

MEMORANDUM

TO: Chapel Hill Historic District Commission

FROM: Britany Waddell, Planning Director
Anya Grahn-Federmack, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner II

SUBJECT: 381 Tenney Circle: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)
(PIN 9788-69-6685, HDC-23-25)

FILING DATE: September 20, 2023

DATE: October 10, 2023

COA SUMMARY

John J. Pringle, Jr. on behalf of owner, Elizabeth C. Pringle, requests a COA to demolish a shed, also referred to as a “little house,” in the backyard damaged by a fallen tree from recent storms. The shed is listed as “Contributing” on the National Register of Historic Places.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The proposed location is zoned Residential-1 (R-1) and is in the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

BACKGROUND

September 20, 2023	The applicant submits a COA application for the work described above.
--------------------	---

DISCUSSION

The Commission should discuss whether the work proposed by the Applicant is or is not incongruous with the special character of the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District. The Applicant has submitted photos of the damaged shed structure located at 381 Tenney Circle, which the Applicant asserts shows the extent of the damage that justifies demolishing the building.

NOTE

The [*Chapel Hill Historic Districts Design Principles and Standards*](#)¹ are incorporated into the record by reference.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment 1 – Written Decision (approving the COA)
2. [Special Character Essay – Franklin-Rosemary Historic District \(pages 25-30\)](#)²
3. Application Materials

¹https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

²https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

WRITTEN DECISION - APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

WRITTEN DECISION APPROVING AN APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 381 TENNEY CIRCLE (PIN 9788-69-6685, PROJECT #HDC-23-25)

WHEREAS, having reviewed the applicant's argument and various documents and other evidence submitted at the hearing on this matter, and having heard public comment on the application, the Historic District Commission (HDC) finds as facts those facts summarized by the Chair at the conclusion of the Commission's hearing of this matter and hereby incorporates them by reference as Commission Findings of Fact; and finds that such facts are supported by competent, material, and substantial evidence presented to the Commission; and

BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic District Commission of the Town of Chapel Hill that, having considered the requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) at 381 Tenney Circle to demolish the storm-damaged shed or "little house."

In accord with the improvements on the attached site plan, and identified as Orange County Property Identifier Number 9788-69-6685, the Board makes the following finding:

1. The requested Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is not incongruous with the special character of the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

The following Design Standards apply to the Application:

5.1 Demolition (page 147)

5.1.1. Consider demolition only when all other preservation alternatives have been exhausted (all alternatives investigated, including structural integrity reports, must be included in the COA). Do not demolish a viable structure in order to create an infill construction opportunity.

5.1.2. Prior to demolition, document the historic building in its original setting—utilizing photographs, site plans, and building drawings—and record the existing site and building through photographs and/or drawings. Include photographs of interiors, exteriors, architectural elements, and streetscapes to contextualize the setting. Provide a copy of the documentation to both the Chapel Hill Historic District Commission and the State Historic Preservation Office.

5.1.3. Salvage or provide the opportunity for preservation organizations and others to salvage reusable building materials and architectural features—including wood flooring, doors, windows, brick and stone, trim, mantels, stair rails and newel posts, and other decorative features—prior to demolition. It is the applicant's responsibility to manage the salvage operation including identification of the salvage company or organization, hiring, contracting, scheduling, supervision, and execution of the salvage operation.

5.1.4. Protect adjacent buildings and significant site features such as mature trees from damage during-or as a result of-the demolition.

5.1.5. Protect any known or newly identified archaeological resources from any damage during-or as a result of-the demolition.

5.1.6. Submit a COA with site plan for the post-removal site stabilization. Clear the site of debris and implement the approved site plan promptly after the demolition.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission hereby grants the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, in accord with the plan listed above and the following conditions:

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire, and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Signed - Historic District Commission Chair, Brian Daniels

This, the 10th day of October 2023.