



Historic District Commission

**Regular Agenda – Certificate of Appropriateness
206 McCauley Street (Project #COA-22-10)**

Summary Report

TOWN OF CHAPEL HILL PLANNING DEPARTMENT
Anya Grahn, Principal Planner
Judy Johnson, Assistant Planning Director
Colleen Willger, Planning Director

Applicant Leslie Brock, Bell Family Properties, LLC	Filing Date 3/18/2022	Meeting Date 4/12/2022	Historic District Cameron-McCauley
---	---------------------------------	----------------------------------	--

Project Description

The applicant proposes to replace existing wood and vinyl windows with new fiberglass windows; existing EPDM and asphalt shingle roofing in-kind; wood door, and lighting fixtures.

Proposed Findings of Fact

1. The two-story L-shaped house with side and front-facing gables was constructed between 1915 and 1925. It is listed as contributing to the West Chapel Hill National Register Historic District.
2. The majority of the windows have been replaced with vinyl replacement windows. There is one wood window in existence on the east elevation. The applicant proposes to replace the existing windows with new white fiberglass windows matching the existing windows. Each window will be built in specific sizes to fit the existing window openings as stock sizes may not exactly match the historic openings. Existing wood window trim will be repaired as needed or replaced in-kind if necessary.
3. There is an existing EDM membrane flat roof on the rear elevation that is in deteriorated condition. The applicant proposes to replace this roof and the existing asphalt shingle roof above the porch in-kind.
4. The wood front door is two-thirds glass with a 12-divided light pattern. The applicant finds that the door is in poor condition and proposes to replace it in-kind with no change to the design.
5. The applicant proposes to replace the existing exterior lighting fixtures with new lantern-style sconces and an overhead ceiling-mounted light.
6. Per [Land Use Management Ordinance 3.6.2\(c\)\(1\)](#)¹, certain changes are not prohibited including “ordinary maintenance or repair of any exterior architectural feature in the historic district that does not involve a change in design, material, or outer appearance...” Approval of a certificate of appropriateness is not required for ordinary repair and maintenance.

Applicable Design Standards

1.6 Exterior Lighting (page 58)

1.6.5. Introduce new exterior lighting fixtures with care so that the overall historic character of the building, site, and district is not compromised or diminished. Select and site new lighting fixtures so their location, orientation, height, brightness, scale, and design are compatible with the historic district and its human scale. Fixtures should emit a white or warm spectrum light; fluorescent, neon, blinking, or colored lighting is not appropriate in the historic districts.

3.1 Roofs, Gutters, & Chimneys (pages 90-91)

3.1.3. Repair deteriorated or damaged roof features and surfaces through accepted preservation methods for the specific feature or material. Repairs may include selective in-kind replacement of missing or deteriorated portions of historic roof features or materials. Do not patch slate or metal roofs or flashing with tar or asphalt products.

3.1.5. If deterioration necessitates the replacement of an entire roof surface, replacement surfaces should match the original in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material (including composite shingle, synthetic slate, and wide-pan matte-

¹https://library.municode.com/nc/chapel_hill/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=CO_APXALOUSMA_AR_T3ZODIUSDIST_3.60VDI

finish metal roofing) only if the replacement material is compatible with the design, size, and scale of the building.

- a. Do not replace historic standing-seam, pressed metal, or asphalt-shingled roofs with multi-rib metal roofing.
- b. Do not install built-up or rubber roofing in locations that are visible from the street.

3.4 Windows & Shutters (pages 81-82)

3.4.5. If deterioration necessitates the replacement of an entire window, or if a window is completely missing, replacement windows should match the original feature, based upon physical and documentary evidence, in material, design, dimension, pattern, detail, texture, and color. Consider a compatible substitute material (including aluminum-clad wood or fiberglass) only if replacement in kind is not technically feasible.

3.4.7. Do not replace deteriorated windows with stock items that do not fill the original openings or to install smaller shutters that would not, if closed, cover the window opening.

3.4.8. Do not remove or conceal window openings on street-facing elevations.

3.4.10. Do not install windows with two-dimensional simulations of pane subdivisions, such as snap-in muntins. If not true divided light, glazing should have three-dimensional grills affixed to both the interior and exterior of the window with shadow bars between insulated glass panes.

3.4.11. Do not install vinyl and vinyl-clad windows in the historic district.

Conditions of Approval

1. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from date of issuance. If the authorized work has not commenced within that period, has not been extended by the commission, or has been discontinued for more than three hundred sixty-five (365) calendar days from the date of issuance, such certificate of appropriateness shall expire and the applicant shall be required to reapply and obtain a new certificate of appropriateness before commencing further work.

Decision

Based on the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Historic District Commission **approves/denies** the Certificate of Appropriateness as referenced above on the basis that it **would/would not be incongruous** with the special character of the district.

Project Location

