



Historic District Commission

Regular Agenda – Certificate of Appropriateness 742 Gimghoul Road (Project #21-024)

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Anya Grahn, Senior Planner

Jake Lowman, Senior Planner

Colleen Willger, Planning Director

Applicant	Filing Date	Meeting Date(s)	Historic District
John R. Bratton on behalf of Gimghoul Corporation, Property Owner	3/19/2021	4/13/2021	Gimghoul
Project Description <p>The applicant proposes to construct a new addition to the Gimghoul Castle to provide ADA compliant restroom facilities. Additional site improvements include the construction of ADA ramps, new sidewalks, and expansion of terraces.</p>			
Proposed Findings of Fact <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Gimghoul castle was constructed in 1926 and is listed on the National Register of Historic Places.2. The applicant proposes to construct a new addition to the castle on the southeast corner of the site along with a circular ADA ramp mimicking the turret of the castle and stone loggia accessing new bathrooms. Additional terraces and sidewalks will be constructed to improve circulation around the castle.3. The existing elevated concrete sidewalk along the west side of the castle will be replaced with a concrete sidewalk that meets ADA requirements.4. On the southern side of the building, a lower terrace will be built to incorporate a ramp for exterior access to the new basement. The concrete slab will be replaced with three-foot square (3'x3') pavers and a portion of an exterior wall and patio will be removed.5. A low rock wall will be removed on the southeast corner of the castle and replaced by the new addition.6. Stone removed from the existing southeast corner of the building will be used to clad the new walls. The applicant proposes to match the existing stonework to compliment the original materials. Precast concrete roof parapet overflow scuppers, windowsills, and wall banding accents will mimic those stone features found on the castle.7. The applicant proposes to replace three existing windows on the east side. New doors and windows will have custom millwork to match the building's existing doors and windows.8. Wrought iron handrails will include the Gimghoul feature. Metal grates matching the metal grate work on the windows will be installed on new windows and painted block.9. The conical roof over the upper landing of the loggia will be covered with standing seam copper.10. The applicant will install a chain-hung chandelier light under the conical roof addition. Recessed ceiling-mounted LED fixtures will also be installed in the archways of the extended loggia, lavatory and basement entrances. Recessed light fixtures will be used on the steps and walkways, and ramp walk to the basement.			
Applicable Design Guidelines <p><i>Site Features & Plantings</i> (page 11):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">8. Introduce compatible, new site features or plantings with care so that the overall historic character of the site and district is not diminished or compromised. It is not appropriate to introduce incompatible site features or equipment—including raised planting beds, landscape timbers and other contemporary edging materials, swimming pools, satellite dishes, solar collectors, mechanical equipment, transformers, or "hot boxes"—in locations that compromise the overall historic character of the building, site, or surrounding streetscape. <p><i>Walkways, Driveways, & Off-Street Parking</i> (page 19):</p>			

7. Introduce compatible new walls and fences, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the site or district. Site new walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas in locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district and locate them so the general topography of the site and mature trees and other significant site features are not altered, damaged, or lost.
9. Construct new walkways, driveways, and offstreet parking areas in traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.

Exterior Lighting (page 23):

7. Introduce new exterior lighting fixtures with care so that the overall historic character of the building, site, and district is not compromised or diminished. Select and site new lighting fixtures so their location, orientation, height, brightness, scale, and design are compatible with the historic district and its human scale.
8. Introduce low-level lighting in residential areas as needed to ensure safety and security. Minimize their impact on the overall historic character of the site by selectign discreet, unobtrusive fixtures, such as footlights, recessed lights, directional lights, and lights on pedestrian-scaled posts.

Accessibility & Life Safety Considerations (page 47):

2. Meet accessibility and life safety code requirements in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the building site and its significant features.
3. Meet accessibility and life safety code requirements in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the building and its significant architectural features.
4. Introduce new or alternate means of access to the historic building, as needed, in ways that do not compromise the historic character of the entrance or front porch.
5. Design accessibility and life safety code features—such as ramps, handrails, and mechanical lifts—so they are compatible with the historic building in design, scale, materials, and finish.
6. Minimize the visual impact of life safety features—such as fire doors, elevator additions, and fire stairs—through compatible design and discreet siting. Locate new life safety features in locations that do not compromise the architectural integrity of the building and that are not visible from the street. Design life safety features to be compatible with the historic building in scale, proportion, materials, and finish

Additions (page 55):

1. Introduce additions in locations that are not visible from the street—usually on rear elevations, inset from either rear building corner. Locate additions carefully so they do not damage or conceal significant building features or details. It is not appropriate to introduce an addition if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, such as a porch or mature tree.
2. Minimize damage to the historic building by constructing additions to be structurally self-supporting, where feasible, and attach them to the original building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric.
3. Limit the size and scale of an addition to minimize its visual impact. It is not appropriate to introduce an addition if it will visually overpower the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.
4. Design an addition and its features so they are compatible in scale, materials, proportions, and details with the historic building. Select exterior materials that are compatible with those of the historic building in terms of module, composition, texture, pattern, color, and detail.
5. Design an addition so it is compatible with yet discernable from the historic building.
6. Maintain and protect significant site features from damage during or as a consequence of related site work or construction.

Congruity Findings

Based on the Findings of Facts and the relevant Design Guidelines referenced above, the HDC proposes congruity findings for the following Criteria as specified per LUMO Section 3.6.2(e):

Criterion A: The height of the building in relation to the average height of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found within the historic district.

Criterion B: The setback and placement on the lot of the building in relation to the average setback and placement of the nearest adjacent and opposite buildings are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found within the historic district.

Criterion C: Exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found within the historic district.

Criterion D: Architectural detailing, such as lintels, cornices, brick bond and foundation materials are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found within the historic district.

Criterion E: Roof shapes, forms, and materials are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found within the historic district.

Criterion F: Proportion, shape, positioning and location, pattern, and size of any elements of fenestration are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found within the historic district.

Criterion G: General form and proportions of buildings and structures are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found within the historic district.

Criterion H: Appurtenant fixtures and other features, such as lighting, are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found within the historic district.

Criterion I: Structural conditions and soundness are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found within the historic district.

Criterion J: Architectural scale of the additions and site improvements are ***congruous/incongruous*** with those found within the historic district.

Condition of Approval

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission ***approves/denies*** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it ***would not/would be incongruous*** with the special character of the district.