

# **TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL**

Town Hall 405 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard Chapel Hill, NC 27514

# Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

Chair Brian Daniels
Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde
Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick
Michael Booth

Josh Gurlitz Duncan Lascelles Clarke Martin David Schwartz

Tuesday, March 12, 2024

6:30 PM

RM 110 | Council Chamber

## **Language Access Statement**

For interpretation or translation services, call 919-969-5105.

ဘာသာပြန်ဆိုခြင်းနှင့် စကားပြန်ခြင်းအတွက်၊ (၉၁၉) ၉၆၉-၅၁ဝ၅ ကိုဖုန်းခေါ်ပါ။

如需口头或 书面翻译服 务,请拨打 919-969-5105.

Para servicios de interpretación o traducción, llame al 919-969-5105.

လၢတၢ်ကတိၤကျိုးထံ မ့တမၢဴ လၢတၢ်ကွဲးကျိုးထံအတၢ်မၤစာၤအဂ်ီ ၢ် ကိုးဘ၃် (၉၁၉)-၉၆၉-၅၁၀၅

# **Opening**

Roll Call

Anya Grahn-Federmack, Staff Liaison, Charnika Harrell, Staff Liaison, Kevin Hornik, Counsel to the Commission

Present 6 - Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy

McCormick, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan

Lascelles, and David Schwartz

**Absent** 2 - Chair Brian Daniels , and Clarke Martin

Secretary reads procedures into the record

Commission Chair reads the Public Charge

# **Approval of Agenda**

Commissioner McCormick moved, seconded by Gurlitz, to approve the amended agenda. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 6 - Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy

McCormick, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles,

and David Schwartz

**Absent:** 2 - Chair Brian Daniels, and Clarke Martin

### **Announcements**

Grahn-Federmack informed commissioners that the April meeting would be canceled due to lack of quorum. She also reminded the commissioners to complete a poll to share their availability for a special meeting to vote on the night's written decisions.

#### **Petitions**

# **Approval of Minutes**

1. February 13, 2024 Action Minutes

[24-0104]

Commissioner Gurlitz moved, seconded by McCormick, to approve the February 13, 2024, minutes. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye:

 6 - Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and David Schwartz

Absent:

2 - Chair Brian Daniels, and Clarke Martin

#### Information

2. Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Approvals & Maintenance Memos

[24-0105]

Commissioner Schwartz asked for clarity on staff approval authority for generators. Grahn-Federmack stated that generators were treated like mechanical equipment and pointed to the sustainability section of the Design Principles and Standards. Schwartz also asked for confirmation that the brick walkway for 735 Gimghoul Road would be brick and not concrete pavers. Grahn-Federmack confirmed.

#### **Old Business**

**3.** 740 Gimghoul Road

[24-0106]

Chris Jones stated that his presentation focused on the proposed fence around the pool. He presented photos and Google map images of wood fences along Gimghoul Road. He also presented a photo of the subject property from the street to demonstrate how the landscaped area along the street screened the property. He explained that the revised proposal was for a 4-foot-tall white, picket wood fence. He presented a photo and three-dimensional rendering of what the fence would look like and dimensions of the fence. He also presented a site plan to show the fence's location.

Commissioner Schwartz asked Jones to confirm the height of the fence. Jones confirmed that the fence would be 4 feet tall, which was required by building code for pool fences. He also mentioned that some of the photos he presented earlier were of fences 4 feet tall, or greater.

There was no public comment.

There was no discussion among commissioners.

Commissioner Lascelles moved, seconded by McCormick, that the application was not incongruous with the special character of the district. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Lascelles and Schwartz asked Counsel Hornik about whether the motion needed to include granting the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA). Hornik explained that the commission would vote on the written decision at the next meeting, and that the written decision would include language about granting the COA.

#### **New Business**

# 4. 103 South Boundary Street

[24-0107]

Grahn-Federmack explained that the application was for stone walls, a patio, and a fence.

Page Gravely, the property owner, stated that his application was for low stone walls for aesthetic

purposes, a fence in the backyard for his dog, and a hardscape patio of natural Pennsylvania bluestone.

Gravely presented a site plan of the property. He explained that the low stone wall would extend from two existing pillars that frame the existing driveway along Boundary Street. He presented photos of the pillars and said the new stone wall would be 18 to 20 inches tall.

Gravely presented photos of his backyard. He explained that the proposed fence would fill in gaps between fences on neighboring properties. He said he would shift the location of the existing shed so it could serve as an added barrier and reduce the length of fence needed to enclose the backyard. He

presented photos of a fence with a lattice design at the top. He said the fence would be 6-feet tall with two 4-foot-tall gates. He mentioned that the proposed fence would be like what was shown in the photos, but the lattice would be more transparent. He also said the fence would be stained to match the existing fence on the property.

Gravely presented photos of the existing sunroom to show the proposed location of the patio. He mentioned that one of the glass windows panes of the sunroom would be replaced with a glass door. He did not present a photo of the proposed glass door but said it would be glass to maintain the look of the existing windows. He presented photos of Pennsylvania bluestone for the patio and said that the patio would be about 20 inches tall. He also mentioned that he planned to add more landscaping in the backyard.

Commissioner McCormick asked about moving the shed. Gravely said that he wanted to angle its location to fill in a gap between neighboring fences.

McCormick asked if staff could approve the final design of the fence. Gravely confirmed that the fence would be of the same dimensions as the photo he presented. Commissioner Lascelles asked if the fence would be visible from the street. Gravely confirmed that it would not be visible.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Gurlitz moved, seconded by Booth, that the application was not incongruous with the special character of the district. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye:

6 - Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and David Schwartz

Absent:

2 - Chair Brian Daniels, and Clarke Martin

#### **5.** 304 South Columbia Street

[24-0108]

Grahn-Federmack explained that the application was to replace an existing metal shed, replace panels on an existing dumpster enclosure, and replace a canvas canopy with a wood portico.

David Swanson, a landscape architect, stated that the existing fraternity building was not a contributing structure. He presented a photo that showed

the building's location. He explained that the portico was located on the rear of the building and would not be visible from Columbia Street. He presented a photo of the existing canvas canopy and an existing rear porch. He presented an elevation of the proposed portico and explained that it borrowed elements from the rear porch and front election, mainly the columns. He also explained that the brick walkway underneath the portico would be widened.

Swanson presented a photo of the existing metal shed. He said the proposed shed would be two feet longer and would have wood siding and a shingle roof. He said the new shed would be in the same location and orientation.

Swanson presented a photo of the existing dumpster enclosure. He also presented two options for dark-colored metal gates, one with solid doors and the other with metal slats. He said their interest was to change the color and material of the gate from white vinyl. He said they preferred the solid design.

Commissioner Schwartz asked if the applicant was seeking approval for both options for the dumpster enclosure. Swanson said they preferred a solid, simpler design. Commissioner van de Velde asked if both options were metal. Swanson confirmed they were. Commissioner Gurlitz said he liked the slatted gate design but did not like that it was mimicking a wood gate.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Booth said the base and capital of the proposed portico columns appeared disproportionate. Booth said the capital was too tall.

John Hawkins, an architect, was sworn in. Hawkins said the columns were designed to match the existing columns on the house, and that the columns were unique to the building. Hawkins offered to adjust the proportions.

Gurlitz agreed with Booth but said he did not have a strong opinion about the applicant adjusting the size. Schwartz asked if adjusting the size made the columns more congruous.

Counsel Hornik asked commissioners if they expected the applicant to return later with an elevation drawing of the revised columns or if they were prepared to decide on whether the application was incongruous. Booth reiterated that he thought the base of the columns should be taller than the capital. Hornik advised that the commission would need to determine the

revised proportions of the columns if they were prepared to vote without a revised elevation.

Commissioner Schwartz moved, seconded by Gurlitz, that the application was not incongruous with the special character of the district, provided that the height of the base of the columns is greater than the capital.

Several commissioners mentioned the design of the gate of the dumpster enclosure. Hornik suggested the commission amend the motion to include their selection of the gate to the dumpster enclosure. Schwartz accepted the amendment to the motion to include the gate with the flush-panel design. Gurlitz seconded the amended motion. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye:

 6 - Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and David Schwartz

Absent:

2 - Chair Brian Daniels, and Clarke Martin

Adjournment

Next Meeting - April 9, 2024

Order of Consideration of Agenda Items:

- 1. Staff Presentation
- 2. Applicant's Presentation
- 3. Public Comment
- 4. Board Discussion
- 5. Motion
- 6. Restatement of Motion by Chair
- 7. Vote
- 8. Announcement of Vote by Chair

Public Charge: The Advisory Body pledges its respect to the public. The Body asks the public to conduct themselves in a respectful, courteous manner, both with the Body and with fellow members of the public. Should any member of the Body or any member of the public fail to observe this charge at any time, the Chair will ask the offending person to leave the meeting until that individual regains personal control. Should decorum fail to be restored, the Chair will recess the meeting until a genuine commitment to this public charge is observed.

Unless otherwise noted, please contact the Planning Department at 919-968-2728; planning@townofchapelhill.org for more information on the above referenced applications.

See the Advisory Boards page http://www.townofchapelhill.org/boards for background information on this Board.