

MEMORANDUM

TO: Chapel Hill Historic District Commission

FROM: Britany Waddell, Planning Director
Anya Grahn-Federmack, Principal Planner
Charnika Harrell, Planner II

SUBJECT: 211 Hillsborough Street: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)
(PIN 9788-48-9699, Project #HDC-23-32)

FILING DATE: January 11, 2021; Amendment filed April 12, 2024

DATE: May 14, 2024

COA SUMMARY

On February 9, 2021, the Historic District Commission (HDC) approved a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to construct a new basement addition, renovate the house, and complete site improvements and landscaping. Staff and the HDC have previously approved COA amendments for modifications to the approved designs as described below.

The applicant, Nicholas Nakos, on behalf of Scarp Ridge Propco LLC, requests a COA amendment to:

- Replace the existing four (4) vinyl windows on the basement level with wood, simulated divided light units.
- Replace the fiberglass exterior door on the basement level with a half-glass wood door with flat panel.
- Remove stucco from the side porch foundation wall to expose existing brick beneath.
- Remove the through-wall AC unit in the side porch foundation wall and fill it with brick to match existing.
- Replace the existing wood (pine) siding with new wood siding (clear cedar).
- Replace the existing wood (pine) trim at the windows and doors with new wood (mahogany) trim, matching all profiles, materials, and details.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The subject lot is zoned Residential-3 (R-3) and is in the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

BACKGROUND

January 11, 2021	The applicant submits a COA application to: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Replace an existing screened porch with an enclosed porch featuring wood panel walls and divided light double-hung windows• Add a new basement addition on the northwest corner of the house below an existing deck.• Construct a new chimney in front of the existing brick chimney.
------------------	---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace two square double-hung windows with new double-hung divided light windows and replace patio doors to match on the west (rear) elevation. • Remove four windows and replace them with new divided-light windows to match existing on the south (side) elevation. • Construction of a wood deck on the southwest corner, raised terrace on the west elevation, and new stone steps on the south side of the porch. Additional crushed stone, stone paver, and concrete walkways to be built. New circular low retaining wall in the front yard. • Relocate two existing condensing units from the back of the house to the underside of the deck on the north (side) elevation.
February 9, 2021	<p>HDC reviews the proposed scope of work and grants a COA for the proposed scope of work. See:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meeting Materials¹ • Minutes² • Video³
May 2, 2022	<p>Staff administratively approves a COA amendment for the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brick piers supporting the screened porch above (No basement addition to be built) • No new chimney and no change to the existing chimney • Stoop exiting the screened porch and at-grade step on the patio doors on the west (rear) elevation
August 15, 2022	<p>Staff administratively approves a COA amendment for the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • French doors on west (rear) elevation to be replaced by a door and three double-hung windows • Bank of four windows on the south (side) elevation to be replaced by three windows
October 4, 2022	<p>Staff administratively approves a COA amendment for the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace two double-hung windows with one window to the north side of the door on the west (rear) elevation
January 10, 2023	<p>HDC reviews the proposed scope of work and grants a COA for the proposed scope of work. See:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meeting Materials⁴ • Video⁵

¹ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4764847&GUID=DB3AF628-C27B-4FFA-A083-8F7A35CF8EFD&Options=&Search=>

² <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/View.ashx?M=M&ID=829622&GUID=69F4130A-910F-44C9-83D3-FF79EFDB0D03>

³ https://chapelhill.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view_id=7&clip_id=4630

⁴ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=5989627&GUID=4A30AD46-70F2-4E2B-B476-EEBCA1F2FD55>

⁵ https://chapelhill.granicus.com/player/clip/6179?view_id=7&redirect=true&h=f2c07ef171d9358bd973717953fe6f2

February 14, 2023	HDC reviews the proposed scope of work and requested additional information. See: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meeting Materials⁶ • Video⁷
March 23, 2023	HDC reviews the proposed scope of work and grants a COA for the proposed scope of work. See: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meeting Materials⁸ • Video⁹
December 5, 2023	Staff administratively approves a COA amendment for the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A new half-glass, 12-light divided glass door with lower wood panel on the east façade. • New 4-over-4 double-hung window with horizontal tongue-and-groove board paneling with five-inch exposure beneath the window on the east façade. • Row of 8-over-8 mahogany double-hung windows (4 total). Two panels of horizontal tongue and groove board with 5-inch exposure beneath the windows on the north (side) elevation.
April 12, 2024	The applicant submits a COA amendment for the modifications described above.

DISCUSSION

The Commission should discuss whether the work proposed by the Applicant is or is not incongruous with the special character of the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District. The Applicant has plans, renderings, and photos of the proposed doors, siding, and trim, their materials, and locations, which the Applicant asserts shows that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Franklin-Rosemary Historic District.

If the COA is granted for the exterior change, the applicant would then be required to obtain any necessary zoning compliance and building permits from the Town.

NOTE

The [Chapel Hill Historic Districts Design Principles and Standards](#)¹⁰ are incorporated into the record by reference.

⁶ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=6010188&GUID=9C301DF0-4A3A-407C-8158-AAEB135F0A99>

⁷ https://chapelhill.granicus.com/player/clip/6265?view_id=7&redirect=true&h=46ae6a0cb421d141652f25b47d369c5c

⁸ <https://chapelhill.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=6054071&GUID=F0484D82-F262-4D9D-8A60-53856C36148E&Options=&Search=>

⁹ https://chapelhill.granicus.com/player/clip/6361?view_id=7&redirect=true

¹⁰ https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf

ATTACHMENTS

1. [Special Character Essay – Franklin-Rosemary Historic District \(pages 25-29\)](#)¹¹
2. Application Materials

¹¹https://townhall.townofchapelhill.org/large_docs/historic_district/CH%20HD%20Design%20Principles%20and%20Standards.pdf