

MEMORANDUM

TO: Chapel Hill Historic District Commission

FROM: Britany Waddell, Planning Director
Anya Grahn-Federmack, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner II

SUBJECT: 104 N. Boundary Street: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)
(PIN 9788-68-3841, HDC-23-20)

FILING DATE: August 11, 2023

DATE: September 12, 2023

COA SUMMARY

Taylor Smith, Kersting Architecture, on behalf of the owner, Derek Winstanly requests a COA to:

- Construct new stacked stone walls measuring 8- to 18-inches in height in the backyard. In some areas, the stone walls will terminate at a 24-inch pier that will hold new exterior lighting fixtures. The walls will be stone throughout, not a veneer, and incorporate a buff stone cap.
- Addition of a new stone walkway connecting the gravel driveway to the rear entry stairs.
- Replacing the existing round, fiberglass columns on the porch with new square, wood columns in order to screen the porch. New French screen doors will be incorporated on the front façade of the porch and will match the patterning of the existing doors on the sunroom on the south elevation of the house.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The proposed location is zoned Residential-2 (R-2) and is in the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

BACKGROUND

August 11, 2023	The applicant submits a COA application for the work described above.
-----------------	---

DISCUSSION

The house is listed as a contributing building in the Chapel Hill National Register Historic District Boundary Increase.

If the COA is granted for the exterior change, the applicant would then be required to obtain any necessary zoning compliance and building permits from the Town.

NOTE

The [Chapel Hill Historic Districts Design Principles and Standards](https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf)¹ are incorporated into the record by reference.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment 1 – Written Decision (approving the COA)
2. [Special Character Essay – Franklin-Rosemary Historic District \(pages 25-30\)](https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf)²
3. Application Materials

¹https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

²https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

WRITTEN DECISION - APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

WRITTEN DECISION APPROVING AN APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 104 NORTH BOUNDARY STREET (PIN 9788-68-3841, Project #HDC-23-20)

WHEREAS, having reviewed the applicant's argument and various documents and other evidence submitted at the hearing on this matter, and having heard public comment on the application, the Historic District Commission (HDC) finds as facts those facts summarized by the Chair at the conclusion of the Commission's hearing of this matter and hereby incorporates them by reference as Commission Findings of Fact; and finds that such facts are supported by competent, material, and substantial evidence presented to the Commission; and

BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic District Commission of the Town of Chapel Hill that, having considered the requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) at 104 N. Boundary Street to construct stacked stone walls in the backyard, incorporate landscape lighting, and replace the columns and screen the porch on the north side of the house.

In accord with the improvements on the attached site plan, and identified as Orange County Property Identifier Number 9788-68-3841, the Board makes the following finding:

1. The requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is not incongruous with the special character of the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

The following Design Standards apply to the Application:

1.3 Walls & Fences (pages 48-49)

1.3.6. Site new walls and fences in configurations and locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district and consistent with the location and height of other walls and fences in the district.

1.3.7. Construct new walls using traditional materials and designs that are compatible in configuration, height, material, scale, and detail with the character of the building, site, and district.

- a. Walls in front and side yards should generally not exceed 30" and should be constructed of red brick or fieldstone.
- b. Walls constructed of cut stone, bare concrete block, or with thin stone veneers applied to concrete or other structural block are not appropriate in locations visible from the street.

1.6 Exterior Lighting (page 58)

1.6.5. Introduce new exterior lighting fixtures with care so that the overall historic character of the building, site, and district is not compromised or diminished. Select and site new lighting fixtures so their location, orientation, height, brightness, scale, and design are compatible with the historic district and its human scale. Fixtures should emit a white or warm spectrum light; fluorescent, neon, blinking, or colored lighting is not appropriate in the historic districts.

1.6.6. Introduce low-level lighting in residential areas as needed to ensure safety and security. Minimize their impact on the overall historic character of the site by selecting discreet fixtures—such as footlights, recessed lights, directional lights, and lights on pedestrian-scaled posts—and installing them in unobtrusive locations.

1.6.7. Introduce lighting on commercial buildings as necessary for pedestrian safety or to illuminate signage. Minimize the impact of lighting and maintain the overall historic character of the site by selecting discreet fixtures—such as recessed lights, directional lights, and lights on pedestrian-scaled posts—and installing them in unobtrusive locations.

1.6.8. Control the direction and range of new lighting so it does not invade adjacent properties. Locate low-level or directional site lighting and motion detectors with care to ensure that light does not invade adjacent properties. Do not introduce bright security lights, floodlights, continuous lighting, or uplighting that over illuminates the facades or front yards of houses.

3.6 Porches, Entrances, & Balconies (pages 98-99)

3.6.1. Retain and preserve the materials and decorative and functional features of porches, entrances, and balconies that are important in defining the overall historic character of buildings within the historic districts. These include, but are not limited to, the porch form and configuration; posts, columns, and pilasters; railings and balustrades; brackets, latticework, and friezes; steps, piers, and porch floors.

3.6.2. Protect and maintain the details, features, materials, and surfaces of historic porches, entrances, and balconies through a program of regular maintenance and repair using accepted preservation methods.

3.6.4. Replace in kind any feature or surface, or portion thereof, of a porch, entrance, or balcony that is too deteriorated to repair, taking care to replace only the deteriorated portion rather than the entire feature. Replacement features and surfaces should match the original in material, design, dimension, configuration, pattern, detail, and texture. Consider a compatible substitute material for wood (including fiber cement board, cellular PVC, or plastic composite trim or siding) only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible or there is an ongoing water infiltration problem, and the wood to be replaced is a painted wood to which the substitute material can be matched. Vinyl is not an appropriate substitute material.

3.6.7. Do not remove or conceal materials or details of historic porches, entrances, and balconies including, but not limited to, columns, balustrades, brackets, pilasters, steps, floors, ceilings, cornices, and trim.

3.6.8. Do not remove, screen, or enclose a porch, entrance, or balcony on a primary, street-facing elevation.

- a. Consider screening a porch or balcony on a side or rear elevation only if the design will preserve the historic character of the porch or balcony.
- b. Consider enclosing a porch or balcony on rear elevation only if the design will preserve the historic character of the porch or balcony.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission hereby grants the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accord with the plan listed above and the following conditions:

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three

hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire, and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Signed - Historic District Commission Deputy Vice Chair, Polly van de Velde

This, the 12th day of September 2023.