

MEMORANDUM

TO: Chapel Hill Historic District Commission

FROM: Britany Waddell, Planning Director
Anya Grahn-Federmack, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner II

SUBJECT: 379 Tenney Circle: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)
(PIN 9788-69-8624, HDC-23-18)

FILING DATE: July 24, 2023

DATE: September 12, 2023, October 10, 2023

COA SUMMARY

Beril and Michael Steiner, the owners, request a COA for the following improvements:

- Build a new saltwater pool with a concrete-paver pool patio.
- Build a 12-foot by 14-foot one-story pool cabana.
- Install fencing and gates around the pool and rear yard.
- Install pea gravel walkway and dry-stacked boulder wall.
- Build a side porch on the east elevation.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The proposed location is zoned Residential-1 (R-1) and is in the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

BACKGROUND

| | |
|--------------------|--|
| July 24, 2023 | The applicant submits a COA application for the work described above. |
| September 12, 2023 | The Historic District Commission reviewed the application and requested additional information. (See Meeting Materials ¹ .) |

DISCUSSION

The house is listed as a contributing building in the Chapel Hill Historic District Boundary Increase. The cabana will be located on the southeast side of the house. The west side of the cabana will be one-story and sit at grade with the new concrete paver patio. The cabana will be two-stories with an exposed foundation on the east elevation. On the northeast side of the house, the proposed cabana will appear one-story tall. Materials for the cabana will match the existing house.

The applicant also proposes to construct a new side porch on the east elevation. The lower level of the porch will be screened.

¹ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=6326894&GUID=7B3C6E3D-99E6-46DC-B9A6-FDA4ADF8DDC9&Options=&Search=>

If the COA is granted for the exterior change, the applicant would then be required to obtain any necessary zoning compliance and building permits from the Town.

NOTE

The [*Chapel Hill Historic Districts Design Principles and Standards*](#)² are incorporated into the record by reference.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment 1 – Written Decision (approving the COA)
2. [*Special Character Essay – Franklin-Rosemary Historic District \(pages 25-30\)*](#)³
3. Application Materials

²https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

³https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

WRITTEN DECISION - APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

WRITTEN DECISION APPROVING AN APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 208 HILLSBOROUGH STREET (PIN 9788-69-8624, Project #HDC-23-18)

WHEREAS, having reviewed the applicant's argument and various documents and other evidence submitted at the hearing on this matter, and having heard public comment on the application, the Historic District Commission (HDC) finds as facts those facts summarized by the Chair at the conclusion of the Commission's hearing of this matter and hereby incorporates them by reference as Commission Findings of Fact; and finds that such facts are supported by competent, material, and substantial evidence presented to the Commission; and

BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic District Commission of the Town of Chapel Hill that, having considered the requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) at 379 Tenney Circle to:

- Build a new saltwater pool with a concrete-paver pool patio.
- Build a 12-foot by 14-foot pool cabana.
- Install fencing and gates around the pool and rear yard.
- Install pea gravel walkway and dry-stacked boulder wall.
- Build a side porch.

In accord with the improvements on the attached site plan, and identified as Orange County Property Identifier Number 9788-69-8624, the Board makes the following finding:

1. The requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is not incongruous with the special character of the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

The following Design Standards apply to the Application:

1.1 Site Features (page 42)

1.1.7. Introduce new site features to be compatible in scale, design, and materials with the overall historic character of the site and district. Utilize traditional materials in the construction of benches, terraces, gazebos, trellises, fences, and walls.

1.1.8. Introduce contemporary site features—including playground equipment and swimming pools—in locations that do not diminish or compromise the overall character of the site and district, typically in rear yards or other locations not visible from the street.

1.3 Walls & Fences (pages 48-49)

1.3.6. Site new walls and fences in configurations and locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district and consistent with the location and height of other walls and fences in the district.

1.3.7. Construct new walls using traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, height, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.

a. Walls in front and side yards should generally not exceed 30” and should be constructed of red brick or fieldstone.

b. Walls constructed of cut stone, bare concrete block, or with thin stone veneers applied to concrete or other structural block are not appropriate in locations visible from the street.

1.3.8. Construct new front- and side-yard fences using traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, height, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.

a. Front- and side-yard fences, in front of the rear corner of the main block of the building, should generally not exceed 30” in height, should be constructed of wood or metal with structural members facing inward to the property, and must be painted or sealed.

b. Temporary, light-gauge wire fencing may be constructed as necessary to keep animals out of gardens, side, and rear yards.

c. Chain link, vinyl, or split rail fences are not appropriate.

1.4 Walkways, Driveways, & Off-Street Parking (pages 52-53)

1.4.5. Design new walkways, driveways, and off-street parking to conform with the spacing, width, configuration, and materials of character-defining walkways, driveways, and off-street parking areas in the district.

1.4.6. Site new walkways, driveways, and off-street parking areas in locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district—typically to the side and rear of existing buildings—and locate them so the topography of the site and mature trees and other significant site features are not significantly altered, damaged, or lost.

a. In residential areas, do not locate off-street parking areas in front yards. Whenever possible, driveways should lead to parking areas to the side or rear of the primary building on the site.

b. In commercial and institutional areas, parking should be located at the side or rear of the property whenever possible.

1.4.9. Construct new walkways in traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.

a. These include red brick, flagstone, concrete, and Chapel Hill grit.

b. Do not use asphalt or contemporary materials that mimic other materials for sidewalks within the historic districts.

2.1 Wood (pages 66)

2.1.10. Do not introduce wood features or details to a building that would create a false historical appearance.

3.6 Porches, Entrances, & Balconies (Pages 98-99)

3.6.6. If new porches or entrances are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

3.6.10. Do not introduce porch, entrance, or balcony features or details to a building that would create a false historical appearance.

4.5 Doors & Windows (pages 124-125)

4.5.1. Design new buildings so that window and door openings are compatible with buildings in the immediate surroundings when the window and door openings are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. This compatibility includes:

- a. the ratio of solids (walls) to voids (windows and doors)
- b. the rhythm and placement of windows and door openings
- c. the proportions of window and door openings (ratio of width to height)
- d. the overall size and shape of window and door openings

4.5.2. Design new buildings so that the articulation of window and door openings is compatible with buildings in the immediate surroundings when that articulation is important in defining the overall historic character of the district. For example, openings are generally recessed on a masonry building while doors and windows are surrounded by raised trim on a frame building. New openings that are flush with the rest of the wall are not appropriate on traditionally styled buildings.

4.5.3. Design new buildings so that the pattern and style of windows and doors are compatible with the windows and doors of buildings in the immediate surroundings when the pattern and style of windows and doors is important in defining the overall historic character of the district and are consistent with the overall style of the building.

4.5.4. Do not install windows, doors, or sidelights with two-dimensional simulations of pane subdivisions, such as snap-in muntins. If not true divided light, glazing should have three-dimensional grills affixed to both the interior and exterior of the window with shadow bars between insulated glass panes.

4.5.5. Install windows and doors constructed of materials that are compatible with the windows and doors of buildings in the immediate surroundings when those materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. These include wood, aluminum-clad, and fiberglass-clad wood windows as well as wood, metal, metal-clad wood, or fiberglass doors. Vinyl and vinyl-clad windows are not appropriate in the historic districts.

4.6 Porches & Entrances (page 127)

4.6.2. Design porches to provide usable outdoor space by ensuring a minimum depth of six feet.

4.6.4. Design porches and entrances to be compatible with the overall architectural style of the building.

4.6.5. Select materials and architectural details that are compatible with both the architectural style of the new building and with buildings in the immediate surroundings in terms of size, composition, texture, pattern, color, and detail when those materials and details are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

4.6.6. It is generally inappropriate to use synthetic (vinyl, aluminum, PVC, plastic, resin, fiberboard) siding and details within the historic districts. However, substitute materials may be considered for trim, porch elements, and other decorative features that are susceptible to repeated moisture infiltration and rot.

4.6.7. Frame porches with raised foundations should have tongue-and-groove porch floors with boards laid perpendicular to the façade of the house. Do not use wood decking for porch floors.

4.7 Garages, Carports, & Accessory Structures (pages 130-131)

4.7.1. Introduce compatible new garages, carports, and accessory buildings, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district.

4.7.2. Site new garages, carports, and accessory buildings in traditional locations that are compatible with the character of the building and site, typically beyond the rear wall of the primary building on the site.

4.7.3. Site new garages, carports, and accessory buildings to be consistent with garages and accessory buildings in the immediate surroundings, both in orientation to and setback from the street as well as in spacing between and distance from other buildings, especially when the siting is important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Whenever possible, locate garages, carports, or accessory structures behind the primary structure, in a rear yard. Structures may be placed in side yards only when rear setbacks do not allow for enough space. New garages, carports, and accessory structures are not appropriate in front yards.

4.7.4. Design and site new garages, carports, and accessory buildings so they do not compromise the overall historic character of the site, including its topography, and significant site features.

4.7.5. Design new garages, carports, and accessory buildings so that their size, scale, and form do not visually overpower the primary building on this or adjacent sites. Design garages, carports, and accessory buildings to be compatible with, but secondary to, the primary building in size, scale, and building and roof form.

4.7.6. Design new garages, carports, and accessory buildings to be compatible in height, form, and proportion with garages and accessory buildings in the immediate surroundings when the height, form, and proportion are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

4.7.7. Design new garages, carports, and accessory buildings that are compatible with, but discernible from, historic garages and accessory buildings in the district.

4.7.8. Design new garages, carports, and accessory buildings and their features to be compatible in scale, materials, proportions, and details with the overall historic character of the site and district and with garages and accessory buildings in the immediate surroundings when the scale, materials, proportions, and details are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

a. Select exterior materials and finishes that are compatible with the primary building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color. Smooth-faced cementitious or composite siding that matches the traditional dimension of wood siding is permitted for new accessory buildings.

b. For larger buildings, it is appropriate to echo the form and detailing of the primary structure. However, elements should be reduced in scale to complement the smaller building form and should have less ornate detailing than that on the primary structure.

4.7.9. Design new garages, carports, or accessory building so that the placement, shape, scale, size, materials, pattern, and proportion of windows and doors are compatible with the windows and doors of the primary building on the site and with garages and accessory buildings in the immediate surroundings when those elements of doors and windows are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

a. Windows should follow the standards for New Construction: Doors & Windows.

4.7.10. Locate new metal- or wood-framed storage buildings or carports in rear or side yard locations that are visually screened from the street.

a. Smaller buildings and site improvements can serve as focal points for backyard landscapes but should be minimally detailed and able to be easily removed without creating permanent damage to the site.

b. Prefabricated wood and metal buildings may be introduced if they are compatible in size, scale, form, height, proportion, materials, and detail with other accessory structures in the district. Do not site prefabricated sheds in locations that are visible from the street.

4.8 Additions (pages 134-135)

4.8.1. Introduce compatible new additions, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district.

4.8.2. Site additions in locations that are compatible with the character of the building and site and are minimally visible from the street, typically on rear elevations. Additions may be located on side elevations only when rear setbacks do not allow for enough space and if additions have been carefully designed to retain the spacing of buildings in the district and to minimize their impact on the rhythm of the streetscape or character defining open spaces. Additions are never permitted on front facades.

4.8.3. Site additions to be consistent with additions in the immediate surroundings and to retain the orientation of the existing building as well as the spacing between and distance from other buildings in the immediate surroundings when the siting and spacing are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Maintain the original orientation of the structure with primary entrances on the front façade of the building.

4.8.4. Design and site additions so they do not compromise the overall historic character of the site, including its topography, significant site features, and distinctive views. Do not introduce an addition if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, such as a porch, or if it necessitates the relocation or demolition of historic garages or accessory buildings.

4.8.5. Design and locate additions so that, as much as possible, historic features and details—including windows, doors, chimneys, bays, corner boards, wood shingles, brackets and decorative trim—are not removed or concealed.

4.8.6. Design additions so that their size, scale, and form are compatible with the existing building and do not visually overpower the building on this or adjacent sites.

4.8.7. Design additions to be compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building in their location, size, scale, and building and roof form.

a. Limit the size and scale of additions to minimize their visual impact and maintain private open spaces on the site.

b. Match the foundation height, style, and materials of an addition to the existing building.

c. Differentiate the addition from the wall plane of the existing building and preserve existing cornerboards and trim by stepping back the wall plane of the addition and/or utilizing a hyphen or other small-scale transitional element to connect the addition to the existing building.

- d. Where additions compete in size with the original building, include a hyphen or small-scale connecting wing or to separate the historic building from its new addition.
- e. Utilize similar roof forms and pitches for building additions and, when possible, align the height of the eave line of a new addition with the eave line of the existing building.
- f. Maintain the roof pitch and ridgeline of the existing building. Do not alter or raise the roof ridge of existing buildings in order to accommodate additions. Roof ridges for additions should be secondary to (lower than) those of the main structure.

4.8.8. Design additions using contemporary architecture provided they adhere to the characteristics of the historic district including: materials, siting and setbacks, scale, height, form, proportion, and details.

4.8.9. Minimize damage to the historic building by constructing additions to be structurally self-supporting, where feasible, and attach them to the original building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric. Attach additions in such a manner that, if additions were removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic building would be unimpaired.

4.8.10. Design additions and their features with materials that are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building and historic buildings within the immediate surroundings when the features and materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

- a. Select exterior materials and finishes that are compatible with the original building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color.
- b. Use traditional materials in conventional ways so that additions are in harmony with the buildings in the historic district (i.e., wood siding applied horizontally).
- c. Smooth-faced cementitious or composite siding that matches the traditional dimension of wood siding is permitted for additions.
- d. Do not use synthetic (vinyl, aluminum, PVC, plastic, resin) siding and details on additions within the historic districts unless it can be demonstrated that the material and finishes are compatible with the original building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color.

4.8.11. Design additions and their features with architectural details that are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building and historic buildings within the immediate surroundings when the features and materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

- a. Incorporate materials and details derived from the primary structure.
- b. Extend the hierarchy of architectural details to the addition with embellishments and detailing simplified on less visible side and rear elevations. Locate low-profile solar panels on side or rear elevations, when possible, or on low-sloped roofs where they are minimally visible from the street.

4.8.12. Design additions so that the location, shape, scale, size, materials, pattern, and proportion of windows and doors are compatible with the windows and doors of the existing building and with historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when these elements of doors and windows are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Doors and windows should follow the standards for New Construction: Doors and Windows.

4.8.13. Design porches so that the location, shape, scale, size, materials, and details are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, porches on the existing building. Porches should follow the standards for New Construction: Porches.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission hereby grants the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accord with the plan listed above and the following conditions:

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire, and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Signed - Historic District Commission Deputy Vice Chair, Polly van de Velde

This, the 12th day of September 2023.