

#### **Historic District Commission**

# Regular Agenda – Certificate of Appropriateness 700 Gimghoul Road (Project #COA-22-15)

**Summary Report** 

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Anya Grahn, Principal Planner Charnika Harrell, Planner I

Judy Johnson, Assistant Planning Director

Colleen Willger, Planning Director

Applicant	Filing Date	Meeting Date(s)	Historic District
Jane Heaton	4/12/2022	5/10/2022	Gimghoul

## **Project Description**

The applicant proposes to replace the entry door and screen door on the façade, replace the existing roofing materials, remove two skylights on the façade, extend the roof of the house over a reconstructed pergola, install three skylights on the rear elevation, and replace a wood fence with a brick wall.

## **Proposed Findings of Fact**

- 1. The 1.5 story house is listed as contributing on the National Register of Historic Places.
- 2. The applicant proposes to replace the existing 6-panel wood door with a new wood door of similar design featuring 4 lights above 2 panels. The applicant also intends to replace the existing sidelights. A new screen door and new door hardware will be added to the exterior of the house.
- 3. The house has an asphalt shingle roof on the façade, membrane roofing on the rear addition, and plastic panels above the pergola. The applicant proposes to remove the two existing skylights on the front of the house and replace the asphalt shingle roofing with new Landmark Pro black asphalt shingles. The existing membrane roofing will be replaced with new PVC membrane. New white aluminum gutters and downspouts will be incorporated.
- 4. The existing pergola consists of wood posts and a wood roof structure covered by plastic panels. The applicant finds that the wood posts are deteriorating due to carpenter bee infiltration and proposes to reconstruct the pergola's wood frame structure.
- 5. The applicant proposes to extend the existing roof line over the pergola, creating a new roof overhang measuring approximately 10 feet by 27.75 feet. The new roof will be covered in a new PVC membrane. Three new skylights will be installed above the pergola. The roof will be supported by four new box columns with a simple capital and base measuring 8 inches square by 8 feet in height.
- 6. There is an existing wood fence that extends from the front, northwest corner of the house to the property line, enclosing the rear yard, and then extending from the property line to the east elevation of the house. The applicant proposes to replace the portions of the fence along the front yard with a new red brick wall. The wall will be the same height as the existing fence, not exceeding 6 feet in height. The wall will feature an open lattice design and have wood gates matching the existing ones.
- 7. The applicant also proposes to repaint the house.

### **Applicable Design Standards**

- 1.1 Site Features (page 42):
  - 1.1.7. Introduce new site features to be compatible in scale, design, and materials with the overall historic character of the site and district. Utilize traditional materials in the construction of benches, terraces, gazebos, trellises, fences, and walls. 1.4 Walkways, Driveways, & Off-Street Parking (pages 52-53):
- 1.3 Walls & Fences (pages 48-49):

- 1.3.6. Site new walls and fences in configurations and locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district and consistent with the location and height of other walls and fences in the district.
- 1.3.7. Construct new walls using traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, height, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.
  - a. Walls in front and side yards should generally not exceed 30" and should be constructed of red brick or fieldstone.
  - b. Walls constructed of cut stone, bare concrete block, or with thin stone veneers applied to concrete or other structural block are not appropriate in locations visible from the street.

## 3.1 Roofs, Gutters, & Chimneys (pages 81-82):

- 3.1.5. If deterioration necessitates the replacement of an entire roof surface, replacement surfaces should match the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material (including composite shingle, synthetic slate, and widepan matte-finish metal roofing) only if the replacement material is compatible with the design, size, and scale of the building.
  - a. Do not replace historic standing-seam, pressed metal, or asphalt-shingled roofs with multirib metal roofing.
  - b. Do not install built-up or rubber roofing in locations that are visible from the street.
- 3.1.7. When possible, locate new roof features and mechanical equipment—including, but not limited to dormers, chimneys, skylights, vents, plumbing stacks, solar collectors, and satellite dishes—on roof slopes where they are not visible from the street or in locations where they will not compromise this historic roof design, damage character-defining features or materials, or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.
- 3.1.8. Introduce new gutters and downspouts, as needed, with care so that no architectural features are damaged or lost. Select gutters and downspouts that are painted or coated with a factory finish (unless they are copper) to match the building's trim. Replace half-round gutters and cylindrical downspouts in kind.

#### 3.5 Exterior Doors (pages 94-95):

- 3.5.4. Replace in kind exterior doors and entrance features that are too deteriorated to repair, taking care to replace only the deteriorated portion rather than the entire door or feature. Replacement doors and features should match the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, detail, and texture.
- 3.5.5. If deterioration necessitates the replacement of an entire door or entrance feature, the replacement door or feature should match the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material (including aluminum-clad wood or fiberglass) only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.
- 3.5.6. If an exterior door or entrance feature is completely missing, replace it to match the original feature, based upon physical and documentary evidence, only if the feature to be replaced coexisted with the features currently on the building. Otherwise, replace it with a new door or feature that is compatible in material, design, size, and scale with the building.

## 3.9 Porches, Entrances, & Balconies (pages 98-99):

3.6.6. If new porches or entrances are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

## 4.10 Decks & Patios (page 143):

- 4.10.1. Locate decks and patios on rear elevations or in inconspicuous areas that are minimally visible from the public right-of-way.
- 4.10.2. Locate decks and patios in locations that do not damage or conceal significant building or site features or details. Do not introduce a deck or patio if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, including porches, projecting bays or wings, historic garages, accessory buildings, and retaining walls.

- 4.10.3. Retain and preserve historic building materials and trim and minimize the visual impact of a deck or patio by designing them to be inset from the building's corners.
- 4.10.4. Limit the size and scale of decks and patios to minimize their visual impact. Do not introduce a deck or patio if it will visually overpower the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.
- 4.10.6. Design and detail decks and any related steps and railings to be compatible with the historic building in scale, material, configuration, and proportion. Consider designing deck piers and foundation infill to relate to the house in the same way that a porch would. However, avoid replicating historic porch posts and railings for contemporary, uncovered decks.
- 4.10.7. Construct decks of wood or substitute materials that visually replicate wood. When visible from the street, construct patios in traditional materials—including red brick, flagstone, and Chapel Hill grit.
- 4.10.8. Minimize damage to the historic building by designing decks and patios to be structurally self-supporting. Attach decks to the building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric and to allow for their removal in the future. Retain a planting strip between patios and building foundations to allow for proper drainage.
- 4.10.9. Screen the structural framing of decks with foundation plantings, lattice, or other compatible screening materials.
- 4.10.10. Maintain and protect significant site features from damage during or as a consequence of deck-or patio related site work or construction.

# **Conditions of Approval**

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

## **Decision**

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission **approves/denies** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it **would/would not be incongruous** with the special character of the district.

# Location

