

MEMORANDUM

TO: Chapel Hill Historic District Commission

FROM: Britany Waddell, Planning Director
Anya Grahn-Federmack, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner II

SUBJECT: 208 Hillsborough Street: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)
(PIN 9788-58-1761, HDC-23-15)

FILING DATE: July 13, 2023

DATE: September 12, 2023, October 10, 2023

COA SUMMARY

Avery Russell, the owner, requests a COA to convert the existing screened porch into a three-seasons room by installing siding and windows. A new porch roof will be constructed above the door on the south (rear) elevation above a new door.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The proposed location is zoned Residential-2 (R-2) and is in the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

BACKGROUND

July 13, 2023	The applicant submits a COA application for the work described above.
September 12, 2023	The Historic District Commission reviewed the application and requested additional design changes and information. (See Meeting Materials ¹ .)

DISCUSSION

The house is listed as a contributing building in the Chapel Hill National Register Historic District Boundary Increase. The National Register sheet also notes that the side porch and rear porch enclosure were added after 2002. The proposed windows and siding for the three-seasons room will match the existing house. Stained glass is also proposed for two windows on the south (rear) elevation.

If the COA is granted for the exterior change, the applicant would then be required to obtain any necessary zoning compliance and building permits from the Town.

NOTE

¹ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=6326541&GUID=7E1C5238-0967-4726-A1EB-D960CF2FAFBD&Options=&Search=>

The [*Chapel Hill Historic Districts Design Principles and Standards*](#)² are incorporated into the record by reference.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment 1 – Written Decision (approving the COA)
2. [Special Character Essay – Franklin-Rosemary Historic District \(pages 25-30\)](#)³
3. Application Materials

²https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

³https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

WRITTEN DECISION - APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

WRITTEN DECISION APPROVING AN APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 208 HILLSBOROUGH STREET (PIN 9788-58-1761, Project #HDC-23-15)

WHEREAS, having reviewed the applicant's argument and various documents and other evidence submitted at the hearing on this matter, and having heard public comment on the application, the Historic District Commission (HDC) finds as facts those facts summarized by the Chair at the conclusion of the Commission's hearing of this matter and hereby incorporates them by reference as Commission Findings of Fact; and finds that such facts are supported by competent, material, and substantial evidence presented to the Commission; and

BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic District Commission of the Town of Chapel Hill that, having considered the requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) at 208 Hillsborough Street to convert the existing screened porch into a three-seasons room by installing siding and windows and install an awning at the room's rear.

In accord with the improvements on the attached site plan, and identified as Orange County Property Identifier Number 9788-58-1761, the Board makes the following finding:

1. The requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is not incongruous with the special character of the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

The following Design Standards apply to the Application:

3.6 Porches, Entrances, & Balconies (pages 98-99)

3.6.6. If new porches or entrances are necessary, locate them on a side or rear elevation where they are minimally visible from the street, ensuring that they do not damage character-defining features or materials or otherwise compromise the architectural integrity of the building.

4.5 Doors & Windows (pages 124-125)

4.5.4. Do not install windows, doors, or sidelights with two-dimensional simulations of pane subdivisions, such as snap-in muntins. If not true divided light, glazing should have three-dimensional grills affixed to both the interior and exterior of the window with shadow bars between insulated glass panes.

4.5.5. Install windows and doors constructed of materials that are compatible with the windows and doors of buildings in the immediate surroundings when those materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. These include wood, aluminum-clad, and fiberglass-clad wood windows as well as wood, metal, metal-clad wood, or fiberglass doors. Vinyl and vinyl-clad windows are not appropriate in the historic districts.

4.5.7. Do not use tinted, frosted, or mirrored glass where visible from the street. Translucent or low-e glass may be strategies to reduce solar heat gain.

4.8 Additions (pages 134-136)

4.8.6. Design additions so that their size, scale, and form are compatible with the existing building and do not visually overpower the building on this or adjacent sites.

4.8.7. Design additions to be compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building in their location, size, scale, and building and roof form.

- a. Limit the size and scale of additions to minimize their visual impact and maintain private open spaces on the site.
- b. Match the foundation height, style, and materials of an addition to the existing building.
- c. Differentiate the addition from the wall plane of the existing building and preserve existing corner boards and trim by stepping back the wall plane of the addition and/or utilizing a hyphen or other small-scale transitional element to connect the addition to the existing building.
- d. Where additions compete in size with the original building, include a hyphen or small-scale connecting wing or to separate the historic building from its new addition.
- e. Utilize similar roof forms and pitches for building additions and, when possible, align the height of the eave line of a new addition with the eave line of the existing building.
- f. Maintain the roof pitch and ridgeline of the existing building. Do not alter or raise the roof ridge of existing buildings in order to accommodate additions. Roof ridges for additions should be secondary to (lower than) those of the main structure.

4.8.10. Design additions and their features with materials that are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building and historic buildings within the immediate surroundings when the features and materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

- a. Select exterior materials and finishes that are compatible with the original building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color.
- b. Use traditional materials in conventional ways so that additions are in harmony with the buildings in the historic district (i.e., wood siding applied horizontally).
- c. Smooth-faced cementitious or composite siding that matches the traditional dimension of wood siding is permitted for additions.
- d. Do not use synthetic (vinyl, aluminum, PVC, plastic, resin) siding and details on additions within the historic districts unless it can be demonstrated that the material and finishes are compatible with the original building in terms of scale, dimension, pattern, detail, finish, texture, and color.

4.8.11. Design additions and their features with architectural details that are compatible with, but discernible from and secondary to, the existing building and historic buildings within the immediate surroundings when the features and materials are important in defining the overall historic character of the district.

- a. Incorporate materials and details derived from the primary structure.
- b. Extend the hierarchy of architectural details to the addition with embellishments and detailing simplified on less visible side and rear elevations. Locate low-profile solar panels on side or rear elevations, when possible, or on low-sloped roofs where they are minimally visible from the street.

4.8.12. Design additions so that the location, shape, scale, size, materials, pattern, and proportion of windows and doors are compatible with the windows and doors of the existing building and with historic buildings in the immediate surroundings when these elements of doors and windows are important in defining the overall historic character of the district. Doors and windows should follow the standards for New Construction: Doors and Windows.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission hereby grants the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accord with the plan listed above and the following conditions:

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire, and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Signed - Historic District Commission Deputy Vice Chair, Polly van de Velde

This, the 12th day of September 2023.