shutters.

3.4.4. Replace in kind window details and features that are too deteriorated to repair, taking care to replace only the deteriorated portion rather than the entire feature. Replacement features should match the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, and texture.

3.4.5. If deterioration necessitates the replacement of an entire window, or if a window is completely missing, replacement windows should match the original feature, based upon physical and documentary evidence, in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material (including aluminum-clad wood or fiberglass) only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.

3.4.6. If new window openings are necessary, when possible, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials, or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.4.7. Do not replace deteriorated windows with stock items that do not fill the original openings or to install smaller shutters that would not, if closed, cover the window opening.

3.4.8. Do not remove or conceal window openings on street-facing elevations.

3.4.9. Do not remove or conceal materials or details of historic windows and shutters—including, but not limited to beveled glass, art glass, transoms, and decorative trim.

3.4.10. Do not install windows with two-dimensional simulations of pane subdivisions, such as snap-in muntins. If not true divided light, glazing should have three-dimensional grills affixed to both the interior and exterior of the window with shadow bars between insulated glass panes.

### *3.5 Exterior Doors (pages 94-95):*

3.5.7. If new doors are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials, or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.5.13. Do not introduce exterior doors or entrance features to a building that would create a false historical appearance.

*3.6 Porches, Entrances, & Balconies (pages 98-99):*

3.6.6. If new porches or entrances are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

*3.9 Porches, Entrances, & Balconies (pages 98-99):*

3.6.6. If new porches or entrances are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.6.9. Do not replace wood porch floors or steps with wood decking, brick, or concrete. 3.6.10. Do not introduce porch, entrance, or balcony features or details to a building that would create a false historical appearance.

*4.10 Decks & Patios (page 143):*

4.10.1. Locate decks and patios on rear elevations or in inconspicuous areas that are minimally visible from the public right-of-way.

4.10.2. Locate decks and patios in locations that do not damage or conceal significant building or site features or details. Do not introduce a deck or patio if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, including porches, projecting bays or wings, historic garages, accessory buildings, and retaining walls.

4.10.3. Retain and preserve historic building materials and trim and minimize the visual impact of a deck or patio by designing them to be inset from the building's corners.

4.10.4. Limit the size and scale of decks and patios to minimize their visual impact. Do not introduce a deck or patio if it will visually overpower the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.

4.10.5. Align decks with the building's first floor. For sites with steep topography or high foundations, consider multilevel decks that step down to follow the topography of the site.

4.10.6. Design and detail decks and any related steps and railings to be compatible with the historic building in scale, material, configuration, and proportion. Consider designing deck piers and foundation infill to relate to the house in the same way that a porch would. However, avoid replicating historic porch posts and railings for contemporary, uncovered decks.

4.10.7. Construct decks of wood or substitute materials that visually replicate wood. When visible from the street, construct patios in traditional materials—including red brick, flagstone, and Chapel Hill grit.

4.10.8. Minimize damage to the historic building by designing decks and patios to be structurally self-supporting. Attach decks to the building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric and to allow for their removal in the future. Retain a planting strip between patios and building foundations to allow for proper drainage.

4.10.9. Screen the structural framing of decks with foundation plantings, lattice, or other compatible screening materials.

4.10.10. Maintain and protect significant site features from damage during or as a consequence of deck-or patio related site work or construction.

*5.2 Relocation (page 150-151):*

5.2.1. Consider relocation only when all other on-site preservation alternatives have been exhausted. All alternatives investigated must be included and discussed in the COA application.

5.2.2. Prior to relocation, undertake a professional structural assessment of the building to determine whether it is structurally sound enough to withstand the move.

5.2.3. Prior to relocation, document the historic building in its original setting and record the existing site conditions through photographs. Provide a copy of the documentation to both the Commission and the State Historic Preservation Office.

5.2.4. Select a new site that is compatible with the original site in visual character and historical association, choosing a site within the same historic district when possible.

- a. Select a site that will provide a similar setting in terms of setback and lot coverage, spacing, orientation, landscaping, and rhythm with neighboring properties. Relocation on its original site may be preferable to an off-site location
- b. The relocated building shall be sited in a position similar to its historic orientation and shall maintain its relationship with the street through a similar setback.
- c. The new foundation should match the original in height, design, and materials.
- d. Relocating a historic structure to the rear of a parcel to accommodate a new building in front of it is not appropriate.

5.2.5. Ensure that the structure is secured and protected from adverse weather conditions, water infiltration, and vandalism before, during, and after the move.

5.2.7. If it is not possible to move the building as a single unit, partial disassembly may be necessary. Total disassembly of building components shall be avoided except under extreme situations and in all cases structures shall be disassembled in the largest workable pieces possible. When disassembly/reassembly must be undertaken, it shall be done using the following recognized preservation methods:

- a. Measured drawings and thorough photographic documentation of the structure or element to be disassembled/reassembled shall be completed.
- b. Written plans detailing the disassembly and reassembly steps and procedures shall be completed and approved by Town Staff, and the process of disassembly shall be recorded through photos and/or video.

5.2.8. Protect significant site features—including other buildings and structures, man-made features, archaeological sites, mature trees and plantings, topography, and other natural features—on the original site, along the relocation route, and on the new site from damage during or as a result of the move.

#### **Conditions of Approval**

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

#### **Decision**

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission **approves/denies** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it **would/would not be incongruous** with the special character of the district.

## Location

