Historic District Commission

Regular Agenda – Certificate of Appropriateness
504 North Street Unit A (Project #COA-22-9)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT
Anya Grahn, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner I
Judy Johnson, Assistant Planning Director
Colleen Willger, Planning Director

Applicant	**Filing Date**	**Meeting Date**	**Historic District**
Sallie Shuping-Russell (owner)	03/07/2022	04/12/2022	Franklin-Rosemary

Project Description

The applicant proposes to demolish the existing single-family home and construct a new contemporary single-family home.

Proposed Findings of Fact

1. The existing single-family home was constructed in 1980 and is listed as noncontributing to the Chapel Hill Historic District Boundary Increase National Register District.
2. The style of the existing home is unclear. It is a rectangular contemporary form with a hip roof and a triangular clerestory roof monitor; however, it also contains traditional elements like 6-over-6 windows, simulated divided light French doors, and plain weatherboards.
3. The applicant proposes to demolish the existing home as the home is beyond repair. There is also a non-historic shed on the site that will be removed.
4. The applicant proposes to construct a new single-family house. The house has a rectangular plan with a screened porch on the southwest corner, covered porch on the southeast corner, and a deck wrapping the south elevation. The house form is a contemporary side-gable with projecting shed dormer.
5. The new house will have a CMU block foundation with a parge finish. The walls will be sided with painted Hardie board and composite fascia. The applicant proposes full-glass fiberglass windows and doors.
6. The existing gravel driveway will be extended to the northwest and south to provide additional parking.
7. The applicant proposes to extend an existing white picket fence along the driveway. The fence will match the existing picket fence.

Applicable Design Standards

1.3. Walkways, Driveways, & Off-Street Parking (pages 52-53)

1.3.8. Construct new front- and side-yard fences using traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, height, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.

a. Front- and side-yard fences, in front of the rear corner of the main block of the building, should generally not exceed 30” in height, should be constructed of wood or metal with structural members facing inward to the property, and must be painted or sealed.
b. Temporary, light-gauge wire fencing may be constructed as necessary to keep animals out of gardens, side, and rear yards.
c. Chain link, vinyl, or split rail fences are not appropriate.

1.4. Walkways, Driveways, & Off-Street Parking (pages 52-53)

1.4.5. Design new walkways, driveways, and off-street parking to conform with the spacing, width, configuration, and materials of character-defining walkways, driveways, and off-street parking areas in the district.

1.4.6. Site new walkways, driveways, and off-street parking areas in locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district—typically to the side and rear of existing

buildings—and locate them so the topography of the site and mature trees and other significant site features are not significantly altered, damaged, or lost.

a. In residential areas, do not locate off-street parking areas in front yards. Whenever possible, driveways should lead to parking areas to the side or rear of the primary building on the site.

b. In commercial and institutional areas, parking should be located at the side or rear of the property whenever possible.

1.4.7. Do not locate driveways or parking areas in locations where the paving will abut the principal building. A planting strip should be retained between historic residential structures and any new paving in order to minimize damage to the foundation.

1.4.8. Do not locate new off-street parking on a site where the paved area will substantially alter the proportion of the site that is paved versus landscaped.

1.4.10. Construct new driveways and off-street parking areas in traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district. a. These include red brick, concrete, asphalt, and Chapel Hill grit. Consider permeable materials—including brick—or install paving strips or concrete runners, to minimize the impervious surface area and thus, reduce runoff from the site. b. Do not use gravel in sizes larger than one-half inch.

1.4.11. Utilize perimeter plantings, trees, shrubbery, hedges, and other landscape features—including low stone walls—to screen new driveways and off-street parking areas visually from the street, to buffer adjacent residential properties from their visual impact, and to reduce the solar heat gain of paved surfaces. Further reduce the visual impact of large parking areas by subdividing them with interior planting medians.

4.1 Setback, Spacing, & Orientation (page 114)

4.1.2. Site new buildings with setbacks within the range of historic building setbacks in the immediate surroundings when the setbacks are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Generally speaking, new buildings should not project beyond neighboring historic buildings.

4.1.4. Site new buildings with spacing consistent with existing historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when the spacing is important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

4.1.5. Orient new buildings with the primary elevation and the primary entrance facing the street. Buildings on corner lots may address the secondary right-of-way.

4.1.7. Design and site new buildings so they do not compromise the overall historic character of the site, including its topography and significant site features.

4.1.8. Maintain and protect significant site features, including site topography, retaining walls, historic stone walls, driveways, and walkways, from damage during, or as a consequence of, related site work or construction.

4.2 Building Scales, Proportion, & Form (pages 117-118)

4.2.1. Maintain the established patterns of scale and proportion that exist on the block or streetscape. Design new buildings so their size and scale do not visually overpower historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when size and scale are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

4.2.2. Scale new buildings to be consistent with the height and width of existing, historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when scale is important in defining the overall historic character of the district. The height of the historic buildings should be calculated from the original, historic ridgeline (not any towers, steeples, or later additions).

a. Generally speaking, new building heights, from the first floor level to the ridge of the main roof, should be within the range of historic building heights in the immediate surroundings and should be no taller than the tallest building on the block of the same type (e.g. single-family house, multi-family house, church)

b. The foundation height and first-floor level should be consistent with that of buildings in the immediate surroundings. However, for new construction on the periphery of the districts where

there is greater variation in topography, the foundation height is less significant than the overall height, form, and massing of the new construction.

c. The width of new buildings should be within the range of historic building widths (for the same type building) in the immediate surroundings, not including side wings or porches.

4.2.4. Where base zoning allows for larger scaled buildings and uses other than single-family residential development, care should be taken to incorporate scale-reducing techniques to minimize the impact on adjacent historic buildings. Create human scale by including functional elements typical to the historic district, such as porches and porticos.

4.2.6. Design new buildings so that the directional expression (vertical, horizontal, or square) is compatible with that of buildings in the immediate surroundings when the directional expression is important in defining the overall historic character of the district. For example, if the majority of buildings in the immediate surroundings have horizontal or square expression, avoid designing buildings with prominent vertical proportions

4.2.7. Design new buildings with forms that relate to those of historic houses in the immediate surroundings when the forms are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. For example, if a street is comprised primarily of Colonial Revival-style houses with simple rectangular forms, do not introduce a new building with complex massing. Conversely, if the forms of adjacent buildings have a variety of projecting bays, dormers, etc., consider employing similar elements in the new building.

4.3 Roof Form, Materials, & Details (page 120)

4.3.1. Design new roofs to be compatible in form, slope, and orientation with historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when the form, slope, and orientation are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

4.3.2. Utilize roof forms or combinations of roof forms that relate to existing surrounding buildings when roof form is important in defining the overall historic character of the district. For instance, if most nearby houses have steeply pitched hipped roofs, avoid low-slung, gabled roofs.

4.3.3. Design new roofs to be proportionate to the building and appropriate to the style of the building, so as not to overwhelm the structure.

4.3.4. Utilize roof materials that are commonly found in the district and apply them in ways that are appropriate to the style of the building.

a. Contemporary materials such as synthetic slate and composite shingles are acceptable for sloped roofing.

b. Contemporary membrane and roll roofing are acceptable for low-sloped roofs of a less than 1:12 pitch.

c. Metal roofing that mimics the wide-pan profile of traditional standing-seam roofing is also appropriate.

d. Ribbed or corrugated metal roofing are not appropriate in the historic districts.

4.3.5. Design dormers to be compatible with the architectural style of the house in their size, scale, and roof form so that they do not visually overpower the building on this or adjacent sites.

a. The number and size of dormers shall be limited on a roof, such that the primary roof form retains its prominence.

b. Utilize similar roof forms and pitches for dormers. Gabled, hipped, or shed dormers are appropriate for most structures.

c. Roof ridges for dormers must be secondary to (lower than) those of the main structure and set in from the eave of the building.

4.3.6. Use eave details and materials that complement those frequently found in district buildings and that are appropriate for the style of the building.

4.4 Building Materials & Architectural Details (page 122)

4.4.1. Design new buildings and their features to be compatible in scale, materials, proportions, and details with historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when the scale, materials,

proportions, and details are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. New buildings should be compatible with, but discernible from, historic buildings in the districts.

4.4.2. Select exterior surface materials and architectural details that are compatible with the style of the house and with the materials of historic buildings in the immediate vicinity, in terms of size, composition, texture, pattern, color, and detail, when those materials and details are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

4.4.3. Use traditional materials including but not limited to brick, stucco, stone, and wood in conventional ways (i.e. wood siding applied horizontally).

4.4.4. Use contemporary materials, including cementitious siding, when they match the appearance, dimension, texture, color, sheen, and visual weight of their counterparts commonly found in the historic districts. Apply materials in a traditional manner that conveys the same visual appearance as historic materials. Do not install artificial siding with a faux-grained texture.

4.4.5. It is generally inappropriate to use synthetic (vinyl, aluminum, PVC, plastic, resin, fiberboard) siding and details within the historic districts as these generally do not reflect the size, scale, proportion, texture, and detail of traditional building materials. However, substitute materials may be considered for trim, porch elements, and other decorative features that are susceptible to repeated moisture infiltration and rot.

4.4.6. Use contemporary masonry veneers, including brick veneer, thin-set stone veneer, split-faced concrete block, and stamped concrete, that accurately reflect the size, scale, proportion, texture, and detail of traditional building materials and are applied in a traditional manner that conveys the same visual appearance as historic materials.

4.4.7. Use of modern materials may be appropriate if they are applied to Modernist rather than traditional forms, as a means of continuing the evolution of architecture through time.

4.4.8. Architectural details should be appropriately scaled and compatible with the overall architectural style of the building. If emulating historic architectural styles, ensure that the proportion and scale of the trim or feature relates to those on historic buildings within the district.

4.4.9. Do not introduce exterior wall features, details, or surfaces to a building that would create a false historical appearance.

4.5 Doors & Windows (pages 124-125)

4.5.1. Design new buildings so that window and door openings are compatible with buildings in the immediate surroundings when the window and door openings are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. This compatibility includes:

a. the ratio of solids (walls) to voids (windows and doors)

b. the rhythm and placement of windows and door openings

c. the proportions of window and door openings (ratio of width to height)

d. the overall size and shape of window and door openings

4.5.2. Design new buildings so that the articulation of window and door openings is compatible with buildings in the immediate surroundings when that articulation is important in defining the overall historic character of the district. For example, openings are generally recessed on a masonry building while doors and windows are surrounded by raised trim on a frame building. New openings that are flush with the rest of the wall are not appropriate on traditionally styled buildings.

4.5.3. Design new buildings so that the pattern and style of windows and doors are compatible with the windows and doors of buildings in the immediate surroundings when the pattern and style of windows and doors is important in defining the overall historic character of the district and are consistent with the overall style of the building.

4.5.4. Do not install windows, doors, or sidelights with two-dimensional simulations of pane subdivisions, such as snap-in muntins. If not true divided light, glazing should have three-dimensional grills affixed to both the interior and exterior of the window with shadow bars between insulated glass panes.

4.5.5. Install windows and doors constructed of materials that are compatible with the windows and doors of buildings in the immediate surroundings when those materials are important in

defining the overall historic character of the district. These include wood, aluminum-clad, and fiberglass-clad wood windows as well as wood, metal, metal-clad wood, or fiberglass doors. Vinyl and vinyl-clad windows are not appropriate in the historic districts.

4.5.6. Install storm windows and doors following the standards found in Windows & Shutters and Exterior Doors

4.5.7. Do not use tinted, frosted, or mirrored glass where visible from the street. Translucent or low-e glass may be strategies to reduce solar heat gain

4.5.8. Install shutters if their presence is consistent with the overall style of the building.

a. Shutters should be sized to fit the opening and mounted on hinges, even if fixed in the open position

b. Do not install shutters on bay or grouped windows.

c. Shutters should be constructed of wood, wood composite without a faux wood grain, or other materials that accurately mimic wood.

d. Metal or vinyl shutters are not appropriate in the historic districts.

4.6 Porches & Entrances (page 127)

4.6.1. Design new buildings with porches and entrances that complement the size, proportion, placement, and rhythm of existing historic porches and entrances in the immediate surroundings when the size, proportion, placement, and rhythm are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

4.6.2. Design porches to provide usable outdoor space by ensuring a minimum depth of six feet.

4.6.3. Design entrances to be no more than one bay wide and no deeper than six feet, with the door centered within the entrance.

4.6.4. Design porches and entrances to be compatible with the overall architectural style of the building.

4.6.5. Select materials and architectural details that are compatible with both the architectural style of the new building and with buildings in the immediate surroundings in terms of size, composition, texture, pattern, color, and detail when those materials and details are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

4.6.6. It is generally inappropriate to use synthetic (vinyl, aluminum, PVC, plastic, resin, fiberboard) siding and details within the historic districts. However, substitute materials may be considered for trim, porch elements, and other decorative features that are susceptible to repeated moisture infiltration and rot

4.6.7. Frame porches with raised foundations should have tongue-and-groove porch floors with boards laid perpendicular to the façade of the house. Do not use wood decking for porch floors.

4.6.8. Entrances and porches with floors at grade may have concrete floors.

4.10 Decks & Patios (page 143)

4.10.1. Locate decks and patios on rear elevations or in inconspicuous areas that are minimally visible from the public right-of-way.

4.10.4. Limit the size and scale of decks and patios to minimize their visual impact. Do not introduce a deck or patio if it will visually overpower the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.

4.10.5. Align decks with the building's first floor. For sites with steep topography or high foundations, consider multilevel decks that step down to follow the topography of the site

4.10.7. Construct decks of wood or substitute materials that visually replicate wood. When visible from the street, construct patios in traditional materials—including red brick, flagstone, and Chapel Hill grit.

4.10.9. Screen the structural framing of decks with foundation plantings, lattice, or other compatible screening materials.

5.1 Demolition (page 147)

5.1.1. Consider demolition only when all other preservation alternatives have been exhausted (all alternatives investigated, including structural integrity reports, must be included in the COA). Do not demolish a viable structure in order to create an infill construction opportunity.

5.1.3. Salvage or provide the opportunity for preservation organizations and others to salvage reusable building materials and architectural features—including wood flooring, doors, windows, brick and stone, trim, mantels, stair rails and newel posts, and other decorative features—prior to demolition. It is the applicant's responsibility to manage the salvage operation including identification of the salvage company or organization, hiring, contracting, scheduling, supervision, and execution of the salvage operation.

5.1.4. Protect adjacent buildings and significant site features such as mature trees from damage during-or as a result of-the demolition.

5.1.5. Protect any known or newly identified archaeological resources from any damage during-or as a result of-the demolition.

5.1.6. Submit a COA with site plan for the post-removal site stabilization. Clear the site of debris and implement the approved site plan promptly after the demolition.

Conditions of Approval

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire, and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission ***approves/denies*** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it ***would/would not be incongruous*** with the special character of the district.

Project Location