



TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL

Historic District Commission

Meeting Minutes

Town Hall
405 Martin Luther King Jr.
Boulevard
Chapel Hill, NC 27514

Chair Brian Daniels
Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde
Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick
Michael Booth

Josh Gurlitz
Duncan Lascelles
Clarke Martin

Tuesday, September 10, 2024 6:30 PM RM 110 | Council Chamber

Language Access Statement

For interpretation or translation services, call 919-969-5105.

ဘာသာပြန်ဆိုခြင်းနှင့် စကားပြန်ခြင်းအတွက်၊ (၉၆၉) ၉၆၉-၅၁၀၅ ကိုဖုန်းခေါ်ပါ။

Para servicios de interpretación o traducción, llame al 919-969-5105.

လատ်ကတိကျိုးထံ မှတမာ် လာတင်ကွဲးကျိုးထံအတင်မၠောအဂီၢ် ၢ ကိးဘၣ် (၉၆၉)-၉၆၉-၅၁၀၅

如需口头或
书面翻译服
务，请拨打
919-969-5105.

Opening

Roll Call

Anya Grahn-Federmack, Staff Liaison, Charnika Harrell, Staff Liaison, Kevin Hornik, Counsel to the Commission

Present 6 - Chair Brian Daniels , Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde,
Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and
Clarke Martin

Excused 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

Secretary reads procedures into the record

Commission Chair reads the Public Charge

Approval of Agenda

Commissioner van de Velde moved, seconded by Gurlitz, to approve the agenda.
The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 6 - Chair Brian Daniels , Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Michael
Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and Clarke Martin

Excused: 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

Announcements

Grahn-Federmack reminded commissioners that the next meeting would be October 8th.

Petitions

Approval of Minutes

August 13, 2024 Action Minutes [\[24-0415\]](#)

Commissioner van de Velde moved, seconded by Booth, to approve the August 13, 2024 meeting minutes. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 6 - Chair Brian Daniels , Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and Clarke Martin

Excused: 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

Historic District Commission Candidate Interviews

Historic District Commission Candidate Interviews [\[24-0416\]](#)

The commission interviewed David Hawisher, an attorney, Laura Moore, a landscape architect, and Don Tise, an architect, for the open seats.

Information

Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness Approvals and Maintenance Memos [\[24-0417\]](#)

Old Business

3 Mint Springs Lane [\[24-0418\]](#)

214 Pittsboro Street [\[24-0419\]](#)

Commissioner van de Velde moved, seconded by Gurlitz, to authorize the chair to sign the written decisions for 3 Mint Springs Lane and 214 Pittsboro Street. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 6 - Chair Brian Daniels , Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and Clarke Martin

Excused: 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

500 North Street [\[24-0420\]](#)

Jude Tallman, the applicant and property owner, explained that the biggest challenge with locating parking in the backyard, as preferred by the HDC, was

water runoff. Tallman said that capturing the water would require too much drainage and would require tree removal.

Tallman said they revised the design for the parking area in the front. He explained that the driveway was reduced to a single lane instead of two to lessen the impact on a nearby tree. He also said holly shrubs would be planted along the perimeter of the parking area that would grow to be 3 to 4 feet in height at maturity.

Commissioner Lascelles asked Tallman to walk them through the revised plan. Tallman explained that timbers would border the driveway and the three-car parking area. Lascelles asked about the length of the driveway. Tallman explained that up to three cars could be parked on the driveway.

Commissioner Gurlitz asked for clarity for the shaded area on the plan. Tallman was not sure what the shaded area was. Chair Daniels said he thought the shaded area was new gravel.

Gurlitz asked Tallman if he planned to remove existing trees. Tallman said one dogwood tree would be removed because it was already dying.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner van de Velde said that the number of cars increased from three to six. Chair Daniels said he thought Tallman responded to the specific feedback they gave him at the previous meeting. Commissioners Gurlitz and Martin agreed.

Commissioner van de Velde moved, seconded by Martin, that the application was not incongruous with the special character of the district. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 6 - Chair Brian Daniels , Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and Clarke Martin

Excused: 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

New Business

510 E. Franklin Street

[\[24-0421\]](#)

Steve Sylvester, the property owner, explained the history of the house. He bought the house in 1997 and replaced the porch on the west side of the

house in 2011. He said that two columns from that porch replacement were used to build a new porch. He said that the current proposal was to enclose that porch.

Sylvester presented photos of enclosed porches in the neighborhood. He said he thought the design was compatible with the neighborhood.

Sylvester presented photos of the existing house and the house with the proposed porch. He explained that the proposal was to add transom and full-length windows on all sides and a new exterior door.

Commissioner Gurlitz asked about the transom and pointed out that the other porch did not have a transom. Sylvester explained that the porch on the other side was a room, not a porch. He said he considered reproducing the look, but he liked the transom better. He explained that the transoms would let more light inside.

Commissioner Booth asked why the proposed windows were not 12-over-1 to match the rest of the windows. Sylvester said the windows on the other porch were 12-over-12 but noticed that the photo he presented showed 9-over-9 windows. Sylvester said he did not realize the error. He also stated that he wanted 12-over-12 windows with a 4-pane transom, not 3 panes as shown.

Commissioner van de Velde asked if they could make 12-over-12 windows a condition of the approval. Commissioner Lascelles asked Sylvester why he didn't want 12-over-12 windows on the west side. Sylvester said the west side was narrower, but he did not feel strongly about 12-over-12 on the west side.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Booth wondered if a pair of doors with side lights would work better on the west side. Commissioner Gurlitz said that enclosing porches was a standard practice in the historic districts.

Commissioner Martin moved, seconded by Gurlitz, that the application was not incongruous with the special character of the district if the windows were 12-over-12. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 6 - Chair Brian Daniels , Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and Clarke Martin

Excused: 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

304 N. Boundary Street

[\[24-0422\]](#)

Patrick Hobgood, the architect, explained the history of the property. He explained the site was originally part of the Coker Estate, and the house was built in 2002 and had won several awards for its modernist design. His father had been the architect on the project, and he was now proposing an addition to the house.

Hobgood presented photos from the street. He said that most of the houses on the north side of Boundary Street are visible from the street, but 304 N. Boundary was not.

Hobgood presented photos of the existing house and the site plan. He said the glass cube part of the existing house was for public spaces and the wooden volume was for private spaces, like bedrooms. They decided to build a detached addition instead of adding onto the existing house to balance the design. He said that addition would be connected to the house by a glass bridge.

Hobgood presented elevations for the addition. He said the addition's block shape tied into the shape of the existing house. He explained the glass bridge would use existing window openings. He also stated the new addition would not have any wood siding; it would just be block and glass, and the rooflines of the addition would match the existing house.

Commissioner Gurlitz asked why the addition did not have wood siding. Hobgood said it was maintenance issue. He explained that the wood siding on the existing garage had been replaced at least once since it was built, and the staining was a different color.

Georgia Bizios, a neighbor, spoke in support of the application. There was no other public comment.

Commissioner Gurlitz said Hobgood's presentation focused on the relationship between the addition and the house. He said that the street has three houses from different eras of design and thought, the Coker House, the Peacock House, and this house.

Chair Daniels said the commission had conversations about additions being

different and subordinate to the main house. Daniels asked if Gurlitz thought the proposed addition met those standards. Gurlitz confirmed.

Commissioner Martin moved, seconded by Lascelles, that the application was not incongruous with the special character of the district. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 6 - Chair Brian Daniels , Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and Clarke Martin

Excused: 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

317 McCauley Street

[\[24-0423\]](#)

Blanche Capel said that she brought the house in 2024, and it has been a student residence for some time. She thought the house was loosely a Colonial Revival style, and she believed the house's exterior was in poor condition compared to other houses on the street. She shared photos of nearby houses.

Capel presented a photo of the existing house and described the proposed changes. She said that there was a door on the second floor that was blocked from the inside. She wanted to replace the door with a false window. She also proposed to add shutters to all the windows. The porch roof was flat, and she planned to raise the roof to the bottom of the windows.

Capel presented the proposed materials. She said the new window would match the existing window, except it would not be wood. She shared specifications for the proposed shutters on the first and second floors. She shared specifications for the metal roof and proposed an olive-green roof to match the existing asphalt shingle roof. She also said that many nearby houses had sloped metal porch roofs, shingles, and shutters.

Capel said the house had twelve rooms. She said there were two parking spaces in the front of the house and six in the backyard. She planned to move the two spaces to the back of the house and improve the landscape in the front. She said the gravel area in the backyard would be expanded.

Capel presented a photo of the landscape design. She planned to build a slate patio in the front and fill in the side of the house with mulch and steppingstones. She also mentioned adding a grill pad and planting evergreen, gardenias, and other plantings.

Commissioner Gurlitz asked if the upper roof was shingle. Capel confirmed it was, and she thought it was still functioning. Gurlitz said that shingle roofs have a certain chemistry that could affect the longevity of a metal roof underneath it. He explained that rain deteriorates shingles, and the grit etches the metal. Capel said the shingle roof would need to be replaced eventually, and she may want to replace it with a metal roof.

Commissioner van de Velde asked Capel if she had old pictures of the house that showed shutters on it. Capel said there may be an old picture in the materials. van de Velde asked why the false window could not be a real window. Capel said it would be a window. Capel also explained that she thought changing the roof slope would deter the tenants from climbing on the roof.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner van de Velde asked if changing the slope and material of the roof would change the character. She also questioned if shutters were congruent with the original structure or historical context.

Commissioner Lascelles said the current house looked like it was in limbo, and he thought the proposed changes were an improvement. Commissioner Martin agreed. Martin also said that the incongruity standard applied to the district, and she noted that the applicant presented photos of houses with shutters and slanted roofs. Martin stated that the safety of the tenants was outside of the commission's purview.

Commissioner Booth thought the application was a stylistic change, but he did not think the change was bad.

Commissioner Gurlitz said the house could have changed, but it would be difficult to determine by how much. Gurlitz appreciated moving the cars to the back of the house.

van de Velde was not sure if a grill pad should be in the front of the house. Chair Daniels said they would need to consider it a patio.

Commissioner Martin moved, seconded by Booth, that the application was not incongruous with the special character of the district. The motion carried by a

vote of five to one.

Aye: 5 - Chair Brian Daniels , Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and Clarke Martin

Nay: 1 - Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde

Excused: 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

Discussion

HDC Procedures & State Model Ordinance

[\[24-0408\]](#)

Chair Daniels explained that this item was shared in a previous meeting. He asked if commissioners had any comments on it, and there were none.

Daniels said he thought a lot of the recommendations had already been implemented and he did not see anything that needed immediate attention.

There were no other comments.

Election of Commission Officers

Election of Chair

Commissioner Lascelles moved, seconded by Gurlitz, to re-elect Chair Daniels as Chair. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 6 - Chair Brian Daniels , Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and Clarke Martin

Excused: 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

Election of Vice Chair

Chair Daniels moved, seconded by Lascelles, to elect Commissioner van de Velde as Vice Chair. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 6 - Chair Brian Daniels , Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and Clarke Martin

Excused: 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

Election of Deputy Vice Chair

Chair Daniels asked if anyone wanted to serve as Deputy Vice Chair. He said that Commissioner McCormick was willing to serve again. There were no volunteers. Chair Daniels moved, seconded by Gurlitz, to elect Commissioner McCormick as Deputy Vice Chair. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 6 - Chair Brian Daniels , Vice-Chair Polly van de Velde, Michael Booth, Josh Gurlitz, Duncan Lascelles, and Clarke Martin

Excused: 1 - Deputy Vice-Chair Nancy McCormick

Adjournment

Next Meeting - October 8, 2024

Order of Consideration of Agenda Items:

- 1. Staff Presentation*
- 2. Applicant's Presentation*
- 3. Public Comment*
- 4. Board Discussion*
- 5. Motion*
- 6. Restatement of Motion by Chair*
- 7. Vote*
- 8. Announcement of Vote by Chair*

Public Charge: The Advisory Body pledges its respect to the public. The Body asks the public to conduct themselves in a respectful, courteous manner, both with the Body and with fellow members of the public. Should any member of the Body or any member of the public fail to observe this charge at any time, the Chair will ask the offending person to leave the meeting until that individual regains personal control. Should decorum fail to be restored, the Chair will recess the meeting until a genuine commitment to this public charge is observed.

Unless otherwise noted, please contact the Planning Department at 919-968-2728; planning@townofchapelhill.org for more information on the above referenced applications.

See the Advisory Boards page <http://www.townofchapelhill.org/boards> for background information on this Board.