

MEMORANDUM

TO: Chapel Hill Historic District Commission

FROM: Colleen Willger, Planning Director
Anya Grahn, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner II

SUBJECT: 222 Vance Street: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)
(PIN 9788-34-1702, HDC-22-4)

FILING DATE: September 27, 2022

DATE: October 11, 2022

COA SUMMARY

The applicant, Maxine Eichner, requests a COA for:

- Adding a screen door on the screened porch as well as three wood steps and associated railings.
- Constructing an outdoor kitchen consisting of a bluestone counter and painted brick base measuring approximately 6 feet in length by 2.6 feet in depth. The cabinet incorporates two stainless steel doors.
- Adding a wood arbor measuring 6 feet 4 inches by 18 feet that leads from the parking area to the backyard.
- Constructing a new 6-foot-tall wood fence along the rear property line.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The subject lot is zoned Residential-2 (R-2) and is located in the Cameron-McCauley Historic District.

BACKGROUND

September 27, 2022	The applicant submits a request COA for the scope of work outlined above.
--------------------	---

DISCUSSION

The applicant is requesting a COA to **allow**:

- Adding a screen door on the screened porch as well as three wood steps and associated railings.
- Constructing an outdoor kitchen consisting of a bluestone counter and painted brick base measuring approximately 6 feet in length by 2.6 feet in depth. The cabinet incorporates two stainless steel doors.
- Adding a wood arbor measuring 6 feet 4 inches by 18 feet that leads from the parking area to the backyard.
- Constructing a new 6-foot-tall wood fence along the rear property line.

The site design is shown in the application materials (Attachment 4).

If the COA is granted for the exterior changes, the applicants would then be required to obtain any necessary zoning compliance and building permits from the Town.

NOTE

The [*Chapel Hill Historic Districts Design Principles and Standards*](#)¹ are incorporated into the record by reference.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment 1 – Written Decision (approving the COA)
2. History
3. [Special Character Essay – Cameron-McCauley Historic District \(pages 31-35\)](#)²
4. Application Materials

¹https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

²https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

WRITTEN DECISION - APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

WRITTEN DECISION APPROVING AN APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 222 VANCE STREET (PIN 9788-34-1702 PROJECT # HDC-22-4)

WHEREAS, having reviewed the applicant's argument and various documents and other evidence submitted at the hearing on this matter, and having heard public comment on the application, the Historic District Commission (HDC) finds as facts those facts summarized by the Chair at the conclusion of the Commission's hearing of this matter and hereby incorporates them by reference as Commission Findings of Fact; and finds that such facts are supported by competent, material, and substantial evidence presented to the Commission; and

BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic District Commission of the Town of Chapel Hill that, having considered the requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) at 222 Vance Street, requested by Maxine Eichner, to allow:

- Adding a screen door on the screened porch as well as three wood steps and associated railings.
- Constructing an outdoor kitchen consisting of a bluestone counter and painted brick base measuring approximately 6 feet in length by 2.6 feet in depth. The cabinet incorporates two stainless steel doors.
- Adding a wood arbor measuring 6 feet 4 inches by 18 feet that leads from the parking area to the backyard.
- Constructing a new 6-foot-tall wood fence along the rear property line.

In accord with the improvements on the attached site plan, and identified as Orange County Property Identifier Number 9788-34-1702, the Board makes the following finding:

1. The requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is not incongruous with the special character of the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

The following Design Standards apply to the Application:

1.1 Site Features: Standards (page 42):

1.1.7. Introduce new site features to be compatible in scale, design, and materials with the overall historic character of the site and district. Utilize traditional materials in the construction of benches, terraces, gazebos, trellises, fences, and walls.

1.3 Walls & Fences: Standards (pages 48-49):

1.3.6. Site new walls and fences in configurations and locations that are compatible with the character of the building, site, and district and consistent with the location and height of other walls and fences in the district.

1.3.9. Introduce contemporary utilitarian walls and fences in rear yards only where they do not compromise the historic character of the building, site, or district.

- a. Wood, composite, or chain link fences exceeding 30" in height should be relegated to rear yards, beginning beyond the rear corner of the main block of the building and should be screened with landscaping materials as much as possible.
- b. Sites with significant variations in topography should consider segmented walls and fences that step up and down to follow the topography.

3.9 Sustainability & Energy Efficiency: Standards (pages 107-108):

3.9.4. Introduce full-light storm or screened doors constructed of wood or aluminum. Install doors so they do not obscure or damage the existing door or frame.

- a. Select storm or screened doors with a painted or factory-finished color.
- b. Storm or screened doors with a bare aluminum finish may be appropriate for post-1945 buildings in the historic districts.

3.9.7. Locate new mechanical equipment, utilities, and sustainable site features—including air-conditioning and heating units, meters, exposed pipes, rain barrels or cisterns, and raised planting beds—in locations that are minimally visible from the street and do not alter or remove historic fabric from the building or do not diminish or compromise the overall character of the building, site, or district. Screen ground-level equipment from view with vegetation or fencing.

3.9.11. Do not install condensers, skylights, ventilators, antennas, satellite dishes, and mechanical or communication equipment on roof slopes or building elevations that are visible from the street or in locations that visually compromise the architectural character of the historic building.

4.10 Decks & Patios (page 143):

4.10.1. Locate decks and patios on rear elevations or in inconspicuous areas that are minimally visible from the public right-of-way.

4.10.2. Locate decks and patios in locations that do not damage or conceal significant building or site features or details. Do not introduce a deck or patio if it requires the loss of a character-defining building or site feature, including porches, projecting bays or wings, historic garages, accessory buildings, and retaining walls.

4.10.3. Retain and preserve historic building materials and trim and minimize the visual impact of a deck or patio by designing them to be inset from the building's corners.

4.10.4. Limit the size and scale of decks and patios to minimize their visual impact. Do not introduce a deck or patio if it will visually overpower the building or site or substantially alter the proportion of constructed area to unbuilt area on the site.

4.10.6. Design and detail decks and any related steps and railings to be compatible with the historic building in scale, material, configuration, and proportion. Consider designing deck piers and foundation infill to relate to the house in the same way that a porch would. However, avoid replicating historic porch posts and railings for contemporary, uncovered decks.

4.10.7. Construct decks of wood or substitute materials that visually replicate wood. When visible from the street, construct patios in traditional materials—including red brick, flagstone, and Chapel Hill grit.

4.10.8. Minimize damage to the historic building by designing decks and patios to be structurally self-supporting. Attach decks to the building carefully to minimize the loss of historic fabric and to allow for their removal in the future. Retain a planting strip between patios and building foundations to allow for proper drainage.

4.10.9. Screen the structural framing of decks with foundation plantings, lattice, or other compatible screening materials.

4.10.10. Maintain and protect significant site features from damage during or as a consequence of deck-or patio related site work or construction.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission hereby grants the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accord with the plan listed above and the following conditions::

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Signed - Historic District Commission Chair, Sean Murphy

This, the 11th day of October, 2022.