

MEMORANDUM

TO: Chapel Hill Historic District Commission

FROM: Britany Waddell, Planning Director
Anya Grahn-Federmack, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner II

SUBJECT: 207 W. Cameron Avenue: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Amendment
(PIN 9788-36-4013, HDC-23-12)

FILING DATE: July 7, 2023

DATE: September 12, 2023

COA SUMMARY

The applicant, Chris Cook, on behalf of Sigma Phi Epsilon, requests a COA amendment for:

- Wood trim and siding materials to be replaced with Hardie cement boards.
- Exterior ceiling panels and existing vents to be replaced with Hardie cement panels and new metal vents.
- Window trim will be wrapped with new aluminum to repair damaged metal.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The proposed location is zoned Office/Institutional-2 (OI-2) and is in the Cameron-McCauley Historic District.

BACKGROUND

June 14, 2023	The applicant submits an after-the-fact COA (ATF COA) application to replace asphalt shingle roofing, flashing, and new gutters
June 16, 2023	Staff approves the ATF COA for the roofing materials, flashing, and gutters. Staff informs that the remaining items in the scope of work will require Historic District Commission (HDC) approval.
July 7, 2023	The applicant submits additional materials to amend the COA for replacing existing wood siding, trim, and metal window trim with Hardie board and new metal.

DISCUSSION

The building was constructed in 1983, and it is listed as non-contributing in the West Chapel Hill National Register Historic District. The applicant, Chris Cook, on behalf of Sigma Phi Epsilon, requests a COA amendment for changes to the exterior materials. The applicant proposes to replace existing wood trim and siding materials with Hardie cement. The existing window trim will be wrapped with new aluminum to repair damaged metal and new metal vents are proposed.

If the COA is granted for the exterior change, the applicant would then be required to obtain any necessary zoning compliance and building permits from the Town.

NOTE

The [*Chapel Hill Historic Districts Design Principles and Standards*](#)¹ are incorporated into the record by reference.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment 1 – Written Decision (approving the COA)
2. [Special Character Essay – Cameron-McCauley Historic District \(pages 31-35\)](#)²
3. Application Materials

¹https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

²https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

WRITTEN DECISION - APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

WRITTEN DECISION APPROVING AN APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 207 W. CAMERON AVENUE (PIN 9788-36-4013, PROJECT #HDC-23-12)

WHEREAS, having reviewed the applicant's argument and various documents and other evidence submitted at the hearing on this matter, and having heard public comment on the application, the Historic District Commission (HDC) finds as facts those facts summarized by the Chair at the conclusion of the Commission's hearing of this matter and hereby incorporates them by reference as Commission Findings of Fact; and finds that such facts are supported by competent, material, and substantial evidence presented to the Commission; and

BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic District Commission of the Town of Chapel Hill that, having considered the requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) at 207 W. Cameron Avenue, requested by Chris Cook, on behalf of Sigma Phi Epsilon, for:

- Wood trim and siding materials to be replaced with Hardie cement boards.
- Exterior ceiling panels and existing vents to be replaced with Hardie cement panels and new metal vents.
- Window trim will be wrapped with new aluminum to repair damaged metal.

In accord with the improvements on the attached site plan, and identified as Orange County Property Identifier Number 9788-36-4013, the Board makes the following finding:

1. The requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is not incongruous with the special character of the Cameron-McCauley Historic District.

The following Design Standards apply to the Application:

4.4 Building Materials & Architectural Details (page 122):

4.4.2. Select exterior surface materials and architectural details that are compatible with the style of the house and with the materials of historic buildings in the immediate vicinity, in terms of size, composition, texture, pattern, color, and detail, when those materials and details are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

4.4.3. Use traditional materials including but not limited to brick, stucco, stone, and wood in conventional ways (i.e. wood siding applied horizontally).

4.4.4. Use contemporary materials, including cementitious siding, when they match the appearance, dimension, texture, color, sheen, and visual weight of their counterparts commonly found in the historic districts. Apply materials in a traditional manner that conveys the same visual appearance as historic materials. Do not install artificial siding with a faux-grained texture.

4.4.5. It is generally inappropriate to use synthetic (vinyl, aluminum, PVC, plastic, resin, fiberboard) siding and details within the historic districts as these generally do not reflect the size, scale, proportion, texture, and detail of traditional building materials. However, substitute materials may be considered for trim, porch elements, and other decorative features that are susceptible to repeated moisture infiltration and rot.

4.4.8. Architectural details should be appropriately scaled and compatible with the overall architectural style of the building. If emulating historic architectural styles, ensure that the proportion and scale of the trim or feature relates to those on historic buildings within the district.

4.5 Doors & Windows (page 124)

4.5.5. Install windows and doors constructed of materials that are compatible with the windows and doors of buildings in the immediate surroundings when those materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. These include wood, aluminum-clad, and fiberglass-clad wood windows as well as wood, metal, metal-clad wood, or fiberglass doors. Vinyl and vinyl-clad windows are not appropriate in the historic districts.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission hereby grants the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accord with the plan listed above and the following conditions:

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire, and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Signed - Historic District Commission Deputy Vice Chair, Polly van de Velde

This, the 12th day of September 2023.