



Historic District Commission

Regular Agenda – Certificate of Appropriateness 301 Hillsborough Street (Project #COA-22-14)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT
Anya Grahn, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner I
Judy Johnson, Assistant Planning Director
Colleen Willger, Planning Director

Applicant	Filing Date	Meeting Date(s)	Historic District
James Morgan, BellaDomus Design on behalf of Brian Herndon, Owner	4/20/2022	5/10/2022	Franklin-Rosemary
Project Description <p>The applicant proposes to renovate the existing house by expanding an existing lean-to addition, restoring and relocating wood windows and a door, as well as reconstructing a rear screened porch. A stone wall will also be repaired and reconstructed along the front lot line.</p>			
Proposed Findings of Fact <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The Colonial Revival Julius Alegmon “Ben Warren” House was constructed in 1922 and is listed as contributing on the Chapel Hill Historic District Boundary Increase National Register of Historic Places nomination.2. The applicant proposes to extend the existing box bay, or lean-to addition, on the north elevation, reusing the two existing wood windows. One window on the south (side) elevation will be relocated to the west (rear) elevation and the kitchen door will replace an existing window on the north side of the porch. Windows the applicant finds to be beyond repair will be replaced in-kind with new wood windows.3. The applicant also proposes to reconstruct an existing screen porch addition on the west (rear) elevation. The existing roof structure will remain in place; however, the foundation, decking, posts, and screen will be replaced. The existing stone steps will remain in place; however, new steps will be constructed to the north side of the porch. The steps will be constructed of new pressure treated wood and have new horizontal railings.4. The chimney flue on the west (rear) elevation will be removed.5. The rubble stone wall and stone piers along the front property line will be repaired and reconstructed. The wall on the north side of the entry sidewalk will be repaired to match the wall on the south side.			
Applicable Design Standards <p><i>1.3 Walls & Fences (pages 48-49):</i></p> <p>1.3.3. Repair deteriorated or damaged walls and fences through recognized preservation methods of patching, splicing, consolidating, and reinforcing. When possible, salvage original materials from a less prominent location to patch more prominent parts of the wall or fence.</p> <p>1.3.4. Replace in kind any part of a wall or fence that is too deteriorated to repair, taking care to replace only the deteriorated portion rather than the entire feature. Replacement features should match the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, texture, and pattern.</p> <p>1.3.5. If a historic wall or fence is completely missing, or if deterioration necessitates its replacement, replace it to match the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color, based upon physical and documentary evidence. Otherwise, replace it with a new feature that is compatible in material, design, scale, and detail with the building, site, and district.</p> <p><i>3.4 Windows & Shutters (pages 90-91):</i></p> <p>3.4.6. If new window openings are necessary, when possible, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials, or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.</p>			

3.5 Exterior Doors (pages 94-95):

3.5.7. If new doors are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials, or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.9 Porches, Entrances, & Balconies (pages 98-99):

3.6.4. Replace in kind any feature or surface, or portion thereof, of a porch, entrance, or balcony that is too deteriorated to repair, taking care to replace only the deteriorated portion rather than the entire feature. Replacement features and surfaces should match the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, pattern, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material for wood (including fiber cement board, cellular PVC, or plastic composite trim or siding) only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible or there is an ongoing water infiltration problem, and the wood to be replaced is a painted wood to which the substitute material can be matched. Vinyl is not an appropriate substitute material.

3.6.5. If a porch, entrance, or balcony is completely missing, replace it to match the original feature, based upon physical and documentary evidence, only if the feature to be replaced coexisted with the features currently on the building. Otherwise, replace it with a new feature that is compatible in material, design, size, and scale with the building.

3.6.6. If new porches or entrances are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.6.7. Do not remove or conceal materials or details of historic porches, entrances, and balconies including, but not limited to, columns, balustrades, brackets, pilasters, steps, floors, ceilings, cornices, and trim.

3.6.8. Do not remove, screen, or enclose a porch, entrance, or balcony on a primary, street-facing elevation.

- a. Consider screening a porch or balcony on a side or rear elevation only if the design will preserve the historic character of the porch or balcony.
- b. Consider enclosing a porch or balcony on rear elevation only if the design will preserve the historic character of the porch or balcony.

4.8 Additions (page 134-136):

4.8.3. Site additions to be consistent with additions in the immediate surroundings and to retain the orientation of the existing building as well as the spacing between and distance from other buildings in the immediate surroundings when the siting and spacing are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Maintain the original orientation of the structure with primary entrances on the front façade of the building.

4.8.4. Design and site additions so they do not compromise the overall historic character of the site, including its topography, significant site features, and distinctive views. Do not introduce an addition if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, such as a porch, or if it necessitates the relocation or demolition of historic garages or accessory buildings.

4.8.5. Design and locate additions so that, as much as possible, historic features and details—including windows, doors, chimneys, bays, corner boards, wood shingles, brackets and decorative trim—are not removed or concealed. 4.8.6. Design additions so that their size, scale, and form are compatible with the existing building and do not visually overpower the building on this or adjacent sites.

4.8.9. Minimize damage to the historic building by constructing additions to be structurally self-supporting, where feasible, and attach them to the original building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric. Attach additions in such a manner that, if additions were removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic building would be unimpaired.

4.8.12. Design additions so that the location, shape, scale, size, materials, pattern, and proportion of windows and doors are compatible with the windows and doors of the existing building and with historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when these elements of doors and windows are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Doors and windows should follow the standards for New Construction: Doors and Windows.

Conditions of Approval

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission **approves/denies** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it **would/would not be incongruous** with the special character of the district.

Location

